

**MINUTES OF THE
REDISTRICTING COMMITTEE
Monday, September 10, 2001 – 9:00 a.m. S Room 129 State Capitol**

Members Present:

Sen. Michael G. Waddoups, Senate Chair
Rep. Gerry A. Adair, House Chair
Sen. Ron Allen
Sen. Gene Davis
Sen. Beverly Evans
Sen. John L. Valentine
Rep. Patrice M. Arent
Rep. Chad E. Bennion
Rep. Ron Bigelow
Rep. Jackie Biskupski
Rep. Katherine M. Bryson
Rep. Don E. Bush
Rep. Brent H. Goodfellow
Rep. James R. Gowans
Rep. Wayne A. Harper

Rep. Thomas V. Hatch
Rep. Loraine T. Pace
Rep. Jack A. Seitz
Rep. LaWanna Shurtliff
Rep. Glenn L. Way

Staff Present:

Mr. Mark J Allred, Redistricting Team Manager
Mr. John L. Fellows, Associate General Counsel
Mr. John Q. Cannon, Research Analyst
Mr. Jerry D. Howe, Research Analyst
Mr. Richard C. North, Research Analyst
Mr. Joseph T. Wade, Research Analyst
Ms. Alicia Gambles, Legislative Secretary
Ms. Cassandra Bauman, Legislative Secretary

Note: A list of others present and a copy of materials can be found at <http://www.image.le.state.ut.us.imaging/history.asp> or contact the Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel.

1. Call to Order

Chair Adair called the meeting to order at 9:25 a.m.

2. Three-member Congressional Plans

MOTION: Sen. Waddoups moved to eliminate Congressional District Plan 8-09-01. The motion passed unanimously with Sen. Davis, Sen. Valentine, Rep. Harper, and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

MOTION: Sen. Waddoups moved to eliminate Congressman Hansen's Congressional District Plan. The motion passed unanimously with Sen. Davis, Sen. Valentine, Rep. Harper, and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

MOTION: Sen. Waddoups moved to eliminate the Congressional District Plan: Grassi C.1. The motion passed unanimously with Sen. Davis, Sen. Valentine, Rep. Harper, and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Rep. Pace expressed issues with Congressional District Plans: Grassi C2 and Grassi C3. She indicated transit difficulties throughout such large districts.

Rep. Arent stated that Grassi C2 should remain a consideration and indicated several positive aspects of the plan.

Rep. Way stated that Grassi C3 had initially divided municipalities, but after public input, only Salt Lake City remains divided.

MOTION: Rep. Bigelow moved to eliminate the Grassi C.2 plan. The motion failed with Sen. Evans, Rep. Adair, Rep. Bennion, Rep. Bigelow, Rep. Bryson, Rep. Gowans, Rep. Hatch, Rep. Pace, Rep. Seitz, and Rep. Way voting in favor, and Sen. Davis, Sen. Valentine, and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Rep. Way stated that C.5 is the same plan as C.1 except that C.5 maintains military installations as a whole and C.5 does not include Congressman Matheson and Congressman Hansen in the same district.

MOTION: Rep. Seitz moved to eliminate the C.1 plan. The motion passed unanimously with Sen. Valentine, Rep. Hatch, and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Mr. Richard C. North, Research Analyst, Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel, stated that Congressional Plan T.4 was eliminated at the sponsor's request.

Rep. Biskupski recommended the Democratic Congressional District Plan.

Rep. Harper explained Congressional District Plan C.2. He stated that Salt Lake County Mayors requested Salt Lake County to be one district. He stated that C.2 addresses that request.

Sen. Waddoups explained Congressional District Plan C.3, as proposed by Congressman James Matheson. He indicated that the plan divides Salt Lake City. Rep. Arent expressed that the map represents minimal disruption and stated that the map should remain a consideration.

Rep. Harper stated that a number of Salt Lake County cities, which are communities of interest, are also divided.

MOTION: Sen. Waddoups moved to eliminate the C.3 plan. The motion passed with Rep. Arent, Rep. Biskupski, and Rep. Goodfellow voting in opposition, and Sen. Valentine and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Rep. Harper explained that Congressional District Plan C.4 is intended to maintain military base fly-over ranges within the same district as well as to balance the population by creating a rural-urban mix district in Salt Lake County.

MOTION: Rep. Arent moved to eliminate the C.4 plan. The motion passed with Rep. Bennion, Rep. Bryson, Rep. Harper, and Rep. Way voting in opposition, and Sen. Valentine and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Sen. Waddoups recommended Congressional District Plan C.7. He stated that the plan had potential, though Weber and Salt Lake Counties are both divided.

Sen. Allen stated that C.7 would provide maximum transit for representatives. He explained that voting districts were not within close proximity.

MOTION: Sen. Evans moved to eliminate the C.7 plan. The motion passed with Sen. Waddoups, Rep. Bennion, Rep. Bigelow, Rep. Bryson, Rep. Harper, Rep. Hatch, Rep. Pace, and Rep. Way voting in opposition, and Sen. Valentine and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Rep. Bennion explained that Congressional District Plan S.6 does not divide any cities, but does divide unincorporated counties as well as Wasatch County.

MOTION: Rep. Biskupski moved to eliminate the S.6 plan. The motion failed with Sen. Allen, Sen. Davis, Sen. Evans, Rep. Arent, Rep. Biskupski, Rep. Goodfellow, Rep. Gowans, and Rep. Pace voting in favor, and Sen. Valentine and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Sen. Waddoups stated that Congressional District Plan CC.11 divides West Valley City.

MOTION: Rep. Bigelow moved to eliminate the CC.11 plan. The motion passed with Rep. Bennion, Rep. Bryson, Rep. Bush, Rep. Harper, and Rep. Way voting in opposition and with Sen. Valentine and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Sen. Waddoups stated that SW.11 does not divide any cities, but has a large deviation in population.

Rep. Hatch stated that a majority of rural Utah is combined with Salt Lake County in SW.11. He explained that common interest would be minimal in such a case.

MOTION: Rep. Hatch moved to eliminate Plan SW.11. The motion passed with Sen. Waddoups, Rep. Bennion, Rep. Bigelow, Rep. Harper, and Rep. Way voting in opposition, and Sen. Valentine and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Rep. Way stated that Congressional District Plan WW.11 is the same as Congressional District Plan C.5.

MOTION: Rep. Way moved to eliminate Plan WW.11. The motion passed unanimously with Sen. Valentine and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Sen. Waddoups explained the amendments to former Congressman Howard Nielsen's Congressional District Plan. He stated that the amendment kept Salt Lake City whole. Sen. Davis stated that the plan was well-balanced and well-thought out. Rep. Arent stated that Congressman Nielsen's plan should remain in consideration.

MOTION: Rep. Bennion moved to eliminate former Congressman Nielsen's Plan. The motion failed with Rep. Bennion, Rep. Bigelow, and Rep. Way voting in favor, and Sen. Valentine and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Rep. Bigelow indicated that BB.22 divides West Valley City.

MOTION: Sen. Allen moved to eliminate the BB.22 plan. The motion passed with Sen. Waddoups, Rep. Bennion, Rep. Bryson, Rep. Harper, and Rep. Way voting in opposition, and Sen. Valentine and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

Sen. Waddoups indicated that Congressional District 1 is pushed further to the North-Eastern part of the state in Congressional District Plan SW.22.

Rep. Arent stated that the plan also divides the Holladay-Murray area from Salt Lake City.

MOTION: Rep. Bush moved to eliminate the SW.22 plan. The motion passed with Rep. Bennion, Rep. Bigelow, Rep. Hatch, and Rep. Way voting in opposition, and Sen. Valentine and Rep. Shurtliff absent for the vote.

3. Four-member Congressional Plans

Sen. Waddoups stated that Congressional District Plans L.1 and T.1 were withdrawn by the sponsors. He explained Congressional District Plan Q.1 and recommended continued consideration. He also explained that Congressional District Plan TT.44 divides Salt Lake and David Counties. He recommended further consideration of the TT.44 plan.

Sen. Waddoups stated that Congressional District Plan CC.44 is a three-member congressional district plan.

MOTION: Sen. Waddoups moved to consider the CC.44 plan as a three-member congressional district plan. The motion passed unanimously with Sen. Valentine absent for the vote.

Sen. Waddoups indicated that Congressional District Plan TH.11 divides Weber, Davis, Salt Lake, and Utah Counties.

Rep. Arent stated that the plan provides the possibility for all four congressmen to be from Salt Lake County and questioned whether that should be considered.

MOTION: Rep. Arent moved to eliminate the TH.11 plan. The motion failed with Sen. Allen, Sen. Davis, Rep. Arent, Rep. Biskupski, Rep. Goodfellow, Rep. Gowans, Rep. Seitz, and Rep. Shurtliff voting in favor, and Sen. Valentine absent for the vote.

Sen. Waddoups explained that Congressional District Plan Utah 4-2 divides Davis and Salt Lake Counties into three districts each.

MOTION: Rep. Bush moved to eliminate the Utah 4-2 plan. The motion failed with Sen. Allen, Sen. Davis, Rep. Arent, Rep. Biskupski, Rep. Bush, Rep. Goodfellow, Rep. Gowans, Rep. Pace, and Rep. Shurtliff voting in favor, and Sen. Valentine absent for the vote.

The committee revisited Congressional District Plan CC.44 as a three-member district plan.

MOTION: Rep. Way moved to eliminate the CC.44 plan. The motion passed unanimously with Sen. Valentine absent for the vote.

Rep. Arent explained that an advantage of the Democrat plan is that it creates a true rural seat for Utah representation.

MOTION: Rep. Pace moved to eliminate the Democrat four-member Congressional District Plan. The motion passed with Sen. Davis, Rep. Arent, Rep. Bigelow, Rep. Biskupski, Rep. Goodfellow, and Rep. Shurtliff voting in opposition, and Sen. Valentine absent for the vote.

The committee further narrowed three-member Congressional district plans.

MOTION: Rep. Pace moved to eliminate the Grassi C2 plan. The motion passed with Sen. Allen, Sen. Davis, Rep. Arent, Rep. Biskupski, Rep. Goodfellow, Rep. Gowans, and Rep. Shurtliff voting in opposition, and Sen. Valentine absent for the vote.

Sen. Davis stated that Congressional District Plan: Grassi C3 was created by a group of citizens who took no partisan status while drawing the redistricting lines. He suggested that Grassi C3 be presented to caucus on Wednesday, September 12, 2001.

MOTION: Rep. Harper moved to eliminate the Grassi C3 plan. The motion failed with Rep. Bennion, Rep. Bryson, Rep. Bush, Rep. Harper, Rep. Hatch, Rep. Pace, Rep. Seitz, and Rep. Way voting in favor, and Sen. Valentine absent for the vote.

Rep. Harper stated that Congressman Nielsen's plan is fairly nonpartisan and well-balanced.

Rep. Goodfellow stated that the statistical overviews considered in drawing the map were very thorough. He suggested continued discussion of the plan.

MOTION: Rep. Bennion moved to eliminate Congressman Nielsen's plan. The motion failed with Rep. Bennion, Rep. Bigelow, Rep. Harper, Rep. Hatch, and Rep. Way voting in favor, and Sen. Valentine absent for the vote.

The Committee recessed for lunch.

4. School Board Plans

The committee discussed School Board Plan A.1 as a base plan.

MOTION: Rep. Pace moved to reaffirm the committee's decision to accept School Board Plan A.1 as the official plan and eliminate the other four plans. The motion passed unanimously with Sen. Allen, Sen. Davis, Rep. Harper, and Rep. Hatch absent for the vote.

Minutes of the Redistricting Committee
September 10, 2001
Page 6

MOTION: Rep. Seitz moved to meet Thursday, September 13, 2001 at 7:00 a.m. The motion passed unanimously with Sen. Allen and Sen. Davis absent for the vote.

5. Senate Plans

Sen. Allen indicated that the rapid population growth in Tooele County proved problematic when attempting to balance the southern rural areas with urban areas in Salt Lake County. He stated that Senate Plan 9-06-01 was amended to address that concern.

MOTION: Sen. Valentine moved to adopt Senate Plan 9-6-01, as amended, as a base plan with further amendments as needed. The motion passed with Rep. Arent, Rep. Bennion, Rep. Biskupski, Rep. Gowans, Rep. Harper, Rep. Pace, and Rep. Shurtliff voting in opposition.

6. Adjourn

MOTION: Sen. Waddoups moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion passed unanimously. Chair Adair adjourned the meeting at 2:55 p.m.