Enrolled Copy	H.B. 1	135

· -	MEDICAL MALPRACTICE AMENDMENTS
	2013 GENERAL SESSION
	STATE OF UTAH
	Chief Sponsor: Dean Sanpei
	Senate Sponsor: John L. Valentine
Cosponsors:	Michael S. Kennedy
Stewart Barlow	Mike K. McKell
LONG TITLE	
General Description	<b>:</b>
This bill amer	nds medical malpractice action or arbitration proceedings.
Highlighted Provision	ons:
This bill:	
<ul><li>provides the</li></ul>	nat a certificate of compliance must be issued for a health care provider or
health care entity to a	llocate fault in a prelitigation medical malpractice or
arbitration hearing; ar	nd
<ul><li>requires th</li></ul>	at evidence from a medical review panel remain unreportable to a health
care facility or health	insurance plan.
Money Appropriate	d in this Bill:
None	
Other Special Claus	es:
None	
<b>Utah Code Sections</b>	Affected:
AMENDS:	
<b>78B-3-418</b> , as	last amended by Laws of Utah 2010, Chapter 97
<b>78B-3-419</b> , as	renumbered and amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 3

28

Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:

H.B. 135 Enrolled Copy

78B-3-418. Decision and recommendations of panel No judicial or other review.  (1) (a) The panel shall issue an opinion and the division shall issue a certificate of compliance with the pre-litigation hearing requirements of this part in accordance with this section.  (b) A certificate of compliance issued in accordance with this section is proof that the claimant has complied with all conditions precedent under this part prior to the commencement of litigation as required in Subsection 78B-3-412(1).  (c) (i) Notwithstanding any other provision of this part, any party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may request a prelitigation panel review as to a health care provider and obtain a certificate of compliance for that specific, individual health care provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and  (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel'	29	Section 1. Section <b>78B-3-418</b> is amended to read:
compliance with the pre-litigation hearing requirements of this part in accordance with this section.  (b) A certificate of compliance issued in accordance with this section is proof that the claimant has complied with all conditions precedent under this part prior to the commencement of litigation as required in Subsection 78B-3-412(1).  (c) (i) Notwithstanding any other provision of this part, any party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may request a prelitigation panel review as to a health care provider and obtain a certificate of compliance for that specific, individual health care provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	30	78B-3-418. Decision and recommendations of panel No judicial or other review.
33 section.  (b) A certificate of compliance issued in accordance with this section is proof that the 35 claimant has complied with all conditions precedent under this part prior to the commencement 36 of litigation as required in Subsection 78B-3-412(1).  (c) (i) Notwithstanding any other provision of this part, any party in a medical 38 malpractice action or arbitration hearing may request a prelitigation panel review as to a health 39 care provider and obtain a certificate of compliance for that specific, individual health care 40 provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical 41 malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care 42 provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for 43 that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the 44 requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless 45 be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a 46 prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care 48 provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection 49 (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end 51 of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and  (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the 52 claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	31	(1) (a) The panel shall issue an opinion and the division shall issue a certificate of
(b) A certificate of compliance issued in accordance with this section is proof that the claimant has complied with all conditions precedent under this part prior to the commencement of litigation as required in Subsection 78B-3-412(1).  (c) (i) Notwithstanding any other provision of this part, any party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may request a prelitigation panel review as to a health care provider and obtain a certificate of compliance for that specific, individual health care provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and  (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.	32	compliance with the pre-litigation hearing requirements of this part in accordance with this
claimant has complied with all conditions precedent under this part prior to the commencement of litigation as required in Subsection 78B-3-412(1).  (c) (i) Notwithstanding any other provision of this part, any party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may request a prelitigation panel review as to a health care provider and obtain a certificate of compliance for that specific, individual health care provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and  (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	33	section.
of litigation as required in Subsection 78B-3-412(1).  (c) (i) Notwithstanding any other provision of this part, any party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may request a prelitigation panel review as to a health care provider and obtain a certificate of compliance for that specific, individual health care provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	34	(b) A certificate of compliance issued in accordance with this section is proof that the
37 (c) (i) Notwithstanding any other provision of this part, any party in a medical 38 malpractice action or arbitration hearing may request a prelitigation panel review as to a health 39 care provider and obtain a certificate of compliance for that specific, individual health care 40 provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical 41 malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care 42 provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for 43 that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the 44 requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless 45 be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a 46 prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement. 47 (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care 48 provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection 49 (1)(c). 40 (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end 51 of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether: 52 (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and 53 (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the 54 claimant. 55 (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	35	claimant has complied with all conditions precedent under this part prior to the commencement
malpractice action or arbitration hearing may request a prelitigation panel review as to a health care provider and obtain a certificate of compliance for that specific, individual health care provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and  (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	36	of litigation as required in Subsection 78B-3-412(1).
care provider and obtain a certificate of compliance for that specific, individual health care provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	37	(c) (i) Notwithstanding any other provision of this part, any party in a medical
provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	38	malpractice action or arbitration hearing may request a prelitigation panel review as to a health
malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	39	care provider and obtain a certificate of compliance for that specific, individual health care
provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and  (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	40	provider for the purpose of allocating fault to that health care provider. A party in a medical
that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	41	malpractice action or arbitration hearing may not attempt to allocate fault to any health care
requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether: (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	42	provider unless a certificate of compliance has been issued in accordance with this section for
be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a  prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care  provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection  (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end  of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and  (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the  claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	43	that specific, individual health care provider. A health care provider exempted from the
prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.  (ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	44	requirement of a prelitigation hearing by statute or an arbitration agreement, may nevertheless
(ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection (1)(c). (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether: (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant. (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	45	be joined in a prelitigation hearing to satisfy the requirements of this section. Participation in a
provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection  (1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	46	prelitigation hearing may not waive any right to enforce an arbitration agreement.
(1)(c).  (2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and  (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	47	(ii) The party making the claim against, or seeking to allocate fault to, a health care
<ul> <li>(2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end</li> <li>of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:</li> <li>(i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and</li> <li>(ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the</li> <li>claimant.</li> <li>(b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or</li> </ul>	48	provider is required to seek and obtain the certificate of compliance required by this Subsection
of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:  (i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and  (ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the claimant.  (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	49	(1)(c).
<ul> <li>(i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and</li> <li>(ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the</li> <li>claimant.</li> <li>(b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or</li> </ul>	50	(2) (a) The panel shall render its opinion in writing not later than 30 days after the end
<ul> <li>(ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the</li> <li>claimant.</li> <li>(b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or</li> </ul>	51	of the proceedings, and determine on the basis of the evidence whether:
<ul> <li>claimant.</li> <li>(b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or</li> </ul>	52	(i) each claim against each health care provider has merit or has no merit; and
55 (b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or	53	(ii) if a claim is meritorious, whether the conduct complained of resulted in harm to the
	54	claimant.
56 recommendations.	55	(b) There is no judicial or other review or appeal of the panel's decision or
	56	recommendations.

Enrolled Copy H.B. 135

57 (3) The division shall issue a certificate of compliance to the claimant, for each 58 respondent named in the intent to file a claim under this part, if: 59 (a) for a named respondent, the panel issues an opinion of merit under Subsections 60 (2)(a)(i) and (ii); (b) for a named respondent, the claimant files an affidavit of merit in accordance with 61 62 Section 78B-3-423 if the opinion under Subsection (1)(a) is non-meritorious under either 63 Subsection (2)(a)(i) or (ii); 64 (c) the claimant has complied with the provisions of Subsections 78B-3-416(3)(c) and 65 (d); or 66 (d) the parties submitted a stipulation under Subsection 78B-3-416(3)[(d)](e). 67 Section 2. Section **78B-3-419** is amended to read: 78B-3-419. Evidence of proceedings not admissible in subsequent action --68 69 Panelist may not be compelled to testify -- Immunity of panelist from civil liability --70 Information regarding professional conduct. 71 (1) Evidence of the proceedings conducted by the medical review panel and its results. opinions, findings, and determinations are not admissible as evidence in [an action] any civil 72 73 action or arbitration proceeding subsequently brought by the claimant [in a court of competent 74 jurisdiction against any respondent and are not reportable to any health care facility or health care insurance carrier as a part of any credentialing process. 75 76 (2) No panelist may be compelled to testify in a civil action subsequently filed with regard to the subject matter of the panel's review. A panelist has immunity from civil liability 77 arising from participation as a panelist and for all communications, findings, opinions, and 78 79 conclusions made in the course and scope of duties prescribed by this section. 80 (3) Nothing in this chapter may be interpreted to prohibit the division from considering 81 any information contained in a statutory notice of intent to commence action, request for 82 prelitigation panel review, or written findings of a panel with respect to the division's 83 determining whether a licensee engaged in unprofessional or unlawful conduct.