

**MINUTES OF THE  
REDISTRICTING COMMITTEE**

Monday, May 4, 2011 – 9:00 a.m. – Room 30 House Building

**Members Present:**

Sen. Ralph Okerlund, Senate Chair  
Rep. Kenneth W. Sumsion, House Chair  
Sen. Gene Davis  
Sen. Benjamin M. McAdams  
Sen. Stuart C. Reid  
Sen. Kevin T. Van Tassell  
President Michael G. Waddoups  
Rep. Melvin R. Brown  
Rep. Gage Froerer  
Rep. Francis D. Gibson  
Rep. Don L. Ipson  
Rep. Brian S. King  
Rep. Todd E. Kiser  
Speaker Rebecca D. Lockhart  
Rep. Merlynn T. Newbold

Rep. Christine F. Watkins  
Rep. R. Curt Webb

**Members Absent:**

Rep. Roger E. Barrus

**Staff Present:**

Mr. John Q. Cannon, Managing Policy Analyst  
Mr. John L. Fellows, General Counsel  
Mr. Mark D. Andrews, Policy Analyst  
Mr. Leif G. Elder, Policy Analyst  
Mr. Jerry D. Howe, Policy Analyst  
Mr. Richard C. North, Policy Analyst  
Mr. Joseph T. Wade, Policy Analyst  
Mr. Eric N. Weeks, Deputy General Counsel  
Ms. Emily R. Brown, Associate General Counsel  
Ms. Kimberly A. Heiner, Legislative Secretary

**Note:** A list of others present, a copy of related materials, and an audio recording of the meeting can be found at [www.le.utah.gov](http://www.le.utah.gov).

**1. Committee Business**

Chair Okerlund called the meeting to order at 9:18 a.m.

The minutes from the April 25, 2011 meeting will be approved at the next Redistricting Committee meeting.

**2. Redistricting Principles**

Mr. Cannon gave an overview of the "2001 Redistricting Principles" handout that was included in the mailing packet.

The Committee discussed the 2001 redistricting principle number one regarding population deviations of congressional districts.

**MOTION:** Chair Sumsion moved to adopt the 2001 redistricting principle number one, changing the deviation so that it would read: "Congressional districts must be as nearly equal as practicable with a deviation not greater than  $\pm .1\%$ ." The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Fellows suggested to the Committee that the motion include that this is a guiding principle.

**MOTION:** Chair Sumsion moved that the prior motion be included as a 2011 guiding redistricting principle. The motion passed unanimously.

The Committee discussed the 2001 redistricting principle number two regarding population deviations of legislative and state school board districts.

**MOTION:** Rep. Brown moved to adopt redistricting principle two to be: "State legislative districts and school board districts must have substantial equality of population numbers among the various districts with a deviation not greater than  $\pm 4\%$ ."

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION:** Chair Sumsion made a substitute motion to adopt the same language for principle two but change the deviation to  $\pm 3.5\%$ . The motion passed with Sen. Davis, Sen. McAdams, and Rep. King voting in opposition to the motion.

The Committee discussed redistricting principle number three regarding single member districts.

Mr. Rob Latham, Fair Vote Utah, distributed information on multi-seat districts to the Committee and asked the Committee to consider using multi-member districts.

Speaker Lockhart announced that Rep. Biskupski resigned from the Redistricting Committee. Speaker Lockhart distributed to committee members an e-mail of Rep. Biskupski's resignation.

Mr. Latham responded to questions from the Committee.

Ms. Kari Williams, speaking on behalf of Ms. Elise Lazar, spoke in favor of multi-member voting districts. She said it is more equitable and will engage more citizens in the democratic process.

Ms. Becky Pirente, GOP, Legislative Chair, House District 56, spoke against creating multi-member voting districts. She said that better representation is achieved by having a smaller area and one specific representative.

Ms. Linda Nelson, citizen, spoke against creating multi-member voting districts and said that the current process is fair and should remain single member districts.

**MOTION:** Rep. King moved to adopt redistricting principle three to be: "Congressional districts will be single member districts. Non-congressional districts may be either single member or multi-seat districts."

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION:** Sen. Reid made a substitute motion to adopt the third 2001 redistricting principle to be: "Districts will be single member districts." The motion passed with Sen. Davis, Sen. McAdams, Rep. King, and Rep. Watkins voting in opposition to the motion.

The Committee discussed the 2001 redistricting principle number four regarding the number of districts to be drawn.

Mr. Glenn Wright, citizen, asked the Committee to consider expanding the number of house district members.

Mr. Ken Froehle, Represent Me Utah, asked the Committee to find a way to make elections more competitive. He also asked that the Committee provide the public with a minimum of two weeks to provide input on a final proposal before a special session is called.

**MOTION:** Rep. Ipson moved to adopt redistricting principle number four to be: "Plans will be drawn to create four Congressional Districts, 29 State Senate Districts, 75 State House Districts, and 15 State School Board Districts." The motion passed unanimously.

The Committee discussed the 2001 redistricting principle number five regarding census data.

**MOTION:** Sen. Van Tassell moved to adopt redistricting principle five to be: "In drawing districts, the official population enumeration of the 2010 decennial census will be used." The motion passed unanimously.

The Committee discussed the 2001 redistricting principle number six regarding contiguity and compactness.

Ms. Susan Connor, Represent Me Utah, discussed her concerns about redistricting and a rural/urban mix in drawing districts.

Ms. Tania Knauer, Fair Boundaries, asked to expand principle six to include keeping municipalities and communities together so people of common interests could vote together.

Ms. Becky Pirente, GOP, Legislative Chair, House District 56, asked for the representation in districts to include both rural and urban areas.

Ms. Kari Williams, citizen, said that congressional districts should be divided by geographic boundaries to allow people of common interests to vote together.

**MOTION:** Sen. Davis moved to adopt redistricting principle six to be: "Districts will be contiguous, reasonably compact, and keep communities of interests together as much as possible."

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION:** Rep King moved to adopt redistricting principle six to be: "Districts will be contiguous and reasonably compact to the degree reasonably achievable, strive to maintain communities of common interest including keeping municipalities and townships intact and respecting existing city and county boundaries." The substitute motion failed with Sen. Davis, Sen. McAdams, Rep. King, and Rep. Watkins voting in favor of the motion and Speaker Lockhart absent for the vote.

The Committee voted on Sen. Davis' motion. The motion failed with Sen. Davis, Sen. Van Tassell, Sen. McAdams, Rep. King, and Rep. Watkins voting in favor of the motion with Speaker Lockhart absent for the vote.

**MOTION:** Rep. Sumsion moved to adopt redistricting principle six to be: "Districts will be contiguous and reasonably compact." The motion passed unanimously.

**MOTION:** Sen. McAdams moved to adopt an additional redistricting principle to be: "Redistricting plans, to the degree reasonably achievable, strive to promote meaningful competition between political parties rather than single political party districts which effectively silence the voice of the minority voter, regardless of party preference."

Mr. Glenn Wright, Fair Boundaries and Utah Citizens Counsel, noted support for Sen. McAdams motion to create competitive districts. He would also like to keep cities and counties together as much as possible and suggested that all of Salt Lake City should be included in one congressional district.

Ms. Marilyn A. O'Dell, League of Women Voters of Utah, referred to a 1980 study that the League of Women Voters conducted to provide recommendations on redistricting principles. She said one of the recommendations was to not dilute the voting strength of minorities.

Mr. Ken Froehle, Represent Me Utah, stated that he supported Sen. McAdams proposal and stated that gerrymandering by definition is drawing political lines for the benefit of a political party.

Ms. Kim Coleman, citizen, said that everybody is represented in the government, and that we are a country where the government is ruled by the majority that respects the rights of the minority.

The Committee voted on Sen. McAdams motion. The motion failed with Sen. Davis, Sen. McAdams, and Rep. King voting in favor of the motion and Speaker Lockhart absent for the vote.

### **3. Future meeting schedule**

Chair Okerlund distributed "Cities for Redistricting Committee to Potentially Visit."

The Committee discussed future meeting locations.

Chair Sumsion recommended that the next meeting be held in Lehi to discuss congressional boundaries.

Chair Okerlund distributed the maps "2001 Four-Member Congressional Plan with 2010 Population Variance from Ideal" and "2006 Four-Member Congressional Plan with 2010 Population Variance from Ideal." He also emphasized that the Committee has not started congressional maps for this year.

Mr. Cannon explained the Office of Legislative Research is still in contract negotiation with the vendors for the on-line tool for the public to create redistricting plans. He said the tool would be available to the public as soon as possible. He also emphasized that all of the handouts and resources distributed at the redistricting meetings are available on the Utah State Legislature's website.

**MOTION:** Sen. Reid moved that the Committee authorize the chair to work with staff to put together a redistricting schedule. The motion passed unanimously with Speaker Lockhart absent for the vote.

### **4. Adjourn**

Chair Okerlund adjourned the meeting at 12:14 p.m.