# MINUTES OF THE REDISTRICTING COMMITTEE

Wednesday, July 13, 2011 – 12:00 p.m. – Utah State University, Logan, Utah

**Members Present:** 

Sen. Ralph Okerlund, Senate Chair

Rep. Kenneth W. Sumsion, House Chair

Sen. Gene Davis

Sen. Benjamin M. McAdams

Sen. Stuart C. Reid

Sen. Kevin T. Van Tassell

President Michael G. Waddoups

Rep. Melvin R. Brown

Rep. Gage Froerer

Rep. Francis D. Gibson

Rep. Neal B. Hendrickson

Rep. Don L. Ipson

Rep. Brian S. King

Rep. Todd E. Kiser

Speaker Rebecca D. Lockhart

Rep. Merlynn T. Newbold

Rep. Christine F. Watkins

Rep. R. Curt Webb

**Members Absent:** 

Rep. Roger E. Barrus

**Staff Present:** 

Mr. John Q. Cannon, Policy Analyst

Mr. Leif Elder, Policy Analyst

Mr. Richard C. North, Policy Analyst

Ms. Emily R. Brown, Associate General Counsel

Ms. Kimberly A. Heiner, Legislative Secretary

Note: A list of others present, a copy of related materials, and an audio recording of the meeting can be found at www.le.utah.gov.

#### 1. Committee Business

Chair Okerlund called the meeting to order at 12:04 p.m.

Mr. Raymond Coward, Utah State University Provost, welcomed the Committee to Utah State University.

Members of the Committee introduced themselves and indicated the areas of the state that they represent.

**MOTION:** Rep. Gibson moved to approve the minutes of the Redistricting Committee meetings held on July 9, 2011 at Moab and Price. The motion passed unaimously.

#### 2. Overview of Redistricting

Mr. Elder gave a presentation on what redistricting is, why it is done, and the redistricting principles that were adopted at the May 4, 2011 meeting. He then gave an overview of the redistricting public website, RedistrictUtah.com and demonstrated the online redistricting tool that allows the public to create redistricting plans.

#### 3. Presentation of Redistricting Plans

Chair Okerlund gave an overview of a randomly selected senate plan entitled "Senate Redistricting" submitted on RedistrictUtah.com by Beau Sorensen.

Chair Okerlund said that many changes to the maps have been made based on public input. He gave an example from the Provo meeting where someone from the public pointed out that Utah County had enough population for five senate seats in Utah County. He said the comment was taken into consideration and five senate seats were included in "Utah Senate - Okerlund Plan B" map.

Rep. Sumsion presented "Complete House Plan - Version 2" and explained the plan's rationale. Rep Froerer discussed the northern Utah portion of this plan. They responded to questions from the public.

Minutes of the Redistricting Committee July 13, 2011, Logan Meeting Page 2

Rep. Newbold discussed the Salt Lake County portion of this plan. She emphasized that this map is preliminary at this time and welcomed comments from the public.

Mr. Robert Horning, Logan resident, presented his congressional plan entitled "St. George 4<sup>th</sup> District." He said he created his map by starting in St. George.

Sen. Reid explained the difference between a "pizza slice" and a "doughnut hole" approach to drawing congressional plans. He asked members of the public to raise their hands if they preferred a pizza slice over the doughnut hole approach, and a slight majority of the audience preferred the pizza slice.

Rep. Froerer discussed a randomly selected house plan entitled "Utah Rep Redistrict" submitted on RedistrictUtah.com by Steve Swann.

Rep. Sumsion discussed a randomly selected school board plan entitled "Thomas 2" submitted on RedistrictUtah.com by David Thomas.

## 4. Public Comment and Committee Discussion About Redistricting

Rep. Lee Perry, House District 2, said he recognizes that with redistricting the Committee needs to do what is best for the people. He supports Rep. Webb's plan.

Rep. Rhonda Menlove, House District 1, said she appreciates being able to give input into the redistricting maps that are being created. She also said that she is open to feedback from consitutents on the boundaries.

Ms. LuAnn Adams, Box Elder County Commissioner, thanked the Committee for the time spent on redistricting. She said that Box Elder County is a rural county and appreciates the maps she has seen keeping the districts in the county rural.

Sen. Peter Knudson, Senate District 17, said that while he is not advocating for Tooele County to be split, that county has been served well by having four senators.

Mr. Brian Shaffer, Box Elder County Commissioner, said that Box Elder County is a rural county with roots in agriculture and livestock. He also said he likes Mr. Robert Hornings "St. George 4rth District" congressional map.

Ms. Tami Pyfer, State School Board District 1, said she does not see a problem with having multiple legislators representing Box Elder County. She also said that the State School Board adopted a redistricting principle of minimizing overlap of school districts where possible. She responded to questions from the Committee on school board districts.

Mr. Dennis Fife, Brigham City Mayor, said that he supports the plan presented by Rep. Webb. He also said he likes the congressional plans presented at this meeting.

Mr. Mike Dunn, Brigham City resident, spoke in favor of the pizza slice approach to congressional plans. He said that the doughnut hole approach has the tendency to isolate representatives making them less unified on Utah's interests on the national level.

Ms. Lindsie Hill, citizen, said she liked the congressional map presented by Mr. Robert Horning because it allows both rural and urban areas of Utah to be represented and it only splits Salt Lake County into two

Minutes of the Redistricting Committee July 13, 2011, Logan Meeting Page 3

districts. She said that splitting Salt Lake County into more districts than two gives the appearance of gerrymandering. She then responded to questions from the Committee.

Mr. Ron Wolff, Box Elder School District Superintendent, said he likes the plan presented by Mr. Robert Horning. He said he saw a map that splits Morgan County and said that this would not be a good idea.

Mr. Robert Horning, Logan resident, discussed his "School Board Plan 57" plan he submitted on RedistrictUtah.com.

Ms. Kathy Reck, Hyde Park resident, recommended that the Committee make the redistricting process as simple as possible to allow citizens to engage in the process.

Mr. Scott Bushman, Hyrum City resident, said he supports Rep. Webb's maps. He said that the Logan and River Heights areas have similar values and asked to push River Heights and Providence into District 4.

Ms. Bobbi Herzberg, North Logan resident, asked if it were possible to keep the RedistrictUtah.com website up long after redistricting is over to be used as an educational tool for schools. She suggested that grants could be found to cover the costs. Rep. Sumsion said the State is working towards having a software system used among counties and cities to keep boundaries consistent.

Mr. Terry Camp, Cache County Republican Party Chair, spoke in favor of the pizza slice approach to congressional redistricting to give both urban and rural representation to all districts.

### 5. Adjourn

**MOTION**: Rep. Ipson moved to adjourn. The motion passed unanimously.

Chair Okerlund adjourned the meeting at 2:10 p.m.