A Performance Audit of CTE Completion and Job Placement Rates

Presentation to the Higher Education Appropriations Subcommittee

January 27, 2016
Chapter II

Broad Completion Definitions
Make Composite Statistics
Not Comparable
### Student Outcomes Considered as Completion Are Different

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Outcomes</th>
<th>UCAT</th>
<th>USHE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program Graduates</td>
<td>4,697</td>
<td>4,879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program Early Hires</td>
<td>770</td>
<td>Not Applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passed a Course*</td>
<td>20,518</td>
<td>Not Applicable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Includes occupational upgrade, other post-secondary, and secondary students.*

**FOR MORE INFORMATION**

See Figure 2.1, Pages 8-9
Each System’s Programs Differ Greatly in Length

FOR MORE INFORMATION

See Figure 2.2, Pages 9-10
UCAT Has Diluted Its Completion Statistics with Small Achievements

- Recognizing 60-hour occupational upgrades as certificates
- Including students who pass a course in completion rates
- Awarding more certificates in new short programs that require less than a quarter year to complete

FOR MORE INFORMATION

See Chapter II, Pages 12-22
Occupational Upgrades Inflate UCAT’s Certificate Counts

See Figure 2.3, Pages 13-16

Office of the Legislative Auditor General
Other Objectives Overshadow Program Completions

Using headcounts allows other objectives to overshadow the completion rate for certificate seekers who complete programs.

FOR MORE INFORMATION
See Figures 2.5, Pages 17-19
Completion Rates Are Only Meaningful for Program Certificate Seekers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Completion Basis</th>
<th>Programs</th>
<th>Courses</th>
<th>Mixed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Certificate Seekers</td>
<td>Occupational Upgrades</td>
<td>Composite</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completers</td>
<td>5,467</td>
<td>20,518</td>
<td>25,985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Completers</td>
<td>2,093</td>
<td>1,595</td>
<td>3,688</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completion Rate</td>
<td><strong>72.31%</strong></td>
<td><strong>92.79%</strong></td>
<td><strong>87.57%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For more information, see Figure 2.6, Pages 17-19.
UCAT Has Relied on New Short Programs for Certificate Growth

FOR MORE INFORMATION
See Figure 2.8, Pages 19-21
USHE Does Not Report CTE Completions as a Rate

**USHE’s Issue:**
CTE courses required for bachelor’s degrees and those classified as general education distort counts of how many students intend to complete CTE programs.

See Figure 2.10, pages 23-28

Office of the Legislative Auditor General
Some USHE Programs Can Generate Completion Rates

Programs That Require Acceptance:

Example: Weber State University’s Associate’s Degree in Nursing
Completion Rate: 98.8% (339 of 343 potential graduates completed)

Short Programs Where Students Must Declare:

Example: Dixie State University’s Certified Nursing Assistant Program
Completion Rate: 86.0% (197 of 229 students earned their certificate)

FOR MORE INFORMATION

See Chapter II, pages 25-26
Unique Program Mixes Necessitate Focus on Program-Level Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Certificates</th>
<th></th>
<th>Associates</th>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>Percent</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>Percent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salt Lake Community College (SLCC)</td>
<td>645</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>1,408</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>2,053</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utah Valley University (UVU)</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>786</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td>868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weber State University (WSU)</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>806</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>853</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dixie State University (DSU)</td>
<td>344</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utah State University (USU)*</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Snow College (SNOW)</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Utah University (SUU)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,357</strong></td>
<td><strong>28%</strong></td>
<td><strong>3,522</strong></td>
<td><strong>72%</strong></td>
<td><strong>4,879</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FOR MORE INFORMATION

See Figure 2.11, pages 26-28
Chapter III

Provider Methods Make Job Placement Rates Not Comparable
Providers’ Placement Calculations Have Significant Differences

Placement Rates Reported for the 2013-2014 School Year:
UCAT – 90 Percent
USHE – 77 Percent

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Difference</th>
<th>UCAT</th>
<th>USHE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Excludes Students from Completion Counts</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Includes Non-CTE Completions</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counts Continuing Education</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limits to Training-Related Employment</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Collection Method</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>Data Match</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FOR MORE INFORMATION
See Chapter III, Pages 32-34
UCAT’s Data Lacks Independence and Rigorous Validation Methods

Current Methods:

• COE Affirmation Reviews: The placements for five graduate completers and five non-graduate completers are verified once every six years.

• Employer Advisory Councils: Twice per year, employers have an opportunity to informally review student job placements.

FOR MORE INFORMATION
See Chapter III, Pages 39-40
Several USHE Institutions Track Some Training-Related Outcomes

Four institutions conduct student surveys to gather additional detail about student placement outcomes:

- Salt Lake Community College (Non-credit CTE only)
- Utah State University Eastern
- Snow College
- Weber State University

Additional information could identify whether student jobs are training-related.

FOR MORE INFORMATION

See Chapter III, Pages 45-46
A Performance Audit of CTE Completion and Job Placement Rates

Presentation to the Higher Education Appropriations Subcommittee

January 27, 2016