

The Median Number of Seconds Before Call Information Is sent to a Dispatcher (CALL RECEIVED TO QUEUE IN SECONDS) is 41 seconds for SLC Police, 30 seconds for Fire and 32 seconds for Medical.

New dispatchers (at the end of 2018) were paid \$15.20 an hour. ("Applying the average benefits rate of 42% and 7.65% FICA to that rate at 2,080 hours per year results in an annual cost of about \$47,500 for each new hire.") I am not sure what point is trying to be made. Mr. Chapman is correct - with benefits dispatchers make 47,500. However, their take home is 31,616 before taxes. Meaning dispatchers make the same as a secretary. In America, 7 states have a minimum wage of 15.00.

PBX Operators were paid about \$2 an hour less but the audit recommended that only trained and certified dispatchers answer phones (as the UCA 911 Audit recommended). The audit states "The PBX Line is not fulfilling its purpose and should be removed."

Staffing should increase by 21 additional employees "but 21 additional employees would be a significant financial burden to the City." After converting the 3 PBX positions to FTEs we did receive an additional 3 FTE positions and 3 unfunded.

The recent audit confirmed that part of the problem is the Priority Dispatch script that is more useful for fire department and medical professionals. The Fire Department likes it. The police hate it. "some dispatch staff and many (patrol) field staff believe that the Priority Dispatch ProQA system hinders the level of service.... to officers in the field and.... to the emergency requestor....Those who hold this sentiment believe that the rigidity of ProQA inhibits call takers' ability to interact with callers using common sense, quickly obtain and relay the most vital information and correctly determine the level of priority for calls". When you are calling about a robbery in progress, being forced to answer a lot of questions from a script can be dangerously frustrating. Salt Lake City has decided to move away from Priority Dispatch and has committed to work with UPD to use their system. VECC uses Priority Dispatch. The audit specifically addresses employees' feelings towards the software, which was negative. However, "positive responses from external customers suggest that the ProQA software is not an issue with respect to 911 call-taker performance. Finally, the ProQA software does not appear to be an impediment related to internal processing. The time elapsed between a call being taken and sent to a dispatcher for processing is, on average, minimal, and consistent with best practice guidelines. However, SLC911 moved away from police ProQA on September 23, 2019.

SLC DISPATCH "DOES NOT MEET THE SECONDARY NENA STANDARD"

While The 911 Center Processes Calls Efficiently, The Time Elapsed from Call-Taking to Dispatch of Field Units Is Often Excessive for Salt Lake City Police. This sentence taken out of context and leads the reader to believe the problem is with dispatch. The time elapsed from call-taking to dispatch is not based on dispatch ability but based on available units to respond. Taking context directly from the Matrix Audit, "As part of an expanded needs assessment, determine if certain existing practices such as overall police response times, use of online reporting, and customer expectations such as estimate of arrival time and "on hold" time are appropriate. *page 4*

Additionally, the elapsed time from the point at which a call is received to when field units are dispatched is excessive in some cases. The following tables show a number of CAD metrics for Police, Fire, and Medical calls over a 12-month period ending in 2018. Specifically, the metrics shown are: RCV to QUEUE: The number of seconds from when a call is received by the 911 Center's phone system to when it is coded and assigned to a dispatcher.

RCV to DISP: The number of seconds from when a call is received by the 911 Center's phone system to when it is broadcast on the radio for units to respond.

These metrics are shown at the 50th percentile (median), 90th percentile, 95th percentile, and 99th percentile to provide a sense of the timeframes that callers experience with a given level of frequency.

Police CAD Incidents *Page 8*

Police: the time from call receipt to coding for dispatch (RCV to QUEUE) at the 90th percentile for Police CAD incidents is 139 seconds in Salt Lake City, and 127 seconds in Sandy. This means 10% of calls (even Priority 1 calls) take more than 2 minutes and 19 seconds for call-takers to code them for a dispatcher. A review of the data showed that 66% of calls are coded within one minute. ***Page 10***

Police: the time from call receipt to dispatching units on the radio airwaves (RCV to DISP) is 519 seconds (8 minutes and 39 seconds) at the 90th percentile for Priority 1 calls in Salt Lake City, and 302 seconds in Sandy. This means that 10% of Priority 1 calls in Salt Lake City take longer than 8 minutes and 39 seconds for emergency responders to be dispatched. Given the call processing time in the prior bullet point, this indicates that about 10% of high-priority calls wait at least 6 minutes and 20 seconds before police units are dispatched.

The most notable issues with this processing time lie on the police side, where nearly half of all calls are coded for dispatch within 30 seconds but are not dispatched to field units for three minutes. This delay could be the result of inefficient dispatch procedures, but given the 911 Center's professional environment, the efficiency of dispatchers observed on site by the project team, the speed with which calls are processed, and the positive impression of the 911 Center held by the public, the delay is more likely a symptom of limited availability among field units. While Police Department staffing and operations are outside the scope of this study, the data analyzed in the course of this study suggests that an examination of the Department's personnel and deployment strategy is urgently necessary. It should also be noted that the Salt Lake City Police Department used non-patrol staff to saturate patrol in 2018 from June 10th to October 6th. As shown in Appendix E, this period ***Page 11***

3. Recommendations

The study found the majority of Salt Lake City and Sandy City residents who have used emergency or non-emergency services in the last year believe the 911 Communications Bureau is doing a good to excellent job overall. Moreover, performance scores for dispatch operators were high across all key indicators including whether the operator listened, was knowledgeable, and asked relevant and appropriate questions.

Despite these positive indicators, aggregate data from *the study found that residents are generally less satisfied with response times and on-scene personnel*. When results for all calls are combined, customers reported a median wait time of 10 minutes for help to arrive, although individual respondents reported

waiting more than 90 minutes for services, raising the average wait time to nearly an hour. Less than three-fourths of customers surveyed gave the Bureau a top score for response time and 12% gave the Bureau a low score of 1 or 2, significantly lower than the scores for dispatch operators. On-scene personnel received similar scores.

Results suggest that while all three service areas are important to residents, response time and on-scene performance may have a greater impact on overall satisfaction than interactions with dispatch operators. Dispatch performance, while very important to customers and strongly correlated with overall satisfaction, may not translate into highly satisfied customers if their expectations for response time and on-scene personnel are not met. ***Page 57***

“The 911 Center has established goals for call-taking timeliness, seeking to answer 95% of calls within 10-15 seconds, and 98% of calls within 20 seconds. 90% of calls are answered within 10 seconds, meeting both the agency’s goal and the National Emergency Number Association (NENA) target. However, only 93.5% of calls are answered within 20 seconds, meaning that 6.5% of calls ring for longer than the target time of 20 seconds. Similarly, the 911 Center does not meet the secondary NENA standard of 99% calls answered within 40 seconds. A review of the data provided shows that 96.7% of calls are answered within 40 seconds, leaving the remaining 3.3% (1 in 30) to ring longer than this target time.

Time to dispatch can be over 700 seconds. The average time to send a call to dispatch is 139 seconds. SLC Dispatch "does not meet the secondary NENA standard of 99% of calls answered within 40 seconds" (in SLC it is 96.7%). **Based on this audit which used numbers from 2018, SLC911 has significantly improved performance. As stated in the updated Audit findings for August 2020, SLC911 was out of compliance during the targeted time frame of 2015 to 2019, 32 months of the 60-month period which is 53%. (p. 17, Report to the Utah Legislature, Number 2020-06 – An In-Depth Follow-Up of 911 Audits and Review of 911 Staffing). However, the chart below shows the over-all numbers for the last 2 years and 8 months:**

	<10 Seconds	<15 Seconds	<20 Seconds	<40 Seconds
2018	95.62	96.48	97.10	98.66
2019	97.53	98.03	98.44	99.33
2020	98.21	98.53	98.85	99.55

It can take almost 10 minutes for 10% of the priority one calls to be sent to officers on patrol by dispatch! Ten minutes was the median reported wait time for services (Fire/EMS/Police) to arrive while the average was one hour (page 59 of 911 audit) **(actually page 73)**! "SLC customers reported a median wait time of 15 minutes for officers to arrive, compared to 10 minutes for Sandy City customers."

The Median Number of Seconds Before Call Information Is sent to a Dispatcher (CALL RECEIVED TO QUEUE IN SECONDS) is 41 seconds for SLC Police, 30 seconds for Fire and 32 seconds for Medical. The average time to send a call to queue is 139 seconds. The remaining 561 seconds is not based on dispatch ability, performance or decisions. SLC911 is a separate department and as a result, do not have control over police response times. The time elapsed from call-taking to dispatch is based on available units to respond.

While the 911 center processes calls efficiently, the time elapsed from call-taking to dispatch of field units is often excessive for Salt Lake City Police.(p. 8, Matrix Audit, 2019) This sentence read in context explains that dispatch is only in control of time received to queue.

(1.3) Performance Ratings by Service Function

In addition to analyzing performance ratings by area, the study compared performance scores by service function, including dispatch, response time, and on-scene personnel. **Findings suggest that residents are more satisfied with their interactions with dispatch operators than they are with the time it takes for help to arrive and the performance of on-scene personnel.** As seen in **Figure 4**, nearly nine-out-of-ten residents (89%) gave dispatch a top score (4 or 5), compared to 76% who gave a similar rating for the departments' on-scene personnel and 73% for response time. ***Page 63***

ADDITIONAL ISSUES

The SLC CAD/RMS (Versadex) system should allow patrol officers to view Fire/EMS calls as they occur. The system does not allow that now. The 911 Center's current CAD system, Versadex, includes mobile access for emergency personnel in the field. Each agency has access only to the CAD cases generated for their agency, and the two are not integrated to provide visibility between the fire and police departments.

The CAD system has been updated and each agency can now see cases generated for the opposite discipline. This was completed in June of 2019.

The new Mobile Mental Crisis Outreach Team is still not operating effectively in our urban areas. It could be an important cost effective and better system for handling mental health issues. When police are called, the large response can make the situation worse due to the noise and massing of personnel. It can result in a major fight with significant injuries and in some cases, death due to poor training and a stressful situation. The crisis number is 801 587 3000. Unfortunately, many 911 systems are not passing callers to this number and service.

SLCPD implemented a program where each officer receives CIT (crisis intervention team) training and works in coordination with the homeless outreach service team (HOST). This procedure has SLCPD responding officers request a Community Connections Center employee to assist. Dispatch broadcasts for a CCC member on duty and will dispatch them to the call. Dispatch also participates in the crisis response services monthly meetings. We also transfer callers who are non-violent and do not need police, fire or medical assistance to MCOT.

For residents near the Salt Lake City and Sandy boundaries, they often find that their 911 cell phone calls end up going to the wrong 911 Dispatch Center Valley Emergency Communications Center VECC! And despite the new Legislative bill that requires all 911 calls be handed off to 911 and not to a non-emergency number (if it went to the wrong 911 center), sometimes VECC dispatch sends the call to the SLC non-emergency number! If over 50% of the calls from the cell tower is supposed to go to SLC 911 dispatch, the City, after a complaint and evaluation of call volumes, can have all 911 calls go to SLC 911 dispatch first. The best solution is to combine the multiple Public Safety Answering Points (PSAPs). As the UCA 911 Audit said "fear of closing down their small public safety answering points (PSAPs) is the obvious way to reduce transfers... there are other options".....Speed and efficiency of 911 call handling

could improve by reducing 911 call transfers". According to the UCA 911 Audit, in 2018, "call transfers between Salt Lake City 911, Salt Lake Valley Emergency Communications Center (VECC) and the Unified Police Department (UPD) accounted for approximately 40% of the State's 911 call transfers." The Audit said "rapid response should be the core goal of all public safety providers". I urge this Legislature to consider studying what it will take to force the PSAPs to combine as Weber and Morgan County did and make the 911 system work as it should. Utah Communications Authority does not have the influence to force

To comply with SB198 and SB130, SLC911 now has an integrated CAD with Unified Police Department, Cottonwood Heights, Sandy, Riverton, Draper, Herriman and Taylorsville. All fire agencies in the county will be moving to the same CAD on September 29, 2020. All Police departments in the county will be moving to Versaterm over the next 10 months, removing the need to transfer callers. SLC911 and SLVECC are working on an aggregator to eliminate call transfers between SLC911 and DPS. Implementation should occur at the end of 2020.