



MINUTES

HOUSE EDUCATION STANDING COMMITTEE

Friday, February 24, 2023 | 4:00 p.m. | 120 Senate Building

Members Present:

Rep. Candice B. Pierucci, Chair
Rep. Dan N. Johnson, Vice Chair
Rep. Kera Birkeland
Rep. Tyler Clancy
Rep. Joseph Elison
Rep. Katy Hall
Rep. Karianne Lisonbee
Rep. Steven J. Lund
Rep. Carol S. Moss
Rep. Jefferson Moss

Rep. Karen M. Peterson
Rep. Susan Pulsipher
Rep. Angela Romero
Rep. Mike Schultz
Rep. R. Neil Walter

Members Absent:

Rep. Val L. Peterson

Staff Present:

Robert Wood, Policy Analyst
Shay Berger, Committee Secretary

Note: A copy of related materials and an audio recording of the meeting can be found at www.le.utah.gov.

Chair Pierucci called the meeting to order.

1. H.B. 427 Public Education Curriculum Requirements (*Jimenez, T.*)

Rep. Tim Jimenez introduced the bill.

Nicholeen Peck, President of the World Wide Women Association, spoke in favor of the bill.

Rep. Johnson assumed the chair.

Angie Stallings, Deputy Superintendent of Policy at the Utah State Board of Education, spoke to the bill.

Eileen Quinten, Nebo School District, spoke to the bill.

Dr. Sara Jones, Utah Education Association, spoke against the bill.

Josh Cornia, citizen, spoke in favor of the bill.

Darlene Mcdonald, citizen, spoke against the bill.

Gayle Ruzicka, Utah Eagle Forum, spoke in favor of the bill.

Lia Baez, Policy Director of United Way of Salt Lake, spoke against the bill.

Paul Skousen, citizen, spoke in favor of the bill.

Abigail Cooly, citizen, spoke against the bill.

Jon Harvey, parent, spoke in favor of the bill.

Lyla Mahmoud, American Civil Liberties Union Utah, spoke against the bill.

Christina Bogge, citizen, spoke in favor of the bill.

Cari Bartholomew, citizen, spoke in favor of the bill.

April Despain, mother, spoke in favor of the bill.

Aaron Bullen, citizen, spoke in favor of the bill.

Kevin Korous, parent, spoke against the bill.

Charlotte Gatrell, teacher, spoke against the bill.

Amanda Eskeets, teacher, spoke against the bill.

MOTION: Rep. Peterson moved to replace H.B. 427 with 1st Substitute H.B. 427. The motion passed with a vote of 10 - 0 - 6.

Yeas - 10

Nays - 0

Absent - 6

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

MOTION: Rep. Peterson moved to amend 1st Substitute H.B. 427 with Amendment #1. The motion passed with a vote of 10 - 0 - 6.

Amendment 1
1st Sub. H.B. 427

1. Page 1, Line 19:

19 • do not incentivize or force a student to {~~confront~~} change a sincerely held belief, value, or

2. Page 4, Lines 90 through 105:

90 (2) The state board, the State Instructional Materials Commission, and each LEA shall :

(a)

91 ensure that instructional and curricular materials are consistent with:

92 {~~(a)~~} (i) the principle that all individuals are equal before the law and have inalienable
93 rights; and

94 {~~(b)~~} (ii) the following principles of individual freedom:

95 {~~(i)~~} (A) that no individual is inherently racist, sexist, or oppressive, whether consciously or
96 unconsciously, solely by virtue of the individual's race, sex, or sexual orientation;

97 {~~(ii)~~} (B) that no race is inherently superior or inferior to another race;

98 {~~(iii)~~} (C) that no person should be subject to discrimination or adverse treatment solely or
99 partly on the basis of the individual's race, color, national origin, religion, disability, sex, or

100 sexual orientation;

101 {~~(iv)~~} (D) that meritocracy or character traits, including hard work ethic, are not racist but
102 fundamental to the right to pursue happiness and to be rewarded for industry; and

103 {~~(v)~~} (E) that an individual, by virtue of the individual's race or sex, does not bear

104 responsibility for actions that other members of the same race or sex committed in the past or
105 present{~~-~~}; and

(b) allow an educator to facilitate an age-appropriate discussion or use age-appropriate instructional or curricular materials to teach about sexism, slavery, racial oppression, racial segregation, and racial discrimination, including topics relating to the enactment and enforcement of laws resulting in sexism, racial oppression, racial segregation, and racial discrimination.

3. Page 4, Lines 108 through 117:

108 (a) subject a student to instruction that incentivizes or forces the student to ~~{confront}~~ change a
109 sincerely held belief, value, or standard that is taught in the student's home;
110 (b) subject a member of administrative or instructional personnel to instruction,
111 training, coaching, or professional development concepts that incentivize or force the
112 individual to ~~{confront}~~ change a sincerely held belief, value, or standard that the individual holds;
113 (c) allow instructional personnel or administrative personnel to use instructional,
114 auxiliary, or curricular materials or to:
115 (i) expose a student to an environment, displays, or instruction that incentivizes or
116 forces a student to ~~{confront}~~ change a sincerely held belief, value, or standard that is taught in the
117 student's home; or

4 . Page 4, Line 112:

112 individual to ~~{confront}~~ change a sincerely held belief, value, or standard that the individual holds;

Yeas - 10

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 6

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

MOTION: Rep. Elison moved to pass 1st Substitute H.B. 427 out favorably. The motion passed with a vote of 7 - 2 - 7.

Yeas - 7

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher

Nays - 2

Rep. C. Moss
Rep. A. Romero

Absent - 7

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

2. S.B. 183 Educator Salary Amendments (Vickers, E.)

Sen. Evan Vickers introduced the bill.

Linda Hanks, Utah School Board Association, spoke in favor of the bill.

Chase Clyde, Utah Education Association, spoke in favor of the bill.

MOTION: Rep. Lund moved to pass S.B. 183 out favorably. The motion passed with a vote of 9 - 0 - 7.

Yeas - 9

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 7

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

3. S.B. 194 Higher Education Funding Amendments (*Vickers, E.*)

Sen. Evan Vickers introduced the bill.

MOTION: Rep. Romero moved to pass S.B. 194 out favorably. The motion passed with a vote of 9 - 0 - 7.

Yeas - 9

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 7

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

4. H.B. 494 Education Reporting Amendments (*Pulsipher, S.*)

Rep. Pulsipher introduced the bill.

Jim Moss, Chair of the Utah State Board of Education, spoke in favor of the bill.

MOTION: Rep. Peterson moved to replace H.B. 494 with 1st Substitute H.B. 494. The motion passed with a vote of 9 - 0 - 7.

Yeas - 9

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 7

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

MOTION: Rep. Peterson moved to pass 1st Substitute H.B. 494 out favorably. The motion passed with a vote of 9 - 0 - 7.

Yeas - 9

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 7

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

MOTION: Rep. Peterson moved to place 1st Substitute H.B. 494 on the Consent Calendar. The motion passed with a vote of 9 - 0 - 7.

Yeas - 9

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 7

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

5. H.B. 459 Governmental Immunity Amendments (*Kotter, Q.*)

Rep. Quinn Kotter introduced the bill.

[Handout for HB459](#)

Angie Stallings, Deputy Superintendent of Policy at the Utah State Board of Education, spoke to the bill.

Rachel Terry, Director of State Risk Management, spoke to the bill.

Monica Wilbur, citizen, spoke in favor of the bill.

Brad Asay, President of the American Teachers Association of Utah, spoke against the bill.

Nicholeen Peck, President of the World Wide Women Association, spoke in favor of the bill.

Kim Chandler, citizen, spoke in favor of the bill.

Rita Heagren, citizen, spoke against the bill.

MOTION: Rep. Peterson moved to hold H.B. 459. The motion passed with a vote of 9 - 0 - 7.

Yeas - 9

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 7

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

MOTION: Rep. Pierucci moved to saunter.

6. H.C.R. 10 Concurrent Resolution Regarding the Pledge of Allegiance in Schools (*Ballard, M.G.*)

Rep. Melissa Ballard introduced the bill with Conrad Baker, student, and Tadd Callister, Bountiful resident.

Dalane England, teacher, spoke in favor of the bill.

Te Anu Tonga, citizen, spoke in favor of the bill.

MOTION: Rep. Clancy moved to pass H.C.R. 10 out favorably. The motion passed with a vote of 10 - 0 - 6.

Yeas - 10

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 6

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

7. H.B. 475 Communication Credits Requirements (*Welton, D.*)

Rep. Douglas Welton introduced the bill.

Emily Lundberg Bastian, parent, spoke in favor of the bill.

MOTION: Rep. Lund moved to pass H.B. 475 out favorably. The motion passed with a vote of 8 - 2 - 6.

Yeas - 8

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 2

Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci

Absent - 6

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

8. H.J.R. 20 Joint Resolution Regarding Higher Education Accreditation (*Welton, D.*)

Rep. Douglas Welton introduced the bill.

Brad Asay, President of the American Federation of Teachers, spoke to the bill.

MOTION: Rep. Lisonbee moved to pass H.J.R. 20 out favorably. The motion passed with a vote of 7 - 3 - 6.

Yeas - 7

- Rep. T. Clancy
- Rep. K. Hall
- Rep. D. Johnson
- Rep. K. Lisonbee
- Rep. S. Lund
- Rep. K. Peterson
- Rep. C. Pierucci

Nays - 3

- Rep. C. Moss
- Rep. S. Pulsipher
- Rep. A. Romero

Absent - 6

- Rep. K. Birkeland
- Rep. J. Elison
- Rep. J. Moss
- Rep. V. Peterson
- Rep. M. Schultz
- Rep. R. Walter

9. H.B. 481 Safe Storage of Firearms Education Requirements (Hayes, S.)

Rep. Sahara Hayes introduced the bill.

Sydnee Dickson, State Superintendent of Public Instruction, Utah State Board of Education, spoke to the bill.

Clark Aposhian, Utah Shooting Sports Council, spoke in favor of the bill.

MOTION: Rep. Moss moved to replace H.B. 481 with 1st Substitute H.B. 481. The motion passed with a vote of 10 - 0 - 6.

Yeas - 10

- Rep. T. Clancy
- Rep. K. Hall
- Rep. D. Johnson
- Rep. K. Lisonbee
- Rep. S. Lund
- Rep. C. Moss
- Rep. K. Peterson
- Rep. C. Pierucci
- Rep. S. Pulsipher
- Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 6

- Rep. K. Birkeland
- Rep. J. Elison
- Rep. J. Moss
- Rep. V. Peterson
- Rep. M. Schultz
- Rep. R. Walter

MOTION: Rep. Lisonbee moved to amend 1st Substitute H.B. 481 with Amendment #1. The motion passed with a vote of 10 - 0 - 6.

Amendment 1
1st Sub. H.B. 481

1. Page 3, Lines 71 through 72:

71 (b) includes access to age appropriate firearm safety and suicide prevention materials

72 selected by the state superintendent in collaboration with the state suicide prevention coordinator; and

Yeas - 10

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 6

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

MOTION: Rep. Peterson moved to amend 1st Substitute H.B. 481 with Amendment #2. The motion passed with a vote of 10 - 0 - 6.

Amendment 2
1st Sub. H.B. 481

- 1. Page 3, Lines 69 through 72:
- 69 (ii) the prevention of underage drinking of alcohol and substance abuse under Section
- 70 53G-10-406; [and]
- 71 (b) { ~~includes~~ } considers access to age appropriate firearm safety and suicide prevention materials
- 72 selected by the state superintendent; and

Yeas - 10

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 6

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

MOTION: Rep. Lisonbee moved to pass 1st Substitute H.B. 481 out favorably. The motion passed with a vote of 10 - 0 - 6.

Yeas - 10

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 6

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

10. 1st Sub. S.B. 103 Student Graduation Attire Modifications (Kwan, K.)

Sen. Karen Kwan introduced the bill Charlene Lui, Native Hawaiian & Pacific Islander Alliance, and Verona Mnuga.

Rep. Johnson assumed the chair.

Ben Horsely, Granite School District, spoke in favor of the bill.

Mohammad Al-Saedy, college student, spoke in favor of the bill.

Rep. Pierucci assumed the chair.

Milan Taala, student, spoke in favor of the bill.

Tualagi Taala, student, spoke in favor of the bill.

Curtis Sillito, citizen, spoke in favor of the bill.

Te Anu Tonga, citizen, spoke in favor of the bill.

MOTION: Rep. Lisonbee moved to replace 1st Substitute S.B. 103 with 2nd Substitute S.B. 103. The motion passed with a vote of 10 - 0 - 6.

Yeas - 10

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 6

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

MOTION: Rep. Lisonbee moved to pass 2nd Substitute S.B. 103 out favorably. The motion passed with a vote of 10 - 0 - 6.

Yeas - 10

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 6

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

MOTION: Rep. Lisonbee moved to adjourn. The motion passed with a vote of 10 - 0 - 6.

Yeas - 10

Rep. T. Clancy
Rep. K. Hall
Rep. D. Johnson
Rep. K. Lisonbee
Rep. S. Lund
Rep. C. Moss
Rep. K. Peterson
Rep. C. Pierucci
Rep. S. Pulsipher
Rep. A. Romero

Nays - 0

Absent - 6

Rep. K. Birkeland
Rep. J. Elison
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. V. Peterson
Rep. M. Schultz
Rep. R. Walter

NOTE: H.B. 0508, 01st Substitute S.B. 0167 were not discussed in the meeting.