♣ Approved for Filing: RCL♣ 01-29-99 8:15 AM♣

Senator Lyle W. Hillyard proposes to substitute the following bill:

1	AMENDMEN 18 - CHILD ABUSE DATABASE
2	1999 GENERAL SESSION
3	STATE OF UTAH
4	Sponsor: Lyle W. Hillyard
5	AN ACT RELATING TO HUMAN SERVICES; REQUIRING WITHOUT MERIT AND
6	UNSUBSTANTIATED REPORTS OF CHILD ABUSE OR NEGLECT TO BE REMOVED
7	FROM THE CHILD WELFARE DATABASE WHEN SUBSEQUENT REPORTS HAVE NOT
8	OCCURRED WITHIN A SPECIFIED TIME PERIOD; INCLUDING THE NAME OF A
9	PERSON ON THE LICENSING DATABASE WHEN NOTICE WENT UNDELIVERED;
10	CLARIFYING THE CIRCUMSTANCES UNDER WHICH A JUVENILE PERPETRATOR
11	MAY BE INCLUDED ON THE LICENSING DATABASE; PROHIBITING A PERSON FROM
12	ASKING ANOTHER PERSON TO OBTAIN INFORMATION FROM THE DATABASE;
13	PERMITTING A FINDING OF ABUSE OR NEGLECT TO BE SUPPORTED SOLELY BY A
14	CHILD'S OUT-OF-COURT STATEMENT THAT IS FOUND TO BE RELIABLE UNDER
15	EXISTING STATUTE OR COURT RULE; REQUIRING A NEW OPPORTUNITY TO
16	CHALLENGE, IN CERTAIN CIRCUMSTANCES, IF THE USE OF THE LICENSING
17	DATABASE IS BROADENED; CLARIFYING WHEN A COURT DETERMINATION OF
18	ABUSE OR NEGLECT IS TO BE INCLUDED ON THE LICENSING DATABASE; AND
19	MAKING TECHNICAL AND CONFORMING AMENDMENTS.
20	This act affects sections of Utah Code Annotated 1953 as follows:
21	AMENDS:
22	62A-2-121 , as enacted by Chapter 358, Laws of Utah 1998
23	62A-4a-116, as last amended by Chapter 196, Laws of Utah 1998
24	62A-4a-116.5 , as enacted by Chapter 196, Laws of Utah 1998
25	62A-4a-412 , as last amended by Chapters 169, 196 and 274, Laws of Utah 1998

26	63-46b-15, as last amended by Chapter 1, Laws of Utah 1996
27	78-3a-104, as last amended by Chapters 274 and 315, Laws of Utah 1998
28	Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:
29	Section 1. Section 62A-2-121 is amended to read:
30	62A-2-121. Access to abuse and neglect information for licensing purposes.
31	(1) With respect to human services licensees, the department may access only the <u>licensing</u>
32	part of the Division of Child and Family Service's management information system created by
33	Section 62A-4a-116 for the purpose of:
34	(a) determining whether a person associated with a licensee, who provides care described
35	in Subsection (2), has a substantiated finding of abuse or neglect; [and]
36	(b) informing a licensee, who provides care described in Subsection (2), that a person
37	associated with the licensee has a substantiated finding of child abuse or neglect.
38	(2) (a) A licensee or individual applying for or renewing a license to provide child-placing
39	services, youth programs, substitute care, foster care, or institutionalized care to children shall
40	submit to the department the name and other identifying information of a person associated with
41	the licensee.
42	(b) The office shall process the information to determine whether the licensee or a person
43	associated with a licensee has a substantiated finding of child abuse or neglect.
44	(3) The office shall adopt rules defining the circumstances under which a person who has
45	a substantiated finding of child abuse or neglect may provide child-placing services, foster care,
46	youth programs, substitute care, or institutionalized care for children in a facility licenced by the
47	department.
48	Section 2. Section 62A-4a-116 is amended to read:
49	62A-4a-116. Management information system Requirements.
50	(1) The division shall develop and implement a management information system that
51	meets the requirements of this section and the requirements of federal law and regulation.
52	(2) With regard to all child welfare cases, the management information system shall:
53	(a) provide each caseworker with a complete history of each child in his caseload,
54	including:
55	(i) all past action taken by the division with regard to that child and his siblings, the
56	complete case history and all reports and information in the control or keeping of the division

31	regarding that child and his siblings;
58	(ii) the number of times the child has been in foster care;
59	(iii) the cumulative period of time the child has been in foster care;
60	(iv) all reports of abuse or neglect received by the division with regard to that child's parent
61	or parents, including documentation regarding whether each report was substantiated [or].
62	unsubstantiated, or without merit;
63	(v) the number of times the child's parent or parents have failed any treatment plan; and
64	(vi) the number of different caseworkers who have been assigned to that child in the past;
65	(b) contain all key elements of each family's current treatment plan, including the dates and
66	number of times the plan has been administratively or judicially reviewed, the number of times the
67	parent or parents have failed that treatment plan, and the exact length of time that treatment plan
68	has been in effect; [and]
69	(c) alert caseworkers regarding deadlines for completion of and compliance with treatment
70	plans[.]; and
71	(d) unless the executive director determines that there is good cause for keeping the report
72	on the system based on standards established by rule, delete any reference to:
73	(i) a report that is without merit if no subsequent report involving the same alleged
74	perpetrator has occurred within one year; or
75	(ii) a report that is unsubstantiated if no subsequent report involving the same alleged
76	perpetrator has occurred within ten years.
77	(3) With regard to all child protective services cases, the management information system
78	shall, in addition to the information required in Subsection (2), monitor compliance with the policy
79	of the division, the laws of this state, and federal law and regulation.
80	(4) (a) The division shall develop and maintain a part of the information management
81	system for licensing purposes, which shall be:
82	(i) limited to:
83	(A) substantiated findings of child abuse or neglect since January 1, [1994] 1988, after
84	notice and an opportunity to challenge has been provided under Section 62A-4a-116.5;
85	[(B) substantiated findings of child abuse or neglect for which a notice has been sent under
86	Section 62A-4a-116.5 by July 1, 1998, and found by an administrative hearing officer before
87	December 1 1998 to have occurred between January 1 1988 and January 1 1994 except that

- if a person applies for licensure or an adoption before June 30, 1999, and that person has not previously been given notice under Section 62A-4a-116.5, the department may determine whether a substantiated finding exists between January 1, 1988, and January 1, 1994, and if so, provide notice and an opportunity to challenge under Section 62A-4a-116.5 before the license or adoption may be approved;]
- (B) the name of a person who was not sent a notice of agency action under Section 62A-4a-116.5 because his location was not available on the management information system or who was sent a notice of agency that was returned to the division as undelivered for the sole purpose of alerting the division of the need to afford the person an opportunity to challenge the finding of substantiated child abuse or neglect under Section 62A-4a-116.5 before any adverse action, beyond delaying the person's licensing application to provide an opportunity for challenge, may be taken;
- (C) an adjudication of child abuse or neglect by a court of competent jurisdiction <u>if</u> <u>Subsection 62A-4a-116.5(5)</u> has been met; and
- (D) any criminal conviction or guilty plea related to neglect, physical abuse, or sexual abuse of any person; and
 - (ii) accessible by:
 - (A) the Office of Licensing:
 - (I) for licensing purposes [only];
- (II) to screen a person at the request of the Office of the Guardian Ad Litem Director, created by Section 78-3a-912, at the time the person seeks a paid or voluntary position with the Office of the Guardian Ad Litem and each year thereafter that the person remains with the office; and
- (III) to respond to a request for information from the person who is identified as a perpetrator in the report, after advising the person of the screening presentation in Subsection (4)(d)(iii); [and]
- (B) subject to the provisions of Subsection (4)(c), the Bureau of Health Facility Licensure within the Department of Health only for the purpose of licensing a child care program or provider, or for determining whether a person associated with a covered health care facility, as defined by the Department of Health by rule, who provides direct care to a child has a substantiated finding of child abuse or neglect[-]; and

119	(C) the department as provided in Subsection (5) and Section 62A-1-118.
120	(b) For the purpose of Subsection (4)(a), "substantiated":
121	(i) means a finding, at the completion of an investigation, that there is a reasonable basis
122	to conclude that:
123	(A) a person 18 years of age or older committed one or more of the following types of
124	<u>child</u> abuse or neglect [has occurred]:
125	[(A)] (I) physical abuse;
126	[(B)] <u>(II)</u> sexual abuse;
127	[(C)] <u>(III)</u> sexual exploitation;
128	[(D)] <u>(IV)</u> abandonment;
129	[(E)] (V) medical neglect resulting in death, disability, or serious illness; or
130	[(F)] (VI) chronic or severe neglect; and
131	(B) a person under the age of 18 who has:
132	(I) caused serious physical injury, as defined in Section 76-5-109(d), to another child
133	which indicates a significant risk to other children; or
134	(II) engaged in sexual behavior with or upon another child which indicates a significant
135	risk to other children; and
136	(ii) does not include the use of reasonable and necessary physical restraint or force by an
137	educator in accordance with Subsection 53A-11-802(2) or Section 76-2-401.
138	(iii) (A) For purposes of Subsection (4)(b)(i)(B), "significant risk" shall be determined in
139	accordance with risk assessment tools and policies established by the division that focus on age,
140	social factors, emotional factors, sexual factors, intellectual factors, family risk factors, and other
141	related considerations.
142	(B) The division shall train its child protection workers to apply the risk assessment tools
143	and policies established under Subsection (4)(b)(iii)(A).
144	(c) (i) The Department of Health shall:
145	(A) designate two persons within the Department of Health to access the licensing part of
146	the management information system; and
147	(B) adopt measures to:
148	(I) protect the security of the licensing part of the management information system; and
149	(II) strictly limit access to the licensing part of the management information system to

150	those designated under Subsection $(4)(c)(i)(A)$.
151	(ii) Those designated under Subsection (4)(c)(i)(A) shall receive training from the
152	department with respect to:
153	(A) accessing the licensing part of the management information system;
154	(B) maintaining strict security; and
155	(C) the criminal provisions in Section 62A-4a-412 for the improper release of information.
156	(iii) Those designated under Subsection (4)(c)(i)(A):
157	(A) are the only ones in the Department of Health with the authority to access the licensing
158	part of the management information system; and
159	(B) may only access the licensing part of the management information system in
160	accordance with the provisions of Subsection (4)(a)(ii).
161	(d) (i) Information in the licensing part of the management information system is
162	confidential and may only be used or disclosed as specifically provided in this section, Section
163	62A-4a-121, and Section 62A-4a-116.5.
164	(ii) No person, unless listed in Subsection (4)(a)(ii), may request another person to obtain
165	or release a report or any other information in the possession of the division obtained as a result
166	of the report that is available under Subsection (4)(a)(ii)(A)(III) to screen for potential perpetrators
167	of child abuse or neglect.
168	(iii) A person who requests information knowing that it is a violation of Subsection
169	(4)(d)(ii) to do so is subject to the criminal penalty in Section 62A-4a-412.
170	(5) All information contained in the management information system shall be available
171	to the department upon the approval of the executive director, on a need-to-know basis.
172	(6) The information contained in the management information system shall be encrypted.
173	Section 3. Section 62A-4a-116.5 is amended to read:
174	62A-4a-116.5. Opportunity to appeal a substantiated finding of child abuse or
175	neglect.
176	(1) If the division makes a substantiated finding of abuse or neglect pursuant to Subsection
177	62A-4a-116(4)(b), the division shall send notice of agency action regarding the division's finding
178	to the person found to have committed the abuse or neglect.
179	(2) The notice shall state:
180	(a) the facts that support the finding of substantiation;

181	(b) that the person may be disqualified from adopting a child or working for or being
182	licensed by:
183	(i) the department;
184	(ii) a human services licensee;
185	(iii) a child care provider or program; and
186	(iv) a covered health care facility;
187	(c) that the person has the right to request:
188	(i) a copy of the substantiated report; and
189	(ii) an opportunity to challenge the finding and its inclusion on the licensing part of the
190	management information system described in Subsection 62A-4a-116(4), except as provided in
191	Subsection (5)(b); and
192	(d) that failure to request an opportunity to challenge the finding within 30 days of the
193	notice being received will result in an unappealable finding of substantiation, unless the person car
194	show good cause for why compliance within the 30-day requirement was virtually impossible or
195	unreasonably burdensome.
196	(3) (a) A person may make a request to challenge a substantiated finding within 30 days
197	of:
198	(i) a notice being received under Subsection (2);
199	(ii) a finding by a court of competent jurisdiction based on the same underlying facts that:
200	(A) child abuse or neglect, as described in Subsection 62A-4a-116(4)(b), did not occur;
201	or
202	(B) the person was not responsible for the child abuse or neglect that did occur; or
203	(iii) the dismissal of criminal charges or a verdict of not guilty based on the same
204	underlying facts.
205	(b) The 30-day requirement of Subsection (3)(a) shall be extended for good cause shown
206	that compliance was virtually impossible or unreasonably burdensome.
207	(c) The division may approve or deny a request made under Subsection (3)(a).
208	(d) If the division denies the request or fails to act within 30 days after receiving a request
209	submitted under Subsection (3)(a), the Office of Administrative Hearings shall hold an
210	adjudicative proceeding pursuant to Title 63, Chapter 46b, Administrative Procedures Act.
211	(4) (a) In an adjudicative proceeding held pursuant to Subsection (3)(d), the division shall

212	prove by a preponderance of the evidence that there is a reasonable basis to conclude that:
213	(i) child abuse or neglect, as described in Subsection 62A-4a-116(4)(b), occurred; and
214	(ii) the person was substantially responsible for the abuse or neglect that occurred.
215	(b) The administrative hearing officer may make a determination of substantiation based
216	solely on the out-of-court statement of the child that the officer finds to be reliable under the
217	standards set forth in:
218	(i) Section 76-5-411;
219	(ii) Utah Rules of Criminal Procedure, Rule 15.5;
220	(iii) Section 78-3a-116(5);
221	(iv) the Utah Rules of Evidence; or
222	(v) Utah case law.
223	(5) (a) A person may not make a request to challenge a substantiated finding under
224	Subsection (3)(a), if, at anytime, a court of competent jurisdiction has made a determination based
225	on the same underlying facts that:
226	(i) child abuse or neglect, as described in Subsection 62A-4a-116(4)(b), occurred; [and]
227	(ii) the person was substantially responsible for the abuse or neglect that occurred[:]; and
228	(iii) the person:
229	(A) was a party to the proceeding; or
230	(B) (I) had notice of the proceeding; and
231	(II) was provided a meaningful opportunity to challenge the facts underlying the court's
232	determination.
233	(b) An adjudicative proceeding held pursuant to Subsection (4) may be stayed during the
234	time a judicial action is pending.
235	(6) Nothing in this section may affect the inclusion or exclusion of a report or finding of
236	child abuse or neglect from or access by the division, its caseworkers, and child protective services
237	workers to that part of the management information system used for purposes of child welfare
238	cases and child protective services as described in Subsections 62A-4a-116(2) and (3).
239	(7) By December 31, 1998, the division shall provide notice to each person with a
240	substantiated finding of abuse or neglect since January 1, 1994.
241	(8) A person who, after receiving notice, fails to challenge a substantiated finding of child
242	abuse or neglect may request the opportunity to challenge the finding under this section:

243	(a) if since the time that the person received notice, state law has been amended to permit
244	a broader use of or access to information on the licensing part of the management information
245	system; and
246	(b) before the finding may be used against the person in connection with the broader use
247	or access.
248	Section 4. Section 62A-4a-412 is amended to read:
249	62A-4a-412. Reports and information confidential.
250	(1) Except as otherwise provided in this chapter, reports made pursuant to this part, as well
251	as any other information in the possession of the division obtained as the result of a report, with
252	the exception of information on the licensing part of the management information system which
253	is governed by Subsection 62A-4a-116(4)(ii), is confidential and may only be made available to:
254	(a) a police or law enforcement agency investigating a report of known or suspected child
255	abuse or neglect;
256	(b) a physician who reasonably believes that a child may be the subject of abuse or neglect;
257	(c) an agency that has responsibility or authority to care for, treat, or supervise a child who
258	is the subject of a report;
259	(d) any subject of the report, the natural parents of the minor, and the guardian ad litem;
260	(e) a court, upon a finding that access to the records may be necessary for the
261	determination of an issue before it;
262	(f) an office of the public prosecutor or its deputies in performing an official duty;
263	(g) a person authorized by a Childrens' Justice Center, for the purposes described in
264	Section 67-5b-102;
265	[(h) the Bureau of Health Facility Licensure within the Department of Health, as provided
266	for in Section 26-21-9.5, for the sole purpose of determining whether a person associated with a
267	covered health care facility and who provides direct care to children has a substantiated finding
268	of child abuse or neglect;]
269	[(i) the Bureau of Health Facility Licensure within the Department of Health for the
270	purpose of determining whether a person associated with a child care provider has a substantiated
271	finding of child abuse or neglect on the licensing part of the management information system
272	created in Section 62A-4a-116; and]
273	[(j)] (h) a person engaged in bona fide research, when approved by the director of the

274	division, if the information does not include names and addresses[-]; and
275	(i) any person identified in the report as a perpetrator or possible perpetrator of child abuse
276	or neglect, after being advised of the screening prohibition in Subsection (2).
277	(2) (a) No person, unless listed in Subsection (1), may request another person to obtain or
278	release a report or any other information in the possession of the division obtained as a result of
279	the report that is available under Subsection (1)(i) to screen for potential perpetrators of child
280	abuse or neglect.
281	(b) A person who requests information knowing that it is a violation of Subsection (2)(a)
282	to do so is subject to the criminal penalty in Subsection (4).
283	[(2)] (3) The division and law enforcement officials shall ensure the anonymity of the
284	person or persons making the initial report and any others involved in its subsequent investigation.
285	[(3)] (4) Any person who wilfully permits, or aides and abets the release of data or
286	information obtained as a result of this part, in the possession of the division or contained [in the
287	central register] on any part of the management information system, in violation of this part or
288	Section 62A-4a-116, is guilty of a class C misdemeanor.
289	[(4)] (5) The physician-patient privilege is not a ground for excluding evidence regarding
290	a child's injuries or the cause of those injuries, in any proceeding resulting from a report made in
291	good faith pursuant to this part.
292	Section 5. Section 63-46b-15 is amended to read:
293	63-46b-15. Judicial review Informal adjudicative proceedings.
294	(1) (a) The district courts have jurisdiction to review by trial de novo all final agency
295	actions resulting from informal adjudicative proceedings, except that the juvenile courts have
296	jurisdiction over all state agency actions relating to:
297	(i) the removal or placement of children in state custody [and actions relating to];
298	(ii) the support of [those] children under Subsection (1)(a)(i) as determined
299	administratively under Section 78-3a-906[-]; and
300	(iii) substantiated findings of abuse or neglect pursuant to 62A-4a-116.5.
301	(b) Venue for judicial review of informal adjudicative proceedings shall be as provided
302	in the statute governing the agency or, in the absence of such a venue provision, in the county
303	where the petitioner resides or maintains his principal place of business.
304	(2) (a) The petition for judicial review of informal adjudicative proceedings shall be a

335

305	complaint governed by the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure and shall include:
306	(i) the name and mailing address of the party seeking judicial review;
307	(ii) the name and mailing address of the respondent agency;
308	(iii) the title and date of the final agency action to be reviewed, together with a duplicate
309	copy, summary, or brief description of the agency action;
310	(iv) identification of the persons who were parties in the informal adjudicative proceedings
311	that led to the agency action;
312	(v) a copy of the written agency order from the informal proceeding;
313	(vi) facts demonstrating that the party seeking judicial review is entitled to obtain judicial
314	review;
315	(vii) a request for relief, specifying the type and extent of relief requested; and
316	(viii) a statement of the reasons why the petitioner is entitled to relief.
317	(b) All additional pleadings and proceedings in the district court are governed by the Utah
318	Rules of Civil Procedure.
319	(3) (a) The district court, without a jury, shall determine all questions of fact and law and
320	any constitutional issue presented in the pleadings.
321	(b) The Utah Rules of Evidence apply in judicial proceedings under this section.
322	Section 6. Section 78-3a-104 is amended to read:
323	78-3a-104. Jurisdiction of juvenile court Original Exclusive.
324	(1) Except as otherwise provided by law, the juvenile court has exclusive original
325	jurisdiction in proceedings concerning:
326	(a) a minor who has violated any federal, state, or local law or municipal ordinance or a
327	person younger than 21 years of age who has violated any law or ordinance before becoming 18
328	years of age, regardless of where the violation occurred, excluding traffic laws and ordinances;
329	(b) a person 21 years of age or older who has failed or refused to comply with an order of
330	the juvenile court to pay a fine or restitution, if the order was imposed prior to the person's 21st
331	birthday; however, the continuing jurisdiction is limited to causing compliance with existing
332	orders;
333	(c) a minor who is an abused child, neglected child, or dependent child, as those terms are
334	defined in Section 78-3a-103;

(d) a protective order for a minor who is alleged to be an abused child or neglected child,

except as provided in Section 78-3a-105, and unless the petition is filed by a natural parent of the minor against a natural parent of the minor;

- (e) the determination of the custody of a minor or to appoint a guardian of the person or other guardian of a minor who comes within the court's jurisdiction under other provisions of this section;
- (f) the termination of the legal parent-child relationship in accordance with Part 4, Termination of Parental Rights Act, including termination of residual parental rights and duties;
 - (g) the treatment or commitment of a mentally retarded minor;
- (h) a minor who, in defiance of earnest and persistent efforts on the part of his parents and school authorities as required under Section 53A-11-103, is a habitual truant from school;
- (i) the judicial consent to the marriage of a minor under age 16 upon a determination of voluntariness or where otherwise required by law, employment, or enlistment of a minor when consent is required by law;
- (j) any parent or parents of a minor committed to a secure youth corrections facility, to order, at the discretion of the court and on the recommendation of a secure youth corrections facility, the parent or parents of a minor committed to a secure youth corrections facility for a custodial term, to undergo group rehabilitation therapy under the direction of a secure youth corrections facility therapist, who has supervision of that parent's or parents' minor, or any other therapist the court may direct, for a period directed by the court as recommended by a secure youth corrections facility;
 - (k) a minor under Title 55, Chapter 12, Interstate Compact on Juveniles;
- (l) the treatment or commitment of a mentally ill child. The court may commit a child to the physical custody of a local mental health authority or to the legal custody of the Division of Mental Health in accordance with the procedures and requirements of Title 62A, Chapter 12, Part 2A, Commitment of Persons Under Age 18 to Division of Mental Health. The court may not commit a child directly to the Utah State Hospital; [and]
 - (m) the commitment of a minor in accordance with Section 62A-8-501[-];
- (n) de novo review of final agency actions resulting from an informal adjudicative proceeding as provided in Section 63-46b-15.
- (2) In addition to the provisions of Subsection (1)(a) the juvenile court has exclusive jurisdiction over any traffic offense committed by a minor under 16 years of age and concurrent

- 01-29-99 8:15 AM 367 jurisdiction over all other traffic offenses committed by a minor 16 years of age or older, except 368 that the court shall have exclusive jurisdiction over the following traffic offenses committed by 369 a minor under 18 years of age: 370 (a) Section 76-5-207, automobile homicide; 371 (b) Section 41-6-44, operating a vehicle while under the influence of alcohol or drugs; 372 (c) Section 41-6-45, reckless driving; 373 (d) Section 41-1a-1314, unauthorized control over a motor vehicle, trailer, or semitrailer 374 for an extended period of time; and 375 (e) Section 41-6-13.5, fleeing a peace officer. 376 (3) The court also has jurisdiction over traffic offenses that are part of a single criminal 377 episode filed in a petition that contains an offense over which the court has jurisdiction. 378 (4) The juvenile court has jurisdiction over questions of custody, support, and visitation 379 certified to it by the district court pursuant to Section 78-3a-105. 380 (5) The juvenile court has jurisdiction over an ungovernable or runaway minor who is 381 referred to it by the Division of Child and Family Services or by public or private agencies that 382
 - contract with the division to provide services to that minor where, despite earnest and persistent efforts by the division or agency, the minor has demonstrated that he: (a) is beyond the control of his parent, guardian, lawful custodian, or school authorities

to the extent that his behavior or condition endangers his own welfare or the welfare of others; or

(b) has run away from home.

383

384

385

386

387

388

- (6) This section does not restrict the right of access to the juvenile court by private agencies or other persons.
- 389 (7) The juvenile court has jurisdiction of all magistrate functions relative to cases arising 390 under Section 78-3a-602.