♣ Approved for Filing: MGT♣ 02-11-00 1:47 PM♣

1	JUDICIAL CONDUCT COMMISSION
2	AMENDMENTS AND SUPREME COURT
3	OVERSIGHT OF JUDGES
4	2000 GENERAL SESSION
5	STATE OF UTAH
6	Sponsor: David Ure
7	Katherine M. Bryson
8	AN ACT RELATING TO THE JUDICIARY; REVISING THE PROCESSES OF REVIEW OF
9	JUDGES BEFORE THE JUDICIAL CONDUCT COMMISSION AND THE SUPREME
10	COURT; REQUIRING THE COMMISSION TO REPORT A JUDGE'S CRIMINAL
11	MISCONDUCT DIRECTLY TO A PROSECUTOR FOR INVESTIGATION; MAKING
12	CERTAIN COMMISSION ORDERS PUBLIC; ALLOWING THE COMMISSION TO SHARE
13	INFORMATION WITH A CRIMINAL PROSECUTOR; AND MAKING TECHNICAL
14	CHANGES.
15	This act affects sections of Utah Code Annotated 1953 as follows:
16	AMENDS:
17	78-5-128, as last amended by Chapter 201, Laws of Utah 1995
18	ENACTS:
19	78-8-101 , Utah Code Annotated 1953
20	78-8-104 , Utah Code Annotated 1953
21	78-8-105 , Utah Code Annotated 1953
22	RENUMBERS AND AMENDS:
23	78-8-102, (Renumbered from 78-7-27, as last amended by Chapter 76, Laws of Utah 1998)
24	78-8-103, (Renumbered from 78-7-28, as last amended by Chapters 59 and 119, Laws of
25	Utah 1990)
26	78-8-106, (Renumbered from 78-7-29, as last amended by Chapter 59, Laws of Utah 1990)
27	78-8-107, (Renumbered from 78-7-30, as last amended by Chapters 10 and 237, Laws of

28	Utah	1997)
∠0	Otan	1////

- 78-8-108, (Renumbered from 78-7-31, as enacted by Chapter 8, Laws of Utah 1995, First Special Session)
- 31 Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:
- 32 Section 1. Section **78-5-128** is amended to read:

78-5-128. Determination of compensation and limits -- Salary survey -- Limits on secondary employment.

- (1) (a) Every justice court judge shall be paid a fixed compensation determined by the governing body of the respective municipality or county taking into consideration recommendations of the office of the state court administrator as provided in Subsection (2), but in no case may the salary for a justice court judge be an amount greater than 72% of the salary of a district court judge.
- (b) The compensation shall be comprised of a monthly salary and shall be computed upon the number of hours, days, or other periods of time that the justice court judge is to be available to perform all judicial functions.
- (2) (a) The state court administrator with the approval of the Judicial Council shall survey areas of the state relating to the functions and activities of the justice courts, taking into consideration the diverse economic factors of the various localities of the justice courts, and develop recommended monthly salaries. These recommendations shall be furnished to the governing bodies of the municipalities and the counties to assist them in determining salaries.
- (b) The state court administrator may make studies concerned with the economic as well as administrative feasibility to encourage the various political subdivisions to utilize the same person or persons to act as justice court judges for their several jurisdictions and to assist political subdivisions desiring to enter into agreements for that purpose.
- (3) A justice court judge may not appear as an attorney in any criminal matter in a federal, state, or justice court or appear as an attorney in any justice court or in any juvenile court case involving conduct which would be criminal if committed by an adult.
- (4) A justice court judge may not hold any office or employment including contracting for services in any justice agency of state government or any political subdivision of the state including law enforcement, prosecution, criminal defense, corrections, or court employment.
 - (5) A justice court judge may not hold any office in any political party or organization

59 engaged in any political activity or serve as an elected official in state government or any political 60 subdivision of the state. (6) A justice court judge may not own or be employed by any business entity which 61 62 regularly litigates in small claims court. (7) Any judge who violates this section [may be] is subject to removal by the Judicial 63 64 Conduct Commission under [Section 78-7-28] Title 78, Chapter 8, Judicial Conduct Commission. Section 2. Section **78-8-101** is enacted to read: 65 66 **78-8-101.** Definitions. 67 As used in this chapter: 68 (1) "Commission" means the Judicial Conduct Commission established by Utah 69 Constitution Article VIII, Section 13 and Section 78-8-102. 70 (2) (a) "Complaint" includes a formal written complaint against a judge. 71 (b) Complaint also includes the executive director of the commission's written statement 72 of the allegation based on reliable information received in any form, from any source, that alleges, 73 or from which a reasonable inference can be drawn that a judge is in violation of any provision of 74 Utah Constitution Article VIII, Section 13, if there is no written complaint from another person. (3) Except as more specifically provided in Subsections 78-8-104(1) and (2), "judge" 75 includes a justice of the Supreme Court, an appellate court judge, a district court judge, an active 76 77 senior judge, a juvenile court judge, a justice court judge, an active senior justice court judge, and 78 a judge pro tempore of any court of this state. Section 3. Section 78-8-102, which is renumbered from Section 78-7-27 is renumbered 79 80 and amended to read: 78-8-102. Judicial Conduct Commission -- Creation -- Members --81 [78-7-27]. 82 Terms -- Vacancies -- Voting -- Expenses. 83 (1) The membership of the Judicial Conduct Commission established by Article VIII, 84 Section 13 of the Utah Constitution consists of: 85 (a) two members of the House of Representatives to be appointed by the speaker of the House of Representatives for a two-year term, not more than one of whom may be of the same

two-year term, not more than one of whom may be of the same political party as the president;

(b) two members of the Senate to be appointed by the president of the Senate for a

86

87

88

89

political party as the speaker;

(c) three members from the board of commissioners of the Utah State Bar, who shall be appointed by the board of commissioners of the Utah State Bar for a four-year term;

- (d) two persons not members of the Utah State Bar, who shall be appointed by the governor, with the advice and consent of the Senate, for four-year terms, not more than one of whom may be of the same political party as the governor; and
- (e) one judge, and one alternate judge, of a trial court of record, to be selected by the nonjudicial members of the [Judicial Conduct] commission for four-year terms. The judge and the alternate judge shall coordinate attendance for meetings so that, if possible, at least one is in attendance at each meeting. If both judges are in attendance at a meeting, the alternate judge shall not be counted for quorum purposes nor vote on any issue before the commission.
- (2) The terms of the members shall be staggered so that approximately half of the commission expires every two years. The judges shall be appointed so that the terms expire in staggered two year increments.
- (3) If a judge serving on the commission is disqualified from participating in any proceeding, the [Judicial Conduct] commission shall select a substitute judge of a trial court of record.
- (4) The [Judicial Conduct] commission shall establish guidelines and procedures for the disqualification of any member from consideration of any matter.
- (5) (a) When a vacancy occurs in the membership for any reason, the replacement shall be appointed by the appointing authority for the unexpired term.
- (b) If the appointing authority fails to appoint a replacement, the commissioners who have been appointed may act as a commission under all the provisions of this section.
- (6) Six members of the commission shall constitute a quorum. Any action of a majority of the quorum constitutes the action of the commission.
- (7) (a) (i) Members who are not government employees shall receive no compensation or benefits for their services, but may receive per diem and expenses incurred in the performance of the member's official duties at the rates established by the Division of Finance under Sections 63A-3-106 and 63A-3-107.
 - (ii) Members may decline to receive per diem and expenses for their service.
- (b) (i) State government officer and employee members who do not receive salary, per diem, or expenses from their agency for their service may receive per diem and expenses incurred

121 in the performance of their official duties from the commission at the rates established by the 122 Division of Finance under Sections 63A-3-106 and 63A-3-107. 123 (ii) State government officer and employee members may decline to receive per diem and 124 expenses for their service. 125 (c) Legislators on the [committee] commission shall receive compensation and expenses 126 as provided [by law] in Section 36-2-2 and Legislative Joint Rule 15.03. 127 (d) (i) The chair shall be allowed the actual expenses of secretarial services, the expenses 128 of services for either a court reporter or a transcriber of electronic tape recordings, and other 129 necessary administrative expenses incurred in the performance of the duties of the commission. 130 (ii) The chair shall schedule all complaints to be heard by the commission and may not act 131 to dismiss any complaint without the approval of the commission. 132 (iii) The chair shall refer all policy matters to the commission. 133 (8) Upon a majority vote of the quorum, the commission may: 134 (a) employ a director, legal counsel, investigators, and other staff to assist the commission; 135 and 136 (b) incur other reasonable and necessary expenses within the authorized budget of the 137 commission and consistent with the duties of the commission. 138 Section 4. Section 78-8-103, which is renumbered from Section 78-7-28 is renumbered 139 and amended to read: 140 78-8-103. Grounds for reprimand, censure, suspension, removal, or [78-7-28]. 141 involuntary retirement of justice, judge, or justice court judge -- Suspension. 142 [(1) A justice, judge, or justice court judge of any court of this state in accordance with the 143 procedure prescribed in this section, may be removed from office, suspended, censured, 144 involuntarily retired, or publicly or privately reprimanded for:] 145 (1) The commission may issue an order, subject to the Supreme Court's review and 146 issuance of a final order implementing, rejecting, or modifying the commission's order, that any 147 judge be reprimanded, censured, suspended, removed from office, or involuntarily retired, for: 148 (a) action which constitutes willful misconduct in office: 149 (b) final conviction of a crime punishable as a felony under state or federal law;

(d) disability that seriously interferes with the performance of judicial duties; or

(c) willful and persistent failure to perform judicial duties;

150

(e) conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice which brings a judicial office into disrepute.

- (2) In addition to the reasons specified in Subsection (1), [justice court judges may be removed from office, suspended, censured, involuntarily retired, or publicly or privately reprimanded for failure] the Supreme Court shall order the reprimand, censure, suspension, removal, or involuntary retirement of any justice court judge who fails to obtain and maintain certification from the Judicial Council for attendance at required judicial training courses or [for failure] who fails to meet the minimum requirements for office, including residency. [(3) The Supreme Court on its own motion may]
- (3) (a) The Supreme Court may, on its own motion, suspend a [justice, judge, or justice court] judge from office without salary or compensation if [he pleads guilty, no contest to, or is found guilty] the judge is convicted of a crime punishable as a felony under state or federal law.
- (b) If [he] the judge is not convicted [or if the conviction is reversed, his] of the criminal charge, the suspension is terminated and [he] the judge shall be paid [his] the salary or compensation for the period of suspension.
 - Section 5. Section **78-8-104** is enacted to read:

78-8-104. Criminal investigation of a judge -- Administrative leave.

- (1) (a) If the commission, during the course of its investigation into an allegation of judicial misconduct, receives information upon which a reasonable person might conclude that a misdemeanor or felony under state or federal law has been committed by an appellate court judge, a district court judge, an active senior judge, a juvenile court judge, a justice court judge, an active senior justice court judge, or a judge pro tempore, the commission shall refer the allegation to the chief justice of the Supreme Court.
- (b) The chief justice of the Supreme Court may place the appellate court judge, district court judge, active senior judge, juvenile court judge, justice court judge, active senior justice court judge, or judge pro tempore on administrative leave with pay if the chief justice has a reasonable basis to believe that the alleged crime occurred, that the appellate court judge, district court judge, active senior judge, juvenile court judge, justice court judge, active senior justice court judge, or judge pro tempore committed the crime, and that crime was either a felony or a misdemeanor which conduct may be prejudicial to the administration of justice or which brings a judicial office into disrepute.

(2) (a) If the commission, during the course of its investigation into an allegation of
judicial misconduct, receives information upon which a reasonable person might conclude that a
misdemeanor or felony under state or federal law has been committed by the chief justice of the
Supreme Court, the commission shall refer the allegation to two justices of the Supreme Court.
(b) Two justices of the Supreme Court may place the chief justice of the Supreme Court
on administrative leave with pay if the two justices have a reasonable basis to believe that the
alleged crime occurred, that the chief justice committed the crime, and that crime was either a
felony or a misdemeanor which conduct may be prejudicial to the administration of justice or
which brings a judicial office into disrepute.
(3) If a judge is or has been criminally charged or indicted for a class A misdemeanor or
any felony under state or federal law and if the Supreme Court has not already acted under
Subsection (1) or (2), the appropriate member or members of the Supreme Court as provided in
Subsection (1) or (2), shall place the judge on administrative leave, with pay, pending the outcome
of the criminal proceeding.
(4) The chief justice of the Supreme Court or two justices of the Supreme Court who
ordered the judge on administrative leave with pay, shall order the reinstatement of the judge:
(a) if the prosecutor to whom the allegations are referred by the commission as required
under Section 78-8-107, determines no charge or indictment should be filed; or
(b) after final disposition of the criminal case, if the judge is not convicted of a criminal
charge.
Section 6. Section 78-8-105 is enacted to read:
78-8-105. Referral of attorney misconduct.
If the commission, during the course of its investigation into an allegation of judicial
misconduct, receives information upon which a reasonable person might conclude that a member
of the state bar has violated one of the Rules of Professional Conduct, the commission shall refer
that information about the attorney to the Utah State Bar.
Section 7. Section 78-8-106, which is renumbered from Section 78-7-29 is renumbered
and amended to read:
[78-7-29]. <u>78-8-106.</u> Involuntary disability retirement or removal of a judge.
(1) [A justice, judge, or justice court judge] The commission shall recommend and issue
an order for the removal or involuntary retirement of a judge of any court of this state, in

214	accordance with the procedure [prescribed] outlined in this [chapter] section, [may be retired] for
215	a disability that seriously [interfering] interferes with the performance of [his] the judge's judicial
216	duties and which is, or is likely to become, of a permanent character.
217	[Any justice, judge, or justice court judge desiring to retire on grounds of disability shall
218	certify to the commission his request for retirement and the nature of his disability.]
219	(2) The commission [may] shall order a medical examination and report.
220	[(2)] (3) [Action of the Judicial Conduct] The commission in [approving or disapproving
221	an application for disability retirement] recommending an order of involuntary retirement or
222	removal of a judge for a disability, shall [be based upon] base it on the evaluation and
223	recommendations submitted by one or more medical examiners or physicians, including an
224	examination of essential statements submitted by either bar or judicial associations or committees
225	certifying that:
226	(a) the [justice, judge, or justice court] judge is mentally or physically disabled and [totally
227	incapacitated for the further performance of his assigned job] this disability seriously interferes
228	with the performance of the judge's judicial duties; and
229	(b) [his] the judge's incapacity is likely to continue and be permanent and that [he] the
230	judge should be [retired] involuntarily retired or removed.
231	(4) (a) The Supreme Court shall review the commission's proceedings as to both law and
232	fact and may permit the introduction of additional evidence.
233	(b) After its review, the Supreme Court shall issue its order implementing, rejecting, or
234	modifying the commission's order.
235	Section 8. Section 78-8-107, which is renumbered from Section 78-7-30 is renumbered
236	and amended to read:
237	[78-7-30]. <u>78-8-107.</u> Authority of Judicial Conduct Commission Procedure for
238	reprimand, censure, removal, suspension, or involuntary retirement Disclosure of criminal
239	misconduct, orders made public.
240	(1) (a) The [Judicial Conduct] commission [is authorized to receive] shall receive and may
241	investigate any complaint [directly from the complainant] against a judge.
242	(b) (i) If the commission receives a complaint that alleges conduct that may be a

misdemeanor or felony under state or federal law, it shall, unless the allegation is plainly frivolous,

immediately refer the allegation of criminal misconduct and any information relevant to the

243

245	potential criminal violation to the local prosecuting attorney having jurisdiction to investigate and		
246	prosecute the crime.		
247	(ii) If the local prosecuting attorney receiving the allegation of criminal misconduct of a		
248	judge practices before that judge on a regular basis, or has a conflict of interest in investigating the		
249	crime, the local prosecuting attorney shall refer this allegation of criminal misconduct to another		
250	local or state prosecutor who would not have that same disability or conflict.		
251	(iii) The commission may concurrently proceed with its investigation of the complaint		
252	without waiting for the resolution of the criminal investigation by the prosecuting attorney.		
253	(2) [(a) After an] During the course of any investigation, the [Judicial Conduct]		
254	commission:		
255	(a) shall refer any information relating to the criminal conduct alleged and any evidence		
256	which relates to the allegation to which the judge has been accused, unless plainly frivolous, to the		
257	local prosecuting attorney as provided in Subsection (1)(b);		
258	(b) may order a [formal] hearing to be held concerning the [removal,] reprimand, censure,		
259	suspension, [censure, public reprimand] removal, or involuntary retirement of a [justice, judge, or		
260	justice court] judge[-];		
261	(c) may, with the written consent of the judge being investigated, resolve a complaint by		
262	issuing an informal order of reprimand which shall be disclosed to:		
263	(i) the person who filed the complaint;		
264	(ii) the judge who is the subject of the complaint;		
265	(iii) the Judicial Council for its use in the judicial recertification process;		
266	(iv) the Supreme Court for issuance of its final order as provided in Subsection (7); and		
267	(v) the person $\hat{\mathbf{h}}$ [or entity] $\hat{\mathbf{h}}$ who appointed the $\hat{\mathbf{h}}$ MUNICIPAL JUSTICE COURT $\hat{\mathbf{h}}$ judge:		
267a	<u>and</u>		
268	(d) may, with the written consent of the judge receiving the informal order of reprimand		
269	under Subsection (2)(c), publicly disclose the commission's informal order of reprimand.		
270	[(b)] (3) The commission shall provide the [justice or] judge with all information		
271	necessary to prepare an adequate response or defense, which may include the identity of the		
272	complainant.		
273	[(c)] (4) (a) A [formal] hearing may be conducted before a quorum of the commission.		
274	(b) Any finding or order shall be made upon a majority vote of the quorum.		
275	[(3) (a)] (5) Alternatively, the commission may appoint three special masters, who are		

- 9 -

[justices or] judges of courts of record, to hear and take evidence in the matter and to report to the commission.

- [(b)] (6) (a) After the [formal] hearing or after considering the record and report of the masters, if the commission finds good cause, it shall order the [removal,] reprimand, censure, suspension, [censure, reprimand] removal, or involuntary retirement of the [justice, judge, or justice court] judge.
 - (b) When a commission order is sent to the Supreme Court, it shall also be:
- 283 (i) publicly disclosed; and

- 284 (ii) sent to the person or entity who appointed the judge.
 - (c) Subsection (6)(b)(i) does not apply to a commission informal order of reprimand.
 - [(4) Rules and procedures in effect prior to July 1, 1996, are exempt from Title 63, Chapter 46a, Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act. On or after July 1, 1996, the commission shall make rules in accordance with Title 63, Chapter 46a, Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act, governing the issuance of private reprimands, including rules for disclosing the information to the Judicial Council. A private reprimand may be issued only if a formal hearing is not conducted regarding this matter.]
 - [5) (a) [7] [Prior to] Before the implementation of any commission order issued under [Subsection (1) or (2)] Subsections (2) and (6), the Supreme Court shall review the [record of the] commission's proceedings [on the] as to both law and [facts] fact and may permit the introduction of additional evidence. [The] After briefs have been submitted and any oral argument made, the Supreme Court shall [enter], within 90 days, issue its order implementing, rejecting, or modifying[5], or rejecting] the commission's order.
 - [(b) (i)] (8) (a) Upon an order for <u>involuntary</u> retirement, the [justice,] judge[, or justice court judge] shall retire with the same rights and privileges as if the [justice,] judge[, or justice court judge] retired pursuant to statute.
 - [(ii)] (b) Upon an order for removal, the [justice,] judge[, or justice court judge] shall be removed from office and his salary or compensation ceases from the date of the order.
 - [(iii)] (c) Upon an order for suspension from office, the [justice,] judge[, or justice court judge] may not perform any judicial functions and may not receive a salary for the period of suspension.
 - [(6)] (9) (a) The transmission, production, or disclosure of any complaints, papers, or

307	testimony in the course of proceedings before the [Judicial Conduct] commission, the masters
308	appointed under Subsection [(2)] (5), or the Supreme Court [are privileged] may not be introduced
309	in any civil action.
310	(b) The transmission, production, or disclosure of any complaints, papers, or testimony in
311	the course of proceedings before the commission or the masters appointed under Subsection (5)
312	may be introduced in any criminal action h, CONSISTENT WITH THE UTAH RULES OF
312a	EVIDENCE $\hat{\mathbf{h}}$. This information shall be shared with the prosecutor
313	conducting a criminal investigation or prosecution of a judge as provided in Subsections (1) and
314	<u>(2).</u>
315	(c) Complaints, papers, [or] testimony, or the record of the commission's confidential
316	hearing may not be disclosed by the commission, masters, or any court until the Supreme Court
317	has entered its final order in accordance with this section, except:
318	[(a)] (i) upon order of the Supreme Court;
319	[(b)] (ii) upon the request of the judge [or justice] who is the subject of the complaint; [or]
320	(iii) as provided in Subsection (9)(d); or
321	(iv) to aid in a criminal investigation or prosecution as provided in Subsections (1) and (2).
322	[(c)] (d) Upon the dismissal of a complaint or allegation against a judge [or justice], the
323	dismissal shall be disclosed without consent of the judge [or justice] to the person who filed the
324	complaint [or allegation].
325	[(7)] (10) [Rules and procedures in effect prior to July 1, 1996, are exempt from Title 63,
326	Chapter 46a, Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act, on or after July 1, 1996, the Judicial Conduct]
327	The commission shall make rules in accordance with Title 63, Chapter 46a, Utah Administrative
328	Rulemaking Act, outlining its procedures and the appointment of masters.
329	(11) A [justice, judge, or justice court] judge who is a member of the commission or the
330	Supreme Court may not participate in any proceedings involving the [justice's, judge's, or justice
331	court] judge's own removal or retirement.
332	[(8)] (12) Retirement for [disability or] involuntary retirement as provided [by Sections
333	78-7-28 through 78-7-30] in this chapter shall be processed through the Utah State Retirement
334	Office, and the judge retiring shall meet the requirements for retirement as specified in [Sections
335	78-7-28 through 78-7-30] this chapter.
336	Section 9. Section 78-8-108, which is renumbered from Section 78-7-31 is renumbered
337	and amended to read:

[78-7-31]. <u>78-8-108.</u> Subpoena power of the commission -- Testimony -- Contempt.

- (1) The [Judicial Conduct] commission may issue subpoenas in aid of an investigation of a complaint filed with the commission. The subpoena shall have the same authority as an order of the district court. Commission subpoenas shall be issued in the manner and form prescribed for subpoenas by the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure. Commission subpoenas shall be served in the manner prescribed for subpoenas by the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure.
- (2) The commission may administer oaths and compel testimony under oath in aid of an investigation of a complaint filed with the commission and at [formal] hearings before the commission.
- (3) If a person fails to comply with a subpoena, or if a person appears before the commission and refuses to testify to a matter upon which the person may be lawfully questioned, the person is in contempt of the commission, and the commission may file in the district court a motion for an order to show cause why the penalties established in Title 78, Chapter 32, Contempt, should not be imposed.

Legislative Review Note as of 2-9-00 12:23 PM

A limited legal review of this legislation raises no obvious constitutional or statutory concerns.

Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel