LEGISLATIVE GENERAL COUNSEL

S.J.R. 2

♣ Approved for Filing: MGT ♣
 ♣ 01-05-00 8:14 AM ♣

1	JOI	NT RULES - ETHICS PR	OCEDURE
2		AMENDMENTS	
3		2000 GENERAL SESSIO	DN
4		STATE OF UTAH	
5		Sponsor: L. Steven Poul	ton
6 7	Leonard M. Blackham Joseph L. Hull	Ed P. Mayne Terry R. Spencer	Michael G. Waddoups
8	A JOINT RESOLUTION OF	THE LEGISLATURE REVISIN	NG ETHICS COMMITTEE RULES
9	TO ALLOW A WAIVER OF	CERTAIN PROCEDURES; SE	PARATING THE DISCIPLINARY
10	PHASE OF AN ETHICS INC	UIRY FROM THE PRELIMIN	ARY INQUIRY PHASE WITH THE
11	SAME STANDARD OF PROOF IN A WAIVER; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.		
12	This resolution affects legislati	ve rules as follows:	
13	AMENDS:		
14	JR-16.04		
15	ENACTS:		
16	JR-16.07		
17	Be it resolved by the Legislati	ure of the state of Utah:	
18	Section 1. JR-16.04 is	s amended to read:	
19	JR-16.04. Rules of F	Procedure for the Senate and H	Iouse Ethics Committees.
20	In hearing and process	ing all complaints, these rules go	overn the procedures to be followed
21	by the Senate and House Ethic	es Committees:	
22	(1) (a) No information	received by the committees con	cerning any alleged violation shall
23	be disclosed to the public until	the member of the Senate or Ho	ouse charged in the violation has
24	received [the Statement of All	eged Violations] a Summary of t	he Preliminary Inquiry provided for
25	under Subsection (4).		
26	(b) No meetings of the	e committees shall be open to the	public except a disciplinary hearing
27	under [Subsection (6)] JR-16.	<u>07</u> .	

SJR002

S.J.R. 2

28 (2) (a) All complaints submitted to the committees shall be in writing. Each complaint 29 shall contain the following information: 30 (i) the name and address of the three Senators, if the respondent is a Senate member, or 31 three Representatives, if the respondent is a House member, who are filing the complaint, who 32 are the complainants; 33 (ii) the name and position or title of the person alleged to be in violation, who is the 34 respondent; 35 (iii) the nature of the alleged violation; 36 (iv) any facts alleged to support the complaint, and when facts are based upon the 37 information and belief of the complainants, the complaint shall state that and give the basis for the 38 information and belief; and 39 (v) all documents which support the complaint as an attachment to it. 40 (b) All complaints shall be filed directly with the President of the Senate, if the respondent 41 is a Senator, the Speaker of the House of Representatives, if the respondent is a Representative, 42 and with the appropriate ethics committee chairman. 43 (3) (a) Within five days after receipt of the complaint, the staff of the committees shall 44 examine each complaint to determine if it is in compliance with Subsection (2). If the complaint 45 is not in compliance, it shall be returned to the complainants with a copy of the legislative rules 46 on ethics. The complainants may resubmit the complaint. If the complaint is in compliance with 47 the rules, it shall be filed with the chairman and the co-chairman of the committee. 48 Every member of the committee shall be notified of the filing of the complaint and its 49 availability for inspection. 50 (b) Within 30 days after the complaint is filed, the chairman and co-chairman shall place 51 the complaint on the agenda for consideration at the next committee meeting with the 52 recommendation: 53 (i) that the complaint be considered; or 54 (ii) that the complaint be dismissed because it fails to allege facts which constitute a 55 violation. 56 (4) (a) At the next meeting of the committee, the committee shall determine whether the 57 alleged violation in the complaint is within the jurisdiction of the committee and whether the 58 complaint merits further inquiry. The complainants and respondent shall be notified, in writing,

S.J.R. 2

59 of the action taken by the committee. 60 (b) If the committee determines that further investigation into the matter is merited, the committee meeting shall become a preliminary inquiry to determine whether the violation 61 62 occurred. This preliminary inquiry is not open to the public. (c) The chairman and the Director of the Office of Legislative Research and General 63 64 Counsel may require, by subpoena or otherwise, the attendance and testimony of witnesses and the production of any materials the committee considers necessary to the inquiry. 65 66 (d) At the beginning of the preliminary inquiry, in order to expedite the committee's 67 investigation and to facilitate a proper resolution of the matter, the committee cochairs and the 68 respondent may agree in writing that the procedural requirements of JR-16.07 are waived. 69 $\left[\frac{d}{d}\right]$ (e) In the preliminary inquiry, the following rules apply: 70 (i) Scope of Preliminary Inquiry. The scope of the preliminary inquiry is limited to the 71 alleged violations stated in the complaint. 72 (ii) Attendance of Respondent or Others. 73 (A) During the testimony and evidentiary stage of the preliminary inquiry, the respondent 74 and his counsel may be present. (B) Only (Senate, House, or Joint) Ethics Committee members and its staff shall be present 75 76 during the other portions of the preliminary inquiry. 77 (iii) Evidence. Only relevant or material evidence is admissible in the hearing. The 78 chairman's determination of admissibility is final and may only be overruled by a majority vote of 79 the committee. 80 (iv) Record. A record shall be made which includes rulings of the chair, questions of the 81 committee and its staff, the testimony and responses of witnesses, sworn statements submitted to 82 the committee, relevant documents, and such other matters as the committee or its chairman may 83 direct. 84 Except for the official record, no camera or recording device may be brought in or used in 85 the preliminary inquiry. (v) Committee Chairman. 86 87 (A) The committee chairman is vested with the power to direct the committee in the 88 preliminary inquiry. 89 (B) If a committee member objects to a decision of the chair, that member may appeal the

S.J.R. 2

90 decision to the committee by stating: "I appeal the decision of the chair." This motion is

- 91 nondebatable. The chairman shall direct a roll call vote to determine if the committee membership
- 92 supports the decision of the chair. A majority vote of the committee is necessary to overrule the

93 decision of the chairman.

94

(C) The chairman may set time limitations on any part of the preliminary inquiry.

95 (vi) Testimony.

96 (A) At the direction of the committee chairman and co-chairman the committee may hear97 the testimony of the complainants, the respondent, and witnesses.

98

(B) If a witness desires, the witness shall be permitted to make a brief opening statement.

(C) Examination of a witness shall be under the direction of the committee chairman.
After the witness's presentation, committee members shall question the witness, after which the
respondent shall be given an opportunity to question the witness. Further examination by the
committee, committee staff, or the respondent shall be as directed by the committee chairman.

(D) The witness's disobedience to the chairman's direction to answer a question constitutes
 contempt. The chairman's direction may only be overruled by a vote of the majority of the
 committee members present.

106 The object of the Fifth Amendment privilege not to incriminate oneself is so no criminal 107 action will be prosecuted. If a witness cannot be prosecuted for the crime to which his testimony 108 relates, it is improper for the witness to invoke the privilege.

(E) The committee chairman shall direct each witness to furnish any relevant book, paper,affidavit, or other written evidence for the committee's consideration, which material the witness

111 has chosen to bring or the production of which has been required by subpoena duces tecum.

112 Unless overruled by a majority vote of the committee members present, disobedience to the

chairman's direction to produce such documents in response to a subpoena duces tecum constitutesa contempt.

115 (F) A witness may be allowed to insert in the record sworn written statements of 116 reasonable length relevant to the purpose, subject matter, and scope of the investigation.

117

(G) Unless otherwise directed by committee, all witnesses shall testify under oath.

118

(H) Legislative General Counsel shall administer the oath to each witness.

(vii) Response of Respondent. The respondent shall be given an opportunity to respond,orally or in writing, to the allegations stated in the complaint.

121 (viii) Advice of Counsel.

(A) Any witness testifying before the committee may have his counsel present.

(B) When the committee seeks factual testimony within the personal knowledge of the
witness, such testimony and answers should be given by the witness himself and not suggested to
the witness by counsel. Counsel for a witness should not advise the witness during the witness's
testimony, except when specifically requested by the witness.

(C) The participation of counsel at a hearing and while a witness is testifying is limited to
advising the witness of his legal rights. Counsel shall not be permitted to address the committee,
ask questions of any witness, or engage in oral arguments with the committee, but must confine
his activity exclusively to private conversations of legal advice to his client. Counsel's failure to
abide by these rules is grounds for counsel's exclusion from the preliminary inquiry.

(ix) Contempt. A majority of the members of the committee may compel obedience to the
requirements of the committee by way of contempt proceedings begun by application to a state
district court as to any person who:

135

122

(A) fails to comply with a subpoena or a subpoena duces tecum;

(B) refuses to answer a question relevant to the investigation which does not infringe onhis constitutional rights; or

(C) is guilty of contempt on any other grounds specified in statute or recognized atcommon law.

(x) Interested Persons. Upon consent of a majority of its members, the (Senate, House,
or Joint) Ethics Committee may permit any person, not compelled or invited, to appear and testify
at a hearing or submit a sworn written statement of facts or other documentary evidence for
incorporation into the record.

(xi) Subpoena Power. At the direction of a majority of the committee, the committee
chairman may direct staff to issue subpoenas to direct the attendance of witnesses and to issue
subpoena duces tecum to direct the production of documents.

(xii) Release of Testimony. The release of any testimony or other evidence presented at
a closed hearing and the form and manner of such release shall be by a majority vote of all
members of the committee. Committee members and its staff shall not publicly disclose any other
part of the preliminary inquiry.

151 (xiii) Continuance of Preliminary Inquiry. If a majority of the committee determines that

- 152 further evidence and testimony are necessary, they may adjourn and continue the preliminary
- 153 inquiry hearing to a future date, which date shall be established by a majority of the committee.
- 154 (xiv) Burden of Proof.

155 (A) If, at the conclusion of the preliminary inquiry <u>in which the procedural requirements</u> 156 <u>of JR-16.07 are not waived</u>, the committee determines, by a preponderance of the evidence, that 157 there is reason to believe the alleged violation of the Code of Official Conduct did occur, the 158 committee shall direct staff to prepare a Summary of the Preliminary Inquiry.

159 (B) If, at the conclusion of the preliminary inquiry in which the procedural requirements

160 of JR-16.07 are waived, the committee determines, by clear and convincing evidence, that there

161 is reason to believe the alleged violation of the Code of Official Conduct did occur, the committee

162 <u>shall direct staff to prepare a Summary of the Preliminary Inquiry.</u>

163 [(xv) Special Prosecutor. If an ethics probe goes beyond the preliminary inquiry stage, the
 164 Senate or House Ethics Committee shall direct the chairman to appoint a special prosecutor. This

165 special prosecutor shall be paid by the Senate if it is a Senate Ethics Committee or the House if

166 it is a House Ethics Committee. The special prosecutor shall prepare the Statement of Alleged

167 Violation from the summary prepared by the committee staff. The special prosecutor is also

168 responsible for prosecuting the respondent in the disciplinary hearing.]

[(xvi)] (xv) Voting. If the committee is unable to achieve a majority vote directing further
 proceedings against the respondent, this constitutes a dismissal of the complaint.

171 [(xvii)] (xvi) Announcement of Committee's Decision. At the conclusion of the

172 committee's deliberations in the preliminary inquiry, when a decision has been reached, the

respondent and his counsel shall be invited into the committee room to hear the committee's

174 decision, which shall be written as a Summary of the Preliminary Inquiry.

175 [(e)] (f) At the completion of the preliminary inquiry, the staff of the committee shall keep
176 a file containing a comprehensive summary of the inquiry.

177 [(f) If the committee determines that there is reason to believe the alleged violation did 178 occur, the committee shall direct the special prosecutor to transmit to the respondent and to the 179 complainants a copy of the Statement of Alleged Violation. The statement shall be divided into 180 counts. Each count shall allege a separate violation, and the facts which support each count.] 181 [(5) (a) The respondent has 30 days from receipt of the Statement of Alleged Violation to

182 respond. The response shall be in writing and shall be signed by the respondent or the respondent's

183	counsel. The response shall be limited to the following:]
184	[(i) an admission or denial of each count, under oath, with any supportive evidence or
185	relevant information;]
186	[(ii) an objection to any or all counts on the grounds that the count fails to state facts which
187	constitute a violation of the Code of Official Conduct or any law, rule, regulation, or other
188	standard of conduct applicable to a member of the Senate or House in the performance of
189	legislative responsibilities;]
190	[(iii) an objection to the jurisdiction of the committee considering the allegations contained
191	in the statement;]
192	[(iv) a motion for a more detailed statement regarding the cause of action stated in the
193	complaint; or]
194	[(v) an objection to the participation of any member of the committee, the committee's
195	staff, or the special prosecutor on the grounds that that person would be unable to render a fair and
196	impartial judgment or investigation. The committee, by majority vote, shall judge the
197	qualifications of the person against whom the objection is raised.]
198	[(b) The respondent's failure to submit a response to the Statement of Alleged Violation
199	or any count contained in it constitutes an admission of the alleged violation.]
200	[(c) Within 30 days after receipt of the respondent's response, the committee shall
201	determine, by majority vote, to:]
202	[(i) dismiss the complaint;]
203	[(ii) grant or deny the respondent's motion for a more detailed statement, and if this motion
204	is granted, direct the special prosecutor to give a more detail in the Statement of Alleged Violation
205	and give the respondent 30 days from receipt of this statement to respond as provided in Section
206	(5);]
207	[(iii) hold a disciplinary hearing; or]
208	[(iv) defer action, if a judicial proceeding is pending.]
209	[(d) If the committee is unable to achieve a majority vote directing further proceedings
210	against the respondent, this constitutes a dismissal of the statement. The respondent and
211	complainants shall be notified, in writing, of the action taken by the committee.]
212	[(e) The chairman may extend any time limitation, if the extension would facilitate a fair
213	and complete inquiry. The chairman may shorten any time limitation, if special circumstances

214	necessitate this being done.]
215	[(6) (a) Prior to any disciplinary hearing, the committee shall adopt a statement
216	establishing the scope and purpose of the hearing. A copy of this statement shall be furnished to
217	all witnesses. The scope and purpose may expand or contract during the hearing, depending upon
218	evidence received. The respondent has the right to counsel during all stages of the disciplinary
219	hearing.]
220	[(b) The disciplinary hearing is open to the public and consists of two phases. Phase I is
221	to determine whether or not the counts in the statement have been proved. This phase shall be
222	conducted as follows:]
223	[(i) The meeting shall be opened by the chairman. He shall give a statement of the
224	committee's authority to conduct the hearing and the purpose and scope of the hearing.]
225	[(ii) Witnesses and evidence shall be received in the following order whenever possible:]
226	[(A) witnesses and evidence offered by the special prosecutor;]
227	[(B) witnesses and evidence offered by the respondent;]
228	[(C) rebuttal witnesses.]
229	[(iii) All witnesses shall testify under oath. Witnesses offered by the special prosecutor
230	at a hearing shall be examined first by the special prosecutor. The respondent or respondent's
231	counsel may then cross-examine the witnesses. The committee members and committee staff may
232	then question the witnesses. Redirect and recross examination may be permitted in the chairman's
233	discretion. Witnesses offered by the respondent shall be examined first by the respondent or
234	respondent's counsel, and then may be cross-examined by the special prosecutor. Committee
235	members and committee staff may then question the witness. Redirect and recross examination
236	may be permitted in the chairman's discretion.]
237	[(iv) At a disciplinary hearing, the burden of proof rests upon the special prosecutor to
238	establish the facts clearly and convincingly by the evidence they introduce.]
239	[(c) Phase II of a disciplinary hearing is to]
240	(5) (a) After the announcement of the committee's decision in the Summary of the
241	Preliminary Inquiry, if the procedural requirements of JR-16.07 have been waived as provided in
242	Subsection (4)(d), the committee shall determine what recommendation should be made to the
243	Senate or House with respect to any count which has been proved. The committee shall hear no
244	further testimony during [Phase II] the preliminary inquiry, except by a majority vote of the

S.J.R. 2

245 committee. 246 [(d)] (b) A count is not proved unless a majority of the committee so determine by vote. 247 A count which is not proved shall be dismissed. If a majority of the committee does not vote that 248 a count has been proved, a motion to reconsider that vote may only be made by a member of the 249 committee who voted that the count was not proved. 250 [(7)] (6) (a) The committee may, for any count that has been voted as proved, recommend 251 one or more of the following actions: 252 (i) censure; 253 (ii) expulsion; 254 (iii) denial or limitation of any right, power, or privilege of the respondent, if under the 255 Utah Constitution the Senate or House may impose such denial or limitation, and if the violation 256 bears upon the exercise or holding of any right, power, or privilege; or 257 (iv) any other action the committee determines appropriate. 258 (b) If a majority of the committee does not vote in favor of the recommendation for action, 259 a motion to reconsider may only be made by a member of the committee who voted against the 260 recommendation. 261 (c) The committee's recommendation to the Senate or House shall be submitted in writing 262 and shall contain a brief but complete statement of the evidence which supports their 263 recommendations. [(8)] (7) The Senate or House shall consider the recommendations of the committee and 264 265 shall, by a majority vote of that house, either accept, dismiss, or alter these recommendations. If 266 the committee's recommendations are for expulsion of a Senator or Representative, acceptance 267 of this recommendation requires a two-thirds vote of all the members elected to the Senate or to 268 the House. Section 2. Section JR-16.07 is enacted to read: 269 270 JR-16.07. Disciplinary Hearing. 271 (1) If there is no waiver of the disciplinary hearing as provided in JR-16.04(4)(d), the 272 Senate and House Ethics Committees shall follow these procedures at the conclusion of the 273 preliminary inquiry. 274 (2) Special Prosecutor. If an ethics probe goes into a disciplinary hearing stage, the Senate or House Ethics Committee shall direct the chairman to appoint a special prosecutor. This special 275

276	prosecutor shall be paid by the Senate if it is a Senate Ethics Committee or the House if it is a	
277	House Ethics Committee. The special prosecutor shall prepare the Statement of Alleged Violation	
278	from the Summary of Preliminary Inquiry. The special prosecutor is also responsible for	
279	prosecuting the respondent in the disciplinary hearing.	
280	(3) If the committee determines that there is reason to believe the alleged violation did	
281	occur, the committee shall direct the special prosecutor to transmit to the respondent and to the	
282	complainants a copy of the Statement of Alleged Violation. The statement shall be divided into	
283	counts. Each count shall allege a separate violation, and the facts which support each count.	
284	(4) (a) The respondent has 30 days from receipt of the Statement of Alleged Violation to	
285	respond. The response shall be in writing and shall be signed by the respondent or the respondent's	
286	counsel. The response shall be limited to the following:	
287	(i) an admission or denial of each count, under oath, with any supportive evidence or	
288	relevant information;	
289	(ii) an objection to any or all counts on the grounds that the count fails to state facts which	
290	constitute a violation of the Code of Official Conduct or any law, rule, regulation, or other	
291	standard of conduct applicable to a member of the Senate or House in the performance of	
292	legislative responsibilities;	
293	(iii) an objection to the jurisdiction of the committee considering the allegations contained	
294	in the statement;	
295	(iv) a motion for a more detailed statement regarding the cause of action stated in the	
296	complaint; or	
297	(v) an objection to the participation of any member of the committee, the committee's staff,	
298	or the special prosecutor on the grounds that that person would be unable to render a fair and	
299	impartial judgment or investigation. The committee, by majority vote, shall judge the	
300	qualifications of the person against whom the objection is raised.	
301	(b) The respondent's failure to submit a response to the Statement of Alleged Violation or	
302	any count contained in it constitutes an admission of the alleged violation.	
303	(c) Within 30 days after receipt of the respondent's response or the respondent's failure to	
304	respond within that time, the committee shall determine, by majority vote, to:	
305	(i) dismiss the complaint;	
306	(ii) grant or deny the respondent's motion for a more detailed statement, and if this motion	

307	is granted, direct the special prosecutor to give more detail in the Statement of Alleged Violation
308	and give the respondent 30 days from receipt of this statement to respond as provided in
309	Subsection (4)(a);
310	(iii) hold a disciplinary hearing; or
311	(iv) defer action, if a judicial proceeding is pending.
312	(d) If the committee is unable to achieve a majority vote directing further proceedings
313	against the respondent, this constitutes a dismissal of the statement and of the complaint. The
314	respondent and complainants shall be notified, in writing, of the action taken by the committee.
315	(e) The chairman may extend any time limitation, if the extension would facilitate a fair
316	and complete inquiry. The chairman may shorten any time limitation, if special circumstances
317	necessitate this being done.
318	(5) (a) Prior to any disciplinary hearing, the committee shall adopt a statement establishing
319	the scope and purpose of the hearing. A copy of this statement shall be furnished to all witnesses.
320	The scope and purpose may expand or contract during the hearing, depending upon evidence
321	received. The respondent has the right to counsel during all stages of the disciplinary hearing.
322	(b) The disciplinary hearing is open to the public and consists of two phases. Phase I is
323	to determine whether or not the counts in the Statement of Alleged Violation have been proved.
324	This phase shall be conducted as follows:
325	(i) The meeting shall be opened by the chair. The chair shall give a statement of the
326	committee's authority to conduct the hearing and the purpose and scope of the hearing.
327	(ii) Witnesses and evidence shall be received in the following order whenever possible:
328	(A) witnesses and evidence offered by the special prosecutor;
329	(B) witnesses and evidence offered by the respondent; and
330	(C) rebuttal witnesses.
331	(iii) All witnesses shall testify under oath. Witnesses offered by the special prosecutor
332	at a hearing shall be examined first by the special prosecutor. The respondent or respondent's
333	counsel may then cross-examine the witnesses. The committee members and committee staff may
334	then question the witnesses. Redirect and recross examination may be permitted in the chairman's
335	discretion. Witnesses offered by the respondent shall be examined first by the respondent or
336	respondent's counsel, and then may be cross-examined by the special prosecutor. Committee
337	members and committee staff may then question the witness. Redirect and recross examination

338	may be permitted in the chairman's discretion.
339	(iv) At a disciplinary hearing, the burden of proof rests upon the special prosecutor to
340	establish the facts clearly and convincingly by the evidence introduced.
341	(c) Phase II of a disciplinary hearing is to determine what recommendation should be made
342	to the Senate or House with respect to any count which has been proved. The committee shall hear
343	no further testimony during Phase II except by a majority vote of the committee.
344	(d) A count is not proved unless a majority of the committee so determine by vote. A
345	count which is not proved shall be dismissed. If a majority of the committee does not vote that a
346	count has been proved, a motion to reconsider that vote may only be made by a member of the
347	committee who voted that the count was not proved.
348	(6) Announcement of Committee's Decision. At the conclusion of the committee's
349	deliberations in the disciplinary hearing, when a decision has been reached, the respondent and his
350	counsel shall be invited into the committee room to hear the committee's decision.
351	(7) At the completion of the disciplinary hearing, the staff of the committee shall keep a
352	file containing a comprehensive summary of the disciplinary hearing.
353	(8) (a) The committee may, as provided in Phase II of the disciplinary hearing, for any
354	count that has been voted as proved, recommend one or more of the following actions:
355	(i) censure;
356	(ii) expulsion;
357	(iii) denial or limitation of any right, power, or privilege of the respondent, if under the
358	Utah Constitution the Senate or House may impose such denial or limitation, and if the violation
359	bears upon the exercise or holding of any right, power, or privilege; or
360	(iv) any other action the committee determines appropriate.
361	(b) If a majority of the committee does not vote in favor of the recommendation for action,
362	a motion to reconsider may only be made by a member of the committee who voted against the
363	recommendation.
364	(c) The committee's recommendation to the Senate or House shall be submitted in writing
365	and shall contain a brief but complete statement of the evidence which supports their
366	recommendations.
367	(9) The Senate or House shall consider the recommendations of the committee and shall,
368	by a majority vote of that house, either accept, dismiss, or alter these recommendations. If the

- 369 <u>committee's recommendations are for expulsion of a Senator or Representative, acceptance of this</u>
 370 recommendation requires a two-thirds vote of all the members elected to the Senate or to the
- 371 <u>House.</u>
- 372 Section 3. Effective date.
- 373 This resolution takes effect upon approval by a constitutional majority vote of all members
- 374 of the Senate and House of Representatives.

Legislative Review Note as of 12-10-99 3:12 PM

A limited legal review of this legislation raises no obvious constitutional or statutory concerns.

Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel