1	HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
2	AMENDMENTS
3	2003 GENERAL SESSION
4	STATE OF UTAH
5	Sponsor: J. Morgan Philpot
6	This act modifies personnel management procedures for processing career service
7	employee grievances. The act makes certain technical changes and has a July 1, 2003
8	effective date.
9	This act affects sections of Utah Code Annotated 1953 as follows:
10	AMENDS:
11	67-19a-303, as last amended by Chapter 204, Laws of Utah 1991
12	67-19a-401, as last amended by Chapter 21, Laws of Utah 1999
13	67-19a-406, as last amended by Chapter 79, Laws of Utah 1996
14	67-19a-407, as enacted by Chapter 191, Laws of Utah 1989
15	78-2-2, as last amended by Chapter 302, Laws of Utah 2001
16	78-2a-3, as last amended by Chapters 255 and 302, Laws of Utah 2001
17	REPEALS:
18	67-19a-408, as last amended by Chapter 79, Laws of Utah 1996
19	Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:
20	Section 1. Section 67-19a-303 is amended to read:
21	67-19a-303. Employees' rights in grievance and appeals procedure.
22	(1) For the purpose of processing a grievance, a career service employee may:
23	(a) obtain assistance by a representative of the employee's choice to act as an advocate
24	at any level of the grievance procedure;
25	(b) request a reasonable amount of time during work hours to confer with the
26	representative and prepare the grievance; [and]
27	(c) call other employees as witnesses at a grievance hearing[-]; and



H.B. 289 02-24-03 3:52 PM

28 (d) obtain discovery in accordance with the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure at the 29 evidentiary hearing stage of the grievance process. 30 (2) The state shall allow employees to attend and testify at the grievance hearing as witnesses if the employee has given reasonable advance notice to his immediate supervisor. 31 32 (3) No person may take any reprisals against any career service employee for use of 33 grievance procedures specified in this chapter. 34 (4) (a) The employing agency of an employee who files a grievance may not place 35 grievance forms, grievance materials, correspondence about the grievance, agency and department replies to the grievance, or other documents relating to the grievance in the 36 37 employee's personnel file. 38 (b) The employing agency of an employee who files a grievance may place records of 39 disciplinary action in the employee's personnel file. 40 (c) If any disciplinary action against an employee is rescinded through the grievance 41 procedures established in this chapter, the agency and the Department of Human Resource 42 Management shall remove the record of the disciplinary action from the employee's agency 43 personnel file and central personnel file. 44 (d) An agency may maintain a separate grievance file relating to an employee's 45 grievance, but shall discard the file after three years. 46 Section 2. Section **67-19a-401** is amended to read: 47 67-19a-401. Time limits for submission of appeal by aggrieved employee --48 Voluntary termination of employment -- Group grievances. 49 (1) Subject to the standing requirements contained in Part 3 and the restrictions 50 contained in this part, a career service employee may have a grievance addressed by following 51 the procedures specified in this part. 52 (2) The employee and the person to whom the grievance is directed may agree in 53 writing to waive or extend grievance steps 2, 3, or 4 or the time limits specified for those

grievance steps, as outlined in Section 67-19a-402. (3) Any writing made pursuant to Subsection (2) must be submitted to the

54

55

56

57

58

- administrator.
- (4) (a) Unless the employee meets the requirements for excusable neglect established by rule, if the employee fails to process the grievance to the next step within the time limits

02-24-03 3:52 PM H.B. 289

established in this part, he has waived his right to process the grievance or to obtain judicial review of the grievance.

- (b) Unless the employee meets the requirements for excusable neglect established by rule, if the employee fails to process the grievance to the next step within the time limits established in this part, the grievance is considered to be settled based on the decision made at the last step.
- (5) (a) Unless the employee meets the requirements for excusable neglect established by rule, an employee may submit a grievance for review under this chapter only if the employee submits the grievance:
 - (i) within 20 working days after the event giving rise to the grievance; or
- (ii) within 20 working days after the employee has knowledge of the event giving rise to the grievance.
- (b) Notwithstanding Subsection (5)(a), an employee may not submit a grievance more than one year after the event giving rise to the grievance.
- (6) A person who has voluntarily terminated his employment with the state may not submit a grievance after he has terminated his employment.
- (7) (a) When several employees allege the same grievance, they may submit a group grievance by following the procedures and requirements of this chapter.
 - (b) In submitting a group grievance, each aggrieved employee shall sign the complaint.
- (c) The administrator [and board] may not treat a group grievance as a class action, but may select one aggrieved employee's grievance and address that grievance as a test case.
 - Section 3. Section **67-19a-406** is amended to read:
- 67-19a-406. Procedural steps to be followed by aggrieved employee -- Hearing before hearing officer -- Evidentiary and procedural rules.
- (1) (a) The administrator shall employ a certified court reporter to record the hearing and prepare an official transcript of the hearing.
- (b) The official transcript of the proceedings and all exhibits, briefs, motions, and pleadings received by the hearing officer are the official record of the proceeding.
- (2) (a) The agency has the burden of proof in all grievances resulting from dismissals, demotions, suspensions, written reprimands, reductions in force, and disputes concerning abandonment of position.

H.B. 289 02-24-03 3:52 PM

90	(b) The employee has the burden of proof in all other grievances.
91	(c) The party with the burden of proof must prove their case by [substantial] \underline{a}
92	preponderance of the evidence standard.
93	(3) (a) The hearing officer shall issue a written decision within 20 working days after
94	the hearing is adjourned.
95	[(b) If the hearing officer does not issue a decision within 20 working days, the agency
96	that is a party to the grievance is not liable for any claimed back wages or benefits after the date
97	the decision is due.]
98	(b) The hearing officer's decision is considered the final decision of the Career Service
99	Review Board.
100	(4) The hearing officer may:
101	(a) [not] award attorneys' fees [or costs] to [either party] any career service employee
102	who prevails in a grievance;
103	(b) close a hearing by complying with the procedures and requirements of Title 52,
104	Chapter 4, Open and Public Meetings;
105	(c) seal the file and the evidence produced at the hearing if the evidence raises
106	questions about an employee's character, professional competence, or physical or mental
107	health;
108	(d) grant continuances according to board rule; and
109	(e) decide questions or disputes concerning standing in accordance with Section
110	67-19a-301.
111	Section 4. Section 67-19a-407 is amended to read:
112	67-19a-407. Appeal to Utah Supreme Court.
113	[(1) (a)] The employee or the agency may appeal the hearing officer's decision on a
114	grievance to the [board if:] <u>Utah Supreme Court.</u>
115	[(i) the appealing party files a notice of appeal with the administrator within ten
116	working days after the receipt of the decision or the expiration of the period for decision,
117	whichever is first; and]
118	[(ii) the appealing party meets the requirements for appeal established in Subsection
119	(2).]
120	[(b) The appealing party shall submit a copy of the official transcript of the hearing to

02-24-03 3:52 PM H.B. 289

121	the administrator.]
122	[(2) The employee or the agency may appeal the hearing officer's decision on a
123	grievance to the board only if the appealing party alleges that:
124	[(a) the hearing officer did not issue a decision within 20 working days after the
125	hearing adjourned;]
126	[(b) the appealing party is dissatisfied with the decision;]
127	[(c) the appealing party believes that the decision was based upon an incorrect or
128	arbitrary interpretation of the facts; or]
129	[(d) the appealing party believes that the hearing officer made an erroneous conclusion
130	of law.]
131	Section 5. Section 78-2-2 is amended to read:
132	78-2-2. Supreme Court jurisdiction.
133	(1) The Supreme Court has original jurisdiction to answer questions of state law
134	certified by a court of the United States.
135	(2) The Supreme Court has original jurisdiction to issue all extraordinary writs and
136	authority to issue all writs and process necessary to carry into effect its orders, judgments, and
137	decrees or in aid of its jurisdiction.
138	(3) The Supreme Court has appellate jurisdiction, including jurisdiction of
139	interlocutory appeals, over:
140	(a) a judgment of the Court of Appeals;
141	(b) cases certified to the Supreme Court by the Court of Appeals prior to final
142	judgment by the Court of Appeals;
143	(c) discipline of lawyers;
144	(d) final orders of the Judicial Conduct Commission;
145	(e) final orders and decrees in formal adjudicative proceedings originating with:
146	(i) the Public Service Commission;
147	(ii) the State Tax Commission;
148	(iii) the School and Institutional Trust Lands Board of Trustees;
149	(iv) the Board of Oil, Gas, and Mining;
150	(v) the state engineer; [or]
151	(vi) the executive director of the Department of Natural Resources reviewing actions of

H.B. 289 02-24-03 3:52 PM

152	the Division of Forestry, Fire and State Lands; or
153	(vii) the Career Service Review Board;
154	(f) final orders and decrees of the district court review of informal adjudicative
155	proceedings of agencies under Subsection (3)(e);
156	(g) a final judgment or decree of any court of record holding a statute of the United
157	States or this state unconstitutional on its face under the Constitution of the United States or the
158	Utah Constitution;
159	(h) interlocutory appeals from any court of record involving a charge of a first degree
160	or capital felony;
161	(i) appeals from the district court involving a conviction or charge of a first degree
162	felony or capital felony;
163	(j) orders, judgments, and decrees of any court of record over which the Court of
164	Appeals does not have original appellate jurisdiction; and
165	(k) appeals from the district court of orders, judgments, or decrees ruling on legislative
166	subpoenas.
167	(4) The Supreme Court may transfer to the Court of Appeals any of the matters over
168	which the Supreme Court has original appellate jurisdiction, except:
169	(a) capital felony convictions or an appeal of an interlocutory order of a court of record
170	involving a charge of a capital felony;
171	(b) election and voting contests;
172	(c) reapportionment of election districts;
173	(d) retention or removal of public officers;
174	(e) matters involving legislative subpoenas; and
175	(f) those matters described in Subsections (3)(a) through (d).
176	(5) The Supreme Court has sole discretion in granting or denying a petition for writ of
177	certiorari for the review of a Court of Appeals adjudication, but the Supreme Court shall
178	review those cases certified to it by the Court of Appeals under Subsection (3)(b).
179	(6) The Supreme Court shall comply with the requirements of Title 63, Chapter 46b,
180	Administrative Procedures Act, in its review of agency adjudicative proceedings.
181	Section 6. Section 78-2a-3 is amended to read:
182	78-2a-3. Court of Appeals jurisdiction.

02-24-03 3:52 PM H.B. 289

183 (1) The Court of Appeals has jurisdiction to issue all extraordinary writs and to issue 184 all writs and process necessary: 185 (a) to carry into effect its judgments, orders, and decrees; or 186 (b) in aid of its jurisdiction. 187 (2) The Court of Appeals has appellate jurisdiction, including jurisdiction of 188 interlocutory appeals, over: 189 (a) the final orders and decrees resulting from formal adjudicative proceedings of state 190 agencies or appeals from the district court review of informal adjudicative proceedings of the 191 agencies, except the Public Service Commission, State Tax Commission, School and 192 Institutional Trust Lands Board of Trustees, Division of Forestry, Fire and State Lands actions 193 reviewed by the executive director of the Department of Natural Resources, Board of Oil, Gas, 194 and Mining, [and] the state engineer, and the Career Service Review Board; 195 (b) appeals from the district court review of: 196 (i) adjudicative proceedings of agencies of political subdivisions of the state or other 197 local agencies; and 198 (ii) a challenge to agency action under Section 63-46a-12.1; 199 (c) appeals from the juvenile courts; 200 (d) interlocutory appeals from any court of record in criminal cases, except those 201 involving a charge of a first degree or capital felony; 202 (e) appeals from a court of record in criminal cases, except those involving a 203 conviction or charge of a first degree felony or capital felony; 204 (f) appeals from orders on petitions for extraordinary writs sought by persons who are 205 incarcerated or serving any other criminal sentence, except petitions constituting a challenge to 206 a conviction of or the sentence for a first degree or capital felony; 207 (g) appeals from the orders on petitions for extraordinary writs challenging the 208 decisions of the Board of Pardons and Parole except in cases involving a first degree or capital 209 felony; 210 (h) appeals from district court involving domestic relations cases, including, but not 211 limited to, divorce, annulment, property division, child custody, support, parent-time,

212

213

visitation, adoption, and paternity;

(i) appeals from the Utah Military Court; and

214 (i) cases transferred to the Court of Appeals from the Supreme Court. 215 (3) The Court of Appeals upon its own motion only and by the vote of four judges of 216 the court may certify to the Supreme Court for original appellate review and determination any 217 matter over which the Court of Appeals has original appellate jurisdiction. 218 (4) The Court of Appeals shall comply with the requirements of Title 63, Chapter 46b, 219 Administrative Procedures Act, in its review of agency adjudicative proceedings. Section 7. Repealer. 220 221 This act repeals: 222 Section 67-19a-408, Career Service Review Board hearing -- Evidentiary and 223 procedural rules. 224 Section 8. Effective date.

Legislative Review Note as of 2-20-03 8:39 AM

This act takes effect on July 1, 2003.

H.B. 289

225

A limited legal review of this legislation raises no obvious constitutional or statutory concerns.

Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel

02-24-03 3:52 PM

- 8 -

25-Feb-03 7:36 PM

State Impact

If the discovery provisions of the bill occur at the Executive Director level there could be significant costs to the state. To the extent that discovery occurs at the Career Service Review Board level costs would be minimal. There are also potential attorney fees that state agencies may have to pay associated with the provisions of the bill.

Individual and Business Impact

No significant fiscal impact.

Office of the Legislative Fiscal Analyst