

Senator Lyle W. Hillyard proposes the following substitute bill:

JUSTICE COURT AMENDMENTS

2008 GENERAL SESSION

STATE OF UTAH

Chief Sponsor: Lyle W. Hillyard

House Sponsor: Kay L. McIff

LONG TITLE

General Description:

This bill modifies the selection and retention of justice court judges, and makes other changes.

Highlighted Provisions:

This bill:

- ▶ provides for a performance evaluation and retention process for all justice court judges;
- ▶ amends the jurisdiction of the District Court;
- ▶ specifies compensation for justice court judges; and
- ▶ creates a county-wide judicial nominating commission to fill vacancies in justice courts.

Monies Appropriated in this Bill:

None

Other Special Clauses:

This bill takes effect on January 1, 2009.

Utah Code Sections Affected:

AMENDS:

20A-12-201, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2001, Chapter 308



26 78A-5-102, as renumbered and amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 3

27 78A-7-201, as renumbered and amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 3

28 78A-7-203, as renumbered and amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 3

29 78A-7-206, as renumbered and amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 3

30 78A-7-213, as renumbered and amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 3

31 REPEALS AND REENACTS:

32 78A-7-202, as renumbered and amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 3



34 *Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:*

35 Section 1. Section 20A-12-201 is amended to read:

36 **20A-12-201. Judicial appointees -- Retention elections.**

37 (1) (a) Each judicial appointee to a court [~~of record~~] is subject to an unopposed
38 retention election at the first general election held more than three years after the judge or
39 justice was appointed.

40 (b) After the first retention election:

41 (i) each Supreme Court justice shall be on the regular general election ballot for an
42 unopposed retention election every tenth year; and

43 (ii) each judge of other courts [~~of record~~] shall be on the regular general election ballot
44 for an unopposed retention election every sixth year.

45 (2) (a) Each justice or judge [~~of a court of record~~] who wishes to retain office shall, in
46 the year the justice or judge is subject to a retention election:

47 (i) file a declaration of candidacy as if a candidate for multi-county office in
48 accordance with Section 20A-9-202; and

49 (ii) pay a filing fee of \$50.

50 (b) Each [~~county~~] justice court judge who wishes to retain office shall, in the year the
51 justice [~~or~~] court judge is subject to a retention election:

52 (i) file a declaration of candidacy as if a candidate for county office in accordance with
53 Section 20A-9-202; and

54 (ii) pay a filing fee of \$25.

55 (3) (a) The lieutenant governor shall, by September 1 of each regular general election
56 year:

57 (i) transmit a certified list containing the names of the justices of the Supreme Court
58 and judges of the Court of Appeals declaring their candidacy to the county clerk of each
59 county; and

60 (ii) transmit a certified list containing the names of judges of other courts declaring
61 their candidacy to the county clerk of each county in the geographic division in which the judge
62 filing the declaration holds office.

63 (b) Each county clerk shall place the names of justices and judges standing for
64 retention election in the nonpartisan section of the ballot.

65 (4) At the general election, the ballots shall contain, as to each justice or judge of any
66 court to be voted on in the county, the following question:

67 "Shall _____(name of justice or judge) be retained in the
68 office of _____?" (name of office, such as "Justice of the Supreme
69 Court of Utah"; "Judge of the Court of Appeals of Utah"; "Judge of the District Court of the
70 Third Judicial District;" "Judge of the Juvenile Court of the Fourth Juvenile Court District";
71 "[County] Justice Court Judge of (name of county) County or (name of municipality)")

72 Yes ()

73 No ()."

74 (5) (a) If the justice or judge receives more yes votes than no votes, the justice or judge
75 is retained for the term of office provided by law.

76 (b) If the justice or judge does not receive more yes votes than no votes, the justice or
77 judge is not retained, and a vacancy exists in the office on the first Monday in January after the
78 regular general election.

79 (6) A justice or judge not retained is ineligible for appointment to the office for which
80 the justice or judge was defeated until after the expiration of that term of office.

81 Section 2. Section **78A-5-102** is amended to read:

82 **78A-5-102. Jurisdiction -- Appeals.**

83 (1) The district court has original jurisdiction in all matters civil and criminal, not
84 excepted in the Utah Constitution and not prohibited by law.

85 (2) The district court judges may issue all extraordinary writs and other writs necessary
86 to carry into effect their orders, judgments, and decrees.

87 (3) The district court has jurisdiction over matters of lawyer discipline consistent with

88 the rules of the Supreme Court.

89 (4) The district court has jurisdiction over all matters properly filed in the circuit court
90 prior to July 1, 1996.

91 (5) The district court has appellate jurisdiction to adjudicate trials de novo of the
92 judgments of the justice court and of the small claims department of the district court.

93 (6) Appeals from the final orders, judgments, and decrees of the district court are under
94 Sections 78A-3-102 and 78A-4-103.

95 (7) The district court has jurisdiction to review:

96 (a) agency adjudicative proceedings as set forth in Title 63, Chapter 46b,
97 Administrative Procedures Act, and shall comply with the requirements of that chapter, in its
98 review of agency adjudicative proceedings; and

99 (b) municipal administrative proceedings in accordance with Section 10-3-703.7.

100 (8) Notwithstanding Subsection (1), the district court has subject matter jurisdiction in
101 class B misdemeanors, class C misdemeanors, infractions, and violations of ordinances only if:

102 (a) there is no justice court with territorial jurisdiction;

103 (b) the offense occurred within the boundaries of the municipality in which the district
104 courthouse is located and that municipality has not formed, or formed and then dissolved, a
105 justice court; or

106 (c) they are included in an indictment or information covering a single criminal episode
107 alleging the commission of a felony or a class A misdemeanor.

108 (9) The district court has jurisdiction of actions under Title 78B, Chapter 7, Part 2,
109 Child Protective Orders, if the juvenile court transfers the case to the district court.

110 Section 3. Section **78A-7-201** is amended to read:

111 **78A-7-201. Justice court judge eligibility -- Mandatory retirement -- Service after**
112 **retirement.**

113 (1) A [~~county~~] justice court judge shall be:

114 (a) a citizen of the United States;

115 (b) 25 years of age or older;

116 (c) a resident of Utah for at least three years immediately preceding his appointment;

117 (d) a resident of the [~~precinct for~~] county in which [chosen] the court is located or an
118 adjacent county for at least six months immediately preceding appointment; and

119 (e) a qualified voter of the [~~precinct for~~] county in which [~~chosen~~] the judge resides.

120 [~~(2) A municipal justice court judge shall be:~~]

121 [~~(a) a citizen of the United States;~~]

122 [~~(b) 25 years of age or older;~~]

123 [~~(c) a resident of Utah for at least three years immediately preceding appointment;~~]

124 [~~(d) a resident of the county in which the municipality is located or an adjacent county~~
125 ~~for at least six months immediately preceding appointment; and]~~

126 [~~(e) a qualified voter of the county of residence.~~]

127 [~~(3)~~] (2) Justice court judges are not required to be admitted to practice law in the state
128 as a qualification to hold office but shall have at the minimum a [~~diploma of graduation from~~
129 ~~high school or its equivalent~~] Bachelor of Arts or Bachelor of Science degree from an
130 accredited four year college or university. This requirement does not apply to justice court
131 judges holding office on [~~July 1, 1989~~] or before January 1, 2009, who successfully complete
132 continuing education requirements under Section 78A-7-205.

133 [~~(4)~~] (3) A justice court judge shall be a person who has demonstrated maturity of
134 judgment, integrity, and the ability to understand and apply appropriate law with impartiality.

135 [~~(5) (a) Except as provided in Subsections (b) and (c), a county or municipal justice]~~

136 (4) Justice court [judge] judges shall retire upon attaining the age of 75 years.

137 [~~(b) A county justice court judge serving on July 1, 1996, who is 75 years of age or~~
138 ~~older on July 1, 1996, or who attains 75 years of age on or before the first Monday in February~~
139 ~~1999, may not be a candidate in the 1998 judicial retention elections and shall retire on or~~
140 ~~before the first Monday in February 1999.]~~

141 [~~(c) A municipal justice court judge serving on July 1, 1996, who is 75 years of age or~~
142 ~~older on July 1, 1996, or who attains 75 years of age on or before the first Monday in February~~
143 ~~2000, may not be reappointed and shall retire on or before the first Monday in February 2000.]~~

144 [~~(6)~~] (5) (a) A justice court judge whose tenure in office has terminated due to
145 retirement and who is physically and mentally able to perform the duties of the office may hear
146 a case as prescribed by rule of the Supreme Court.

147 (b) The retired justice court judge shall take and subscribe an oath of office only upon
148 the first appointment. The retired justice court judge shall receive reasonable compensation for
149 services as set by local ordinance of the municipality or county.

150 Section 4. Section **78A-7-202** is repealed and reenacted to read:

151 **78A-7-202. Justice court judges to be appointed -- Procedure -- Retention**

152 (1) As used in this section:

153 (a) "Local government executive" means:

154 (i) the chair of the county commission in counties having the county commission form
155 of county government;

156 (ii) the county executive in counties having the county executive-council form of
157 government;

158 (iii) the chair of the city council or town council in municipalities having the traditional
159 management arrangement established by Title 10, Chapter 3, Part 1, Governing Body;

160 (iv) the city manager, in the council-manager optional form of government defined in
161 Section 10-3-101; and

162 (v) the mayor, in the council-mayor optional form of government defined in Section
163 10-3-101.

164 (b) "Local legislative body" means:

165 (i) the county commission or county council; and

166 (ii) the city council or town council.

167 (2) There is created in each county a county justice court nominating commission to
168 review applicants and make recommendations to the appointing authority for a justice court
169 position. The commission shall be convened when a new justice court judge position is created
170 or when a vacancy in an existing court occurs for a justice court located within the county.

171 (a) Membership of the justice court nominating commission shall be as follows:

172 (i) one member appointed by:

173 (A) the county commission if the county has a county commission form of
174 government; or

175 (B) the county executive if the county has an executive-council form of government;

176 (ii) one member appointed by the municipalities in the counties as follows:

177 (A) if the county has only one municipality, appointment shall be made by the
178 governing authority of that municipality; or

179 (B) if the county has more than one municipality, appointment shall be made by a
180 municipal selection committee composed of the mayors of each municipality in the county;

181 (iii) one member appointed by the county bar association; and
182 (iv) two members appointed by the governing authority of the jurisdiction where the
183 judicial office is located.

184 (b) Members appointed under Subsections (a)(i) and (a)(ii) may not be an elected
185 official of the county or municipality.

186 (c) The nominating commission shall submit at least two names to the appointing
187 authority of the jurisdiction expected to be served by the judge. The local government
188 executive shall appoint a judge from the list submitted and the appointment ratified by the local
189 legislative body.

190 (d) The state court administrator shall provide staff to the commission. The Judicial
191 Council shall establish rules and procedures for the conduct of the commission.

192 (3) Judicial vacancies shall be advertised in a newspaper of general circulation, through
193 the Utah State Bar, and other appropriate means.

194 (4) Selection of candidates shall be based on compliance with the requirements for
195 office and competence to serve as a judge.

196 (5) Once selected, the Judicial Council shall certify the judge as qualified to hold office
197 upon successful completion of the orientation program.

198 (6) The selection of a person to fill the office of justice court judge is effective upon
199 certification of the judge by the Judicial Council. A justice court judge may not perform
200 judicial duties until certified by the Judicial Council.

201 (7) Upon the expiration of a justice court judge's term of office the judge shall be
202 subject to an unopposed retention election in the county or counties in which the court to which
203 the judge is appointed is located, in accordance with the procedures set forth in Section
204 20A-12-201.

205 (8) Before each retention election, each justice court judge shall be evaluated in
206 accordance with the performance evaluation program established in Subsection 78A-1-104(5).

207 Section 5. Section **78A-7-203** is amended to read:

208 **78A-7-203. Term of office for justice court judge.**

209 (1) ~~(a)~~ The term of a ~~county~~ justice court judge is ~~four~~ six years beginning the first
210 Monday in ~~February 1991.~~ January 2010.

211 ~~(b)~~ (2) Judges holding office ~~[when this act takes effect]~~ or appointed to fill any

212 vacancy before January 1, 2009 hold office until [~~reappointed or a successor is appointed and~~
213 ~~certified by the Judicial Council~~] the next general election.

214 [~~(2) (a) The term of office of a municipal justice court judge is four years, beginning~~
215 ~~the first Monday in February 1992.~~]

216 [~~(b) Judges holding office when this section takes effect or appointed to fill any~~
217 ~~vacancy hold office until reappointed or a successor is appointed and certified by the Judicial~~
218 ~~Council.~~]

219 Section 6. Section ~~78A-7-206~~ is amended to read:

220 **78A-7-206. Determination of compensation and limits -- Salary survey -- Limits**
221 **on secondary employment.**

222 (1) [~~(a)~~] Every justice court judge shall be paid a fixed compensation determined by the
223 governing body of the respective municipality or county [~~taking into consideration~~
224 ~~recommendations of the office of the state court administrator as provided in Subsection (2)~~].

225 (a) The governing body of the municipality or county may not set a full-time justice
226 court judge's salary at less than 50% nor more than 90% of a district court judge's salary.

227 (b) The governing body of the municipality or county shall set a part-time justice court
228 judge's salary as follows:

229 (i) The governing body shall first determine the full-time salary range outlined in
230 Subsection (1)(a).

231 (ii) The caseload of a part-time judge shall be determined by the office of the state
232 court administrator and expressed as a percentage of the caseload of a full-time judge.

233 (iii) The judge's salary shall then be determined by applying the percentage determined
234 in Subsection (1)(b)(ii) against the salary range determined in Subsection (1)(a)(i).

235 (c) A justice court judge shall receive an annual salary adjustment at least equal to the
236 average salary adjustment for all county or municipal employees for the jurisdiction served by
237 the judge.

238 [~~(i) A~~] (d) Notwithstanding Subsection (1)(c), a justice court judge [~~employed by one~~
239 ~~entity~~] may not receive a salary greater than [~~85%~~] 90% of the salary of a district court judge.

240 [~~(ii)~~] (e) A justice court judge employed by more than one entity as a justice court
241 judge, may not receive a total salary for service as a justice court judge greater than the salary
242 of a district court judge.

243 ~~[(b) The compensation shall be comprised of a monthly salary and shall be computed~~
244 ~~upon the number of hours, days, or other periods of time that the justice court judge is to be~~
245 ~~available to perform all judicial functions.]~~

246 ~~[(2) (a) The state court administrator with the approval of the Judicial Council shall~~
247 ~~survey areas of the state relating to the functions and activities of the justice courts, taking into~~
248 ~~consideration the diverse economic factors of the various localities of the justice courts, and~~
249 ~~develop recommended monthly salaries. These recommendations shall be furnished to the~~
250 ~~governing bodies of the municipalities and the counties to assist them in determining salaries.]~~

251 ~~[(b) The state court administrator may make studies concerned with the economic as~~
252 ~~well as administrative feasibility to encourage the various political subdivisions to utilize the~~
253 ~~same person or persons to act as justice court judges for their several jurisdictions and to assist~~
254 ~~political subdivisions desiring to enter into agreements for that purpose.]~~

255 ~~[(3)] (2) A justice court judge may not appear as an attorney in any criminal matter in a~~
256 ~~federal, state, or justice court or appear as an attorney in any justice court or in any juvenile~~
257 ~~court case involving conduct which would be criminal if committed by an adult.~~

258 ~~[(4)] (3) A justice court judge may not hold any office or employment including~~
259 ~~contracting for services in any justice agency of state government or any political subdivision~~
260 ~~of the state including law enforcement, prosecution, criminal defense, corrections, or court~~
261 ~~employment.~~

262 ~~[(5)] (4) A justice court judge may not hold any office in any political party or~~
263 ~~organization engaged in any political activity or serve as an elected official in state government~~
264 ~~or any political subdivision of the state.~~

265 ~~[(6)] (5) A justice court judge may not own or be employed by any business entity~~
266 ~~which regularly litigates in small claims court.~~

267 ~~[(7)] (6) Any judge who violates this section is subject to removal by the Judicial~~
268 ~~Conduct Commission under Title 78A, Chapter 11, Judicial Conduct Commission.~~

269 Section 7. Section **78A-7-213** is amended to read:

270 **78A-7-213. Trial facilities -- Hours of business.**

271 (1) A justice court judge shall conduct all official court business in a courtroom or
272 office located in a public facility which is conducive and appropriate to the administration of
273 justice.

274 (2) Each county, city, or town shall provide adequate courtroom and auxiliary space for
275 the justice court. The facility need not be specifically constructed for or allocated solely for the
276 justice court if existing facilities adequately serve the purposes of the justice court.

277 (3) [~~County and municipal justice~~] Justice courts shall be open and judicial business
278 shall be transacted:

279 (a) five days per week; or

280 (b) no less than four days per week for at least 11 hours per day.

281 (4) The legislative body of the county, city, or town shall establish operating hours for
282 the justice courts within the requirements of Subsection (3) and the code of judicial
283 administration.

284 (5) The hours the courts are open shall be posted conspicuously at the courts and in
285 local public buildings.

286 (6) The clerk of the court and judges of [~~county and municipal~~] justice courts shall
287 attend the court at regularly scheduled times.

288 (7) By July 1, 2011, all justice courts shall use a common case management system and
289 disposition reporting system as specified by the Judicial Council.

290 Section 8. **Effective date.**

291 This bill takes effect on January 1, 2009.

S.B. 72 1st Sub. (Green) - Justice Court Amendments

Fiscal Note

2008 General Session
State of Utah

State Impact

Enactment of this bill will require ongoing General Fund appropriations to the Courts of \$36,800 beginning in FY 2010 for increased workload. The Courts will also require a prorated one-time General Fund appropriation of \$18,400 in FY 2009.

	<u>FY 2008</u> <u>Approp.</u>	<u>FY 2009</u> <u>Approp.</u>	<u>FY 2010</u> <u>Approp.</u>	<u>FY 2008</u> <u>Revenue</u>	<u>FY 2009</u> <u>Revenue</u>	<u>FY 2010</u> <u>Revenue</u>
General Fund	\$0	\$36,800	\$36,800	\$0	\$0	\$0
General Fund, One-Time	\$0	(\$18,400)	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Total	\$0	\$18,400	\$36,800	\$0	\$0	\$0

Individual, Business and/or Local Impact

Enactment of this bill will require a local government justice court to maintain a justice court judge salary between 50-90% of a State district court judge salary.