

1 **CONCURRENT RESOLUTION EXPRESSING OPPOSITION**
2 **TO THE CREATION OF NEW NATIONAL MONUMENTS IN**
3 **UTAH**

4 2010 GENERAL SESSION

5 STATE OF UTAH

6 **Chief Sponsor: Kevin T. Van Tassell**

7 House Sponsor: Christine F. Watkins

8 Cosponsors:
9 David P. Hinkins

Ralph Okerlund

Dennis E. Stowell

11 **LONG TITLE**

12 **General Description:**

13 This concurrent resolution of the Legislature and the Governor urges the President of
14 the United States and the United States Congress to refrain from designating new
15 national monuments in the San Rafael Swell area, the Cedar Mesa area, and any other
16 area in Utah.

17 **Highlighted Provisions:**

18 This resolution:

- 19 ▶ expresses opposition to the presidential creation of any large area national
- 20 monument, as an abuse and violation of the Antiquities Act's
- 21 smallest-area-compatible mandate;
- 22 ▶ urges the President of the United States and the United States Congress to refrain
- 23 from using the Antiquities Act to designate new national monuments in the San
- 24 Rafael Swell area, the Cedar Mesa area, and any other area in Utah;
- 25 ▶ declares that this unchecked exercise of power concentrated in the President
- 26 portends serious consequences for Utah and essentially coronates the President,
- 27 giving him the ultimate ability to determine the fate of nearly 70% of the entire state



28 with the mere stroke of an unchecked presidential pen;

29 ▶ urges Congress to check the President’s authority to exercise this power by
30 amending the Antiquities Act to clarify its actual intent, which is to establish small
31 discrete monuments or memorials as existed in Utah prior to the unfortunate
32 creation of the 1996 Grand Staircase National Monument;

33 ▶ expresses support for S 3016, introduced in the United States Senate, which would
34 prohibit the further extension or establishment of national monuments in Utah,
35 except by the express authorization of Congress; and

36 ▶ calls on the United States government to manage federal public lands in Utah
37 according to state and local government plans, policies, and public input as
38 promised by the Federal Land Policy Management Act of 1976 and the United
39 States constitutional guarantee of a republican form of government on equal footing
40 with all states in the Union, or otherwise to convey the federal public lands to Utah
41 for proper care and management, consistent with the Constitution's Framers’
42 original intent.

43 **Special Clauses:**

44 None



46 *Be it resolved by the Legislature of the state of Utah, the Governor concurring therein:*

47 WHEREAS, the Antiquities Act, 16 U.S.C. Sec. 431, empowers the President of the
48 United States to singlehandedly bypass congressional, state, and local land management
49 policies and tie up any federal land in Utah through national monument declarations;

50 WHEREAS, a recent confirmed United States Department of Interior (DOI) internal
51 memorandum declares that the 75-by-40 mile San Rafael Swell and surrounding "canyons,
52 gorges, mesas, and buttes," plus an area of unspecified size referred to as the Cedar Mesa area,
53 among others, "may be good candidates for National Monument designation under the
54 Antiquities Act;"

55 WHEREAS, the San Rafael Swell and surrounding areas and the Cedar Mesa area
56 described in the DOI memorandum are in Emery, Wayne, and San Juan Counties, Utah;

57 WHEREAS, Article I, Section 8, Clause 17 of the United States Constitution grants the
58 United States government the power to exercise exclusive jurisdiction over the District of

59 Columbia and over all "places purchased by the consent of the Legislature of the State in which
60 the same shall be, for the erection of forts, magazines, arsenals, dock-yards, and other needful
61 buildings";

62 WHEREAS, no lands in the San Rafael Swell and Cedar Mesa areas of Utah fit into
63 this category;

64 WHEREAS, the United States Constitution delegates to the government of the United
65 States no other power of exclusive jurisdiction over land in Utah, other than that referenced in
66 Article I, Section 8, Clause 17;

67 WHEREAS, the Tenth Amendment to the United States Constitution states, "The
68 powers not delegated to the United States by the Constitution, nor prohibited by it to the States,
69 are reserved to the States";

70 WHEREAS, Article IV, Section 4 of the United State Constitution states, "The United
71 States shall guarantee to every State in the Union a Republican Form of Government";

72 WHEREAS, the constitutional guarantee to Utah of a republican form of government is
73 abrogated and violated when the President of the United States purports through the Antiquities
74 Act, 16 U.S.C. Sec. 431, to exercise exclusive jurisdiction with the mere stroke of a pen over
75 lands in the San Rafael and Cedar Mesa areas that do not fit the category of Article I, Section 8,
76 Clause 17, exclusive jurisdiction land;

77 WHEREAS, lands in the San Rafael Swell and Cedar Mesa areas of Utah are currently
78 managed by the United States Bureau of Land Management (BLM) pursuant to the Federal
79 Land Policy Management Act (FLPMA) of 1976, and the Act directs BLM to manage public
80 lands according to Resource Management Plans (RMPs) which "shall be consistent with State
81 and local plans to the maximum extent [the Secretary of Interior] finds consistent with Federal
82 law and the purpose of [FLPMA]";

83 WHEREAS, the state of Utah and the counties of Emery, Wayne, and San Juan have
84 recently completed an expensive and protracted multi-year FLPMA and National
85 Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) process with the BLM and the public to revise and update
86 the BLM's RMPs in planning areas which include the San Rafael Swell and Cedar Mesa areas;

87 WHEREAS, the revised RMPs do not call for the creation of national monuments in
88 the San Rafael Swell and Cedar Mesa areas;

89 WHEREAS, creating national monuments in the San Rafael Swell and Cedar Mesa

90 areas would violate and undercut the integrity of the RMPs revision process in Emery, Wayne,
91 and San Juan Counties where the San Rafael Swell and Cedar Mesa areas are situated, and
92 would be inconsistent with the plans and policies of the state of Utah and those counties and
93 their duly elected governmental boards and leaders, all in violation of the constitutional
94 guarantee of a republican form of government as well as violating federal statutory consistency
95 requirements of FLPMA;

96 WHEREAS, a presidential proclamation declaring national monuments in the San
97 Rafael Swell and Cedar Mesa areas would single-handedly bypass the revised RMPs and the
98 universal opposition by the duly elected leaders of the state of Utah and the counties where
99 those lands lie;

100 WHEREAS, a presidential proclamation of this type would constitute an illegitimate
101 arrogation of exclusive jurisdiction over lands by the President, exceeding the bounds of
102 legitimate and lawful authority permitted by the United States Constitution;

103 WHEREAS, the Antiquities Act states, "The President . . . may reserve as a part [of a
104 national monument] parcels of land, the limits of which in all cases shall be confined to the
105 smallest areas compatible with the proper care and management of the objects to be protected. .
106 . ." (italics added);

107 WHEREAS, the size of the 1996 Grand Staircase National Monument in Garfield and
108 Kane Counties far exceeded "the smallest areas compatible" with the feigned object of that
109 monument;

110 WHEREAS, the size of the San Rafael Swell area stated in the DOI memo, namely
111 75-by-40 miles plus surrounding canyons, gorges, mesas, and buttes, is staggering in terms of a
112 national monument;

113 WHEREAS, Utah favors protecting the remarkably scenic, recreational, and sensitive
114 areas of the San Rafael Swell and Cedar Mesa areas, however highest and best use of vast
115 tracts of land in those areas is continued grazing and environmentally sensitive energy and
116 mineral development done in such a way as to protect and preserve the scenic and recreational
117 values;

118 WHEREAS, as history has demonstrated in the case of the Grand Staircase National
119 Monument, many thousands of acres of important grazing and mineral and other multiple use
120 resources and values have been closed to reasonable development due to the multi-hundred

121 thousand acre national monument designation;

122 WHEREAS, Senator Bob Bennett has introduced S 3016 in the United States Senate,
123 which would prohibit the further extension or establishment of national monuments in Utah,
124 except by express authorization of Congress; and

125 WHEREAS, Utah's economy, industry, culture, way of life, and its viability as a
126 sovereign state guaranteed a republican form of government depend on reasonable multiple-use
127 access to the BLM lands in the San Rafael Swell and Cedar Mesa areas of the State, most of
128 which will be taken away through national monument designation:

129 NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Legislature of the state of Utah, the
130 Governor concurring therein, express their opposition to the presidential creation of any large
131 area national monument, as an abuse and violation of the Antiquities Act's
132 smallest-area-compatible mandate.

133 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislature and the Governor oppose the
134 presidential creation of new national monuments in the San Rafael Swell area, Cedar Mesa
135 area, and any other area of Utah.

136 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislature and the Governor declare openly to
137 the United States government that this unchecked exercise of power concentrated in the
138 President portends serious consequences for Utah, as nearly 70% of the State is federally
139 owned.

140 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislature and the Governor declare openly to
141 the United States government that the exercise of this power would essentially coronate the
142 President, giving him the ultimate ability to determine the fate of nearly 70% of the entire state
143 with the mere stroke of an unchecked presidential pen.

144 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislature and the Governor urge Congress to
145 check the President's ability to exercise such power by amending the Antiquities Act to clarify
146 its actual intent, which is to establish small discrete monuments or memorials as existed in
147 Utah prior to the unfortunate creation of the 1996 Grand Staircase National Monument.

148 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislature and the Governor strongly urge the
149 federal government to manage federal public lands in Utah according to state and local
150 government plans, policies, and public input as promised by the Federal Land Policy
151 Management Act of 1976 and the United States constitutional guarantee of a republican form

152 of government on equal footing with all states in the Union, or otherwise convey the federal
153 public lands to Utah for proper care and management, consistent with the original intent of the
154 Constitution's Framers.

155 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislature and the Governor express support
156 for S 3016, introduced in the United States Senate, which would prohibit the further extension
157 or establishment of national monuments in Utah, except by express authorization of Congress.

158 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that copies of this resolution be sent to the President of
159 the United States, the Majority Leader of the United States Senate, the Speaker of the United
160 States House of Representatives, and to the members of Utah's congressional delegation.

Legislative Review Note
as of 2-23-10 3:20 PM

Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel

Fiscal Note

**S.C.R. 11 - Concurrent Resolution Expressing Opposition to the Creation of
New National Monuments in Utah**

2010 General Session

State of Utah

State Impact

Enactment of this bill will not require additional appropriations.

Individual, Business and/or Local Impact

Enactment of this bill likely will not result in direct, measurable costs and/or benefits for individuals, businesses, or local governments.
