€ 02-14-12 8:02 AM €

Representative Gregory H. Hughes proposes the following substitute bill:

1	INDIGENT DEFENSE ACT AMENDMENTS	
2	2012 GENERAL SESSION	
3	STATE OF UTAH	
4	Chief Sponsor: Gregory H. Hughes	
5	Senate Sponsor: Wayne L. Niederhauser	
6 7	LONG TITLE	
8	General Description:	
9	This bill modifies the Indigent Defense Act.	
10	Highlighted Provisions:	
11	This bill:	
12	 defines "defense service provider", "legal defense", and "regional legal defense"; 	
13	 allows a person charged with a serious offense to file a claim of indigency with the 	
14	court;	
15	 requires a defense service provider to provide all legal defense services as a 	
16	package;	
17	 provides procedures for the court to follow when a defendant hires private counsel; 	
18	and	
19	 extends subsequent terms of county commissioners and county attorneys who serve 	
20	on the Indigent Defense Fund Board to be four years rather than two years.	
21	Money Appropriated in this Bill:	
22	None	
23	Other Special Clauses:	
24	None	
25	Utah Code Sections Affected:	

26	AMENDS:
27	77-32-201, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2011, Chapter 108
28	77-32-202, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2011, Chapter 108
29	77-32-301, as renumbered and amended by Laws of Utah 1997, Chapter 354
30	77-32-302, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2006, Chapter 49
31	77-32-303, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 3
32	77-32-304, as renumbered and amended by Laws of Utah 1997, Chapter 354
33	77-32-304.5, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2006, Chapter 49
34	77-32-305.5, as enacted by Laws of Utah 1997, Chapter 307
35	77-32-306, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2006, Chapter 49
36	77-32-307, as renumbered and amended by Laws of Utah 1997, Chapter 354
37	77-32-401, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2010, Chapter 286
38	
39	Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:
40	Section 1. Section 77-32-201 is amended to read:
41	77-32-201. Definitions.
42	For the purposes of this chapter:
43	(1) "Board" means the Indigent Defense Funds Board created in Section 77-32-401.
44	(2) "Compelling reason" shall include one or more of the following circumstances
45	relating to the contracting attorney:
46	(a) a conflict of interest;
47	(b) the contracting attorney does not have sufficient expertise to provide an effective
48	defense of the indigent; or
49	(c) the <u>legal</u> defense [resource] is insufficient or lacks expertise to provide a complete
50	defense.
51	(3) "Defense resources" means a competent investigator, expert witness, <u>scientific or</u>
52	medical testing, or other appropriate means necessary, for an effective defense of an indigent,
53	but does not include legal counsel.
54	(4) "Defense services provider" means a legal aid association, legal defender's office,
55	regional legal defense association, law firm, attorney, or attorneys contracting with a county or
56	municipality to provide legal defense and includes any combination of counties or

57	municipalities to provide regional legal defense.
58	[(4)] (5) "Indigent" means a person qualifying as an indigent under indigency standards
59	established in Part 3, Counsel for Indigents.
60	[(5)] (6) "Legal aid association" means a nonprofit defense association or society that
61	provides [counsel and] legal defense [resources] for indigent defendants.
62	[(6)] (7) "Legal defender's office" means a [department] division of county government
63	created and authorized by the county legislative body to provide legal representation in
64	criminal matters to indigent defendants.
65	[(7)] (8) "Legal defense" means [legal counsel, defense resources, or both.] to:
66	(a) provide defense counsel for each indigent who faces the substantial probability of
67	the deprivation of the indigent's liberty;
68	(b) afford timely representation by defense counsel;
69	(c) provide the defense resources necessary for a complete defense;
70	(d) assure undivided loyalty of defense counsel to the client;
71	(e) provide a first appeal of right; and
72	(f) prosecute other remedies before or after a conviction, considered by defense counsel
73	to be in the interest of justice except for other and subsequent discretionary appeals or
74	discretionary writ proceedings.
75	[(8)] (9) "Participating county" means a county which has complied with the provisions
76	of this chapter for participation in the Indigent Capital Defense Trust Fund as provided in
77	Sections 77-32-602 and 77-32-603 or the Indigent Felony Defense Trust Fund as provided in
78	Sections 77-32-702 and 77-32-703.
79	(10) "Regional legal defense" means a defense services provider which provides legal
80	defense to any combination of counties or municipalities through an interlocal cooperation
81	agreement pursuant to Title 11, Chapter 13, Interlocal Cooperation Act, and Subsection
82	<u>77-32-306(3).</u>
83	[(9)] (11) "Serious offense" means a felony or capital felony.
84	Section 2. Section 77-32-202 is amended to read:
85	77-32-202. Procedure for determination of indigency Standards.
86	(1) A determination of indigency or continuing indigency of any defendant may be
87	made by the court at any stage of the proceedings.

87 made by the court at any stage of the proceedings.

02-14-12 8:02 AM

88 (2) (a) Any defendant claiming indigency who is charged with a crime the penalty of 89 which is a class A misdemeanor or [felony] serious offense shall file with the court a fully 90 complete affidavit verified by a notary or other person authorized by law to administer an oath 91 and file a copy of that affidavit with the prosecuting entity. The affidavit shall contain the 92 factual information required in this section and by the court. 93 (b) A defendant claiming indigency who is charged with a crime the penalty of which 94 is less than a class A misdemeanor is not required to comply with the requirements of 95 Subsection (2)(a) and Subsection (4). 96 (3) (a) "Indigency" means that a person: 97 (i) does not have sufficient income, assets, credit, or other means to provide for the 98 payment of legal counsel and all other necessary expenses of representation without depriving 99 that person or the family of that person of food, shelter, clothing, and other necessities; or 100 (ii) has an income level at or below 150% of the United States poverty level as defined 101 by the most recently revised poverty income guidelines published by the United States 102 Department of Health and Human Services; and 103 (iii) has not transferred or otherwise disposed of any assets since the commission of the 104 offense with the intent of establishing eligibility for the appointment of counsel under this 105 chapter. 106 (b) In making a determination of indigency, the court shall consider: 107 (i) the probable expense and burden of defending the case; 108 (ii) the ownership of, or any interest in, any tangible or intangible personal property or 109 real property, or reasonable expectancy of any such interest; 110 (iii) the amounts of debts owned by the defendant or that might reasonably be incurred 111 by the defendant because of illness or other needs within the defendant's family; 112 (iv) number, ages, and relationships of any dependents; 113 (v) the reasonableness of fees and expenses charged to the defendant by the defendant's 114 attorney and the scope of representation undertaken where the defendant is represented by 115 privately retained defense counsel; and 116 (vi) other factors considered relevant by the court. 117 (4) (a) Upon making a finding of indigence, the court shall enter the findings on the 118 record and enter an order assigning a defense [counsel] services provider to represent the

119	defendant in the case.
120	(b) Upon finding indigence when the defendant has privately retained counsel, the
121	court, subject to Section 77-32-303, shall enter the findings into the record and issue an order
122	directing the county or municipality to coordinate the providing of defense resources as
123	appropriate.
124	(c) The clerk of the court shall send a copy of the affidavit and order to the prosecutor
125	and to the county clerk or municipal recorder.
126	(5) If the county or municipality providing the defense [counsel] services provider has
127	any objections to or concerns with the finding of indigency and assignment of <u>a</u> defense
128	[counsel] services provider or the continuing of indigency status and assignment of a [public
129	defender] defense services provider, it shall file notice with the court and a hearing shall be
130	scheduled to review the findings and give the county or municipality the opportunity to present
131	evidence and arguments as to the reasons the finding of indigency should be reversed and the
132	court shall proceed as provided in Subsection 77-32-302(4).
133	(6) (a) If the trial court finds within one year after the determination of indigency that
134	any defendant was erroneously or improperly determined to be indigent, the county or
135	municipality may proceed against that defendant for the reasonable value of the services
136	rendered to the defendant, including all costs paid by the county or municipality in providing
137	the <u>legal</u> defense [counsel].
138	(b) Subsection (6)(a) does not affect any restitution required of the defendant by the
139	court pursuant to [Title 77,] Chapter 32a, Defense Costs.
140	(c) A defendant claiming indigency has a continuing duty to inform the court of any
141	material changes or change in circumstances that may affect the determination of his eligibility
142	for indigency.
143	(d) Any person who intentionally or knowingly makes a material false statement or
144	omits a material fact in an affidavit for indigency is guilty of a class B misdemeanor.
145	Section 3. Section 77-32-301 is amended to read:
146	77-32-301. Minimum standards for defense of an indigent.
147	(1) Each county, city, and town shall provide for the legal defense of an indigent in
148	criminal cases in the courts and various administrative bodies of the state in accordance with
149	[the following minimum] legal defense standards[:] as defined in Subsection 77-32-208(8).

150	[(1) provide counsel for each indigent who faces the substantial probability of the
151	deprivation of the indigent's liberty;]
152	[(2) afford timely representation by competent legal counsel;]
153	[(3) provide the investigatory resources necessary for a complete defense;]
154	[(4) assure undivided loyalty of defense counsel to the client;]
155	[(5) proceed with a first appeal of right; and]
156	[(6) prosecute other remedies before or after a conviction, considered by defense
157	counsel to be in the interest of justice except for other and subsequent discretionary appeals or
158	discretionary writ proceedings.]
159	(2) (a) A county or municipality which contracts with a defense services provider shall
160	provide that all legal defense elements be included as a single package of legal defense services
161	made available to indigents, except as provided in Sections 77-32-302 and 77-32-303.
162	(b) When needed to avoid a conflict of interest between:
163	(i) trial counsel and counsel on appeal, a defense services provider contract shall also
164	provide for separate trial and appellate counsel; and
165	(ii) counsel for co-defendants, a defense services provider contract shall also provide
166	for separate trial counsel.
167	(c) If a county or municipality contracts to provide all legal defense elements as a
168	single package, a defendant may not receive funding for defense resources unless represented
169	by publicly funded counsel or as provided in Subsection 77-32-303(2).
170	Section 4. Section 77-32-302 is amended to read:
171	77-32-302. Assignment of counsel on request of indigent or order of court.
172	(1) [Legal counsel] The defense services provider shall be assigned to represent each
173	indigent and [the indigent] shall [also be provided access to] provide the legal defense
174	[resources] services necessary for an effective defense, if the indigent is under arrest for or
175	charged with a crime in which there is a substantial probability that the penalty to be imposed
176	is confinement in either jail or prison if:
177	(a) the indigent requests [counsel or] legal defense [resources, or both]; or
178	(b) the court on its own motion or otherwise orders [counsel, defense resources, or
179	both] legal defense services and the defendant does not affirmatively waive or reject on the
180	record the opportunity to be [represented and] provided legal defense [resources].

1st Sub. (Buff) H.B. 510

(2) (a) If a county responsible for providing indigent legal defense[, including counsel
and defense resources,] has established a county legal defender's office and the court has
received notice of the establishment of the office, the court shall assign to the county legal
defender's office the responsibility to defend indigent defendants within the county and provide
defense resources.

(b) If the county or municipality responsible to provide for the legal defense of an
indigent[, including defense resources and counsel,] has arranged by contract to provide those
services through a [legal aid association] defense services provider, and the court has received
notice or a copy of the contract, the court shall assign the [legal aid association] defense
services provider named in the contract to [defend the indigent and] provide legal defense
[resources].

[(c) If the county or municipality responsible for providing indigent legal defense,
including counsel and defense resources, has contracted to provide those services through
individual attorneys, individual defense resources, or associations providing defense resources,
and the court has received notice or a copy of the contracts, the court shall assign a contracting
attorney as the legal counsel to represent an indigent and a contracted defense resource to
provide defense-related services.]
[(d)] (c) If no county [legal defender's office] or municipal defense services provider

199 <u>contract</u> exists, the court shall select and assign [an attorney or] <u>a legal</u> defense [resource if:]
 200 <u>provider.</u>

201

[(i) the contract for indigent legal services is with multiple attorneys or resources; or]

202 [(ii) the contract is with another attorney in the event of a conflict of interest.]

[(e)] (d) If the court considers the assignment of a noncontracting [attorney or defense
 resource to provide] legal [services] defense provider to an indigent defendant despite the
 existence of [an indigent legal] a defense services provider contract and the court has a copy or
 notice of the contract, before the court may make the assignment, it shall:

207

(i) set the matter for a hearing;

(ii) give proper notice of the hearing to the attorney of the responsible county or
 municipality and county clerk or municipal recorder; and

(iii) make findings that there is a compelling reason to appoint a noncontractingattorney [or defense resource].

- 7 -

212	[(f)] (e) The indigent's preference for other counsel or defense resources may not be
213	considered a compelling reason justifying the appointment of a noncontracting [attorney or]
214	defense [resource] services provider.
215	(3) The court may make a determination of indigency at any time.
216	Section 5. Section 77-32-303 is amended to read:
217	77-32-303. Standard for court to appoint noncontracting attorney or order the
218	provision of defense resources Hearing.
219	(1) If a county or municipality has contracted [for, or otherwise made arrangements for,
220	the legal defense of indigents, including a competent attorney and defense resources] or
221	otherwise provided for a defense services provider, the court may not appoint a noncontracting
222	attorney [or resource either] under this part, Section 78B-1-151, or Rule 15, Utah Rules of
223	Criminal Procedure, unless the court:
224	[(1)] (a) conducts a hearing with proper notice to the [responsible entity] county clerk
225	or municipal recorder, with a copy of the notice provided to the prosecutor, to consider the
226	authorization or designation of a noncontract attorney [or resource]; and
227	[(2)] (b) makes a finding that there is a compelling reason to authorize or designate a
228	noncontracting attorney [or resources] for the indigent defendant.
229	(2) Except as provided in Subsection (3), if a county or municipality has contracted or
230	otherwise provided for a defense services provider, the court may not order under this part,
231	Section 78B-1-151, or Rule 15, Utah Rules of Criminal Procedure, and the county or
232	municipality may not provide defense resources for a defendant who has retained private
233	counsel.
234	(3) The court may order, and the county or municipality may provide, defense
235	resources to a defendant represented by private counsel only if:
236	(a) the court conducts a hearing with proper notice to the county clerk or municipal
237	recorder, with a copy of the notice provided to the prosecutor;
238	(b) the court conducts an in camera review of the defense contract, a full accounting of
239	the defense retainer, anticipated costs of defense resources and other relevant defense records
240	and finds by clear and convincing evidence all of the following:
241	(i) the defendant would be prejudiced by the substitution of a contracted defense
242	services provider and any prejudice cannot be remedied by a continuance or other alternative

243	means;
244	(ii) at the time of retention of private counsel, the defendant and attorney entered into a
245	written contract which provided that the defendant had the means to pay for fees and defense
246	resources:
247	(iii) there has been an unforseen change in circumstances which requires defense
248	resources beyond the defendant's ability to pay; and
249	(iv) all of the above representations are made in good faith and are not calculated to
250	allow the defendant or defense attorney to avoid the requirements of this section.
251	(4) The court may not order the defense services provider to act as co-counsel with a
252	privately retained legal counsel as a means of circumventing the requirements of this section.
253	Section 6. Section 77-32-304 is amended to read:
254	77-32-304. Duties of assigned counsel Compensation.
255	(1) When representing an indigent, the assigned counsel shall:
256	(a) counsel and defend the indigent at every stage of the proceeding following
257	assignment; and
258	(b) file any first appeal of right or other remedy before or after conviction that the
259	assigned counsel considers to be in the interest of justice, except for other and subsequent
260	discretionary appeals or discretionary writ proceedings.
261	(2) An assigned counsel may not [have the duty or power under this section to]
262	represent an indigent in any discretionary appeal or action for a discretionary writ, other than in
263	a meaningful first appeal of right to assure the indigent an adequate opportunity to present the
264	indigent's claims fairly in the context of the appellate process of this state.
265	(3) An assigned counsel for an indigent shall be entitled to compensation upon:
266	(a) approval of the district court where the original trial was held;
267	(b) a showing that:
268	(i) the indigent has been denied a constitutional right; or
269	(ii) there was newly discovered evidence that would show the indigent's innocence; and
270	(c) <u>a clear showing</u> that the legal services rendered by counsel were:
271	(i) other than that required under this chapter or under a separate fee arrangement; and
272	(ii) necessary for the <u>adequate defense of the</u> indigent and not for the purpose of
273	delaying the judgment of the original trier of fact.

274	Section 7. Section 77-32-304.5 is amended to read:
275	77-32-304.5. Reasonable compensation for defense counsel for indigents.
276	(1) This section does not apply to any attorney $[:(a)]$ acting as a defense services
277	provider or otherwise under contract with the county or municipality for defense of an indigent
278	person[;].
279	[(b) in the legal defender organization, legal aid agency, law firm, or public defender
280	association with which that attorney is professionally associated; or]
281	[(c) who is an employee of a county legal defender's office.]
282	(2) (a) The county or municipality shall pay reasonable compensation to any attorney
283	assigned by the court under Subsection 77-32-306 at the conclusion of the representation or any
284	segment of the representation, as provided in Subsections (2)(b), (c), (d), and (e):
285	(i) before the district or justice courts, including interlocutory appeals; and
286	(ii) before the appellate court on a first appeal of right.
287	(b) The legislative body of each county and municipality shall establish and annually
288	review guidelines for the rate of compensation, taking into account:
289	(i) the nature and complexity of the case;
290	(ii) the competency and years of experience in criminal defense of the assigned
291	attorney;
292	(iii) the adjusted net hourly rate incurred by the county or municipality for a prosecutor
293	or public defender of equivalent experience and competency; and
294	(iv) the prevailing rates within the judicial district for comparable services.
295	(c) If the legislative body of a county or municipality does not establish the rate
296	guidelines, the rate of compensation shall be determined by the trial judge or a judge other than
297	the trial judge if requested by:
298	(i) the assigned attorney; or
299	(ii) the county or municipality.
300	(d) If the assigned attorney disagrees with the amount of compensation paid or
301	contemplated for payment by the county or municipality, the assigned attorney shall
302	nonetheless continue to represent the indigent defendant and may file a claim against:
303	(i) the county pursuant to Section 17-50-401, in which event the period for a denial by
304	the county shall be 20 days; or

305	(ii) the municipality pursuant to Title 10, Chapter 6, Uniform Fiscal Procedures Act for
306	Utah Cities.
307	(e) In determining the reasonable compensation to be paid to defense counsel under
308	Subsections (2)(c) and (d), the court shall consider the factors contained in Subsections
309	(2)(b)(i) through (iv).
310	(f) The total compensation in a noncapital case may not, without prior court approval
311	following a hearing, exceed:
312	(i) \$3,500 for each assigned attorney in a case in which one or more felonies is
313	charged;
314	(ii) \$1,000 for each assigned attorney in a case in which only misdemeanors or lesser
315	offenses are charged; or
316	(iii) \$2,500 for each assigned attorney in the representation of an indigent in an
317	appellate court on a first appeal of right.
318	Section 8. Section 77-32-305.5 is amended to read:
319	77-32-305.5. Reimbursement of extraordinary expense.
320	(1) For the purposes of this section, an "extraordinary expense" means the collective
321	expense which exceeds \$500 for defense resources or any particular service or item such as
322	experts, investigators, surveys, or demonstrative evidence.
323	(2) The county or municipality shall reimburse expenses, exclusive of overhead and
324	extraordinary expense not approved by the court in accordance with this chapter, reasonably
325	incurred by assigned attorneys for indigent defendants through a contracted defense services
326	provider or if so ordered by the court based on a hearing held in accordance with Subsections
327	77-32-303(2) and (3), or for an appointed counsel under Section 77-32-304.5.
328	(3) The assigned attorney shall file a motion with the court for approval of the
329	proposed expenditure for any extraordinary expense before the expense is incurred. The
330	motion shall be heard and ruled upon by a judge other than the trial judge if so requested by
331	either party or upon the motion of the trial judge.
332	Section 9. Section 77-32-306 is amended to read:
333	77-32-306. County or municipal legislative body to provide legal defense.
334	(1) The county or municipal legislative body shall either:
335	(a) contract [to provide the legal defense, including counsel, defense resources, or both,

336	as prescribed by this chapter, and as available, through:] with a defense services provider; or
337	[(i) a legal aid association; or]
338	[(ii) one or more defense associations or attorneys and qualified defense resources; or]
339	(b) authorize the court to provide the services prescribed by this chapter by assigning a
340	qualified attorney in each case.
341	(2) A county may create a county legal defender's office to provide for the legal
342	defense[, including counsel and defense resources or both,] as prescribed by this chapter.
343	(3) A county legal defender's office may, through the county legislative body contract
344	with other counties and municipalities within a judicial district to provide the legal services as
345	prescribed.
346	(4) Counties and municipalities are encouraged to enter into interlocal cooperation
347	agreements pursuant to Title 11, Chapter 13, Interlocal Cooperation Act, for the provision of
348	legal defense, including multiple counties and municipalities contracting with either a private
349	defense services provider or with a legal defender's office. An interlocal agreement may
350	provide for:
351	(a) the creation of or contract with a private defense services provider, as defined in
352	Subsection 77-32-201(4);
353	(b) multiple counties or municipalities to contract with a county legal defender's office,
354	as defined in 77-32-201(7); or
355	(c) the creation of an interlocal entity under the provisions of Section 11-13-203.
356	[(4)] (5) When a county or municipality has contracted under Subsection (1)(a) or a
357	county has created a legal defender's office as provided under Subsection (2) to provide the
358	legal [counsel and] defense resources required by this chapter, the [contracted legal aid
359	association or attorneys, contracted defense resources, and the county legal defender's office
360	are] legal services provider is the exclusive source from which the legal defense may be
361	provided, unless the court finds a compelling reason for the appointment of noncontracting
362	attorneys and defense resources, under the provisions of Section 77-32-302 or 77-32-303, in
363	which case the judge shall state the compelling reason and the findings of the hearing held
364	under Subsections 77-32-303(2) and (3) on the record.
365	(6) A county or municipality may, by ordinance, provide for some other means which
366	are constitutionally adequate for legal defense of indigents.

367	Section 10. Section 77-32-307 is amended to read:
368	77-32-307. Expenditures of county or municipal funds declared proper Tax
369	levy authorized.
370	(1) An expenditure by any county or [incorporated] municipality is considered a proper
371	use of public funds if the expenditure is necessary to carry out the purposes defined in this
372	chapter.
373	(2) A donation to a nonprofit legal aid or other association charged with the duty to
374	provide the services is a proper use of public funds.
375	(3) Any county or [incorporated area] municipality of the state is authorized to levy and
376	collect taxes to meet the requirements of this chapter.
377	Section 11. Section 77-32-401 is amended to read:
378	77-32-401. Indigent Defense Funds Board Members Administrative support.
379	(1) There is created within the Division of Finance the Indigent Defense Funds Board
380	composed of the following nine members:
381	(a) two members who are current commissioners or county executives of participating
382	counties appointed by the board of directors of the Utah Association of Counties;
383	(b) one member at large appointed by the board of directors of the Utah Association of
384	Counties;
385	(c) two members who are current county attorneys of participating counties appointed
386	by the Utah Prosecution Council;
387	(d) the director of the Division of Finance or his designee;
388	(e) one member appointed by the Administrative Office of the Courts; and
389	(f) two members who are private attorneys engaged in or familiar with the criminal
390	defense practice appointed by the members of the board listed in Subsections (1)(a) through
391	(e).
392	(2) Members shall serve four-year terms[; however, one]. One of the county
393	commissioners[,] and one of the county attorneys appointed to the initial board shall serve
394	two-year terms, and the remaining other members of the initial board shall be appointed for
395	four-year terms. After the initial two-year terms of the county commissioner and county
396	attorney, those board positions shall have four-year terms.
397	(3) A vacancy is created if a member appointed under:

398	(a) Subsection (1)(a) no longer serves as a county commissioner or county executive;
399	or
400	(b) Subsection (1)(c) no longer serves as a county attorney.
401	(4) When a vacancy occurs in the membership for any reason, a replacement shall be
402	appointed for the remaining unexpired term in the same manner as the original appointment.
403	(5) The board may contract for administrative support for up to \$15,000 annually to be
404	paid proportionally from each fund.
405	(6) A member may not receive compensation or benefits for the member's service, but
406	may receive per diem and travel expenses in accordance with:
407	(a) Section 63A-3-106;
408	(b) Section 63A-3-107; and
409	(c) rules made by the Division of Finance pursuant to Sections 63A-3-106 and
410	63A-3-107.
411	(7) Per diem and expenses for board members shall be paid proportionally from each
412	fund.
413	(8) Five members shall constitute a quorum and, if a quorum is present, the action of a
414	majority of the members present shall constitute the action of the board.