

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

~~{deleted text}~~ shows text that was in SB0137 but was deleted in SB0137S01.

Inserted text shows text that was not in SB0137 but was inserted into SB0137S01.

DISCLAIMER: This document is provided to assist you in your comparison of the two bills. Sometimes this automated comparison will NOT be completely accurate. Therefore, you need to read the actual bills. This automatically generated document could contain inaccuracies caused by: limitations of the compare program; bad input data; or other causes.

Senator Curtis S. Bramble proposes the following substitute bill:

AMENDMENTS RELATING TO GOVERNMENT RECORDS

2018 GENERAL SESSION

STATE OF UTAH

Chief Sponsor: Curtis S. Bramble

House Sponsor: ~~{~~ Keven J. Stratton

LONG TITLE

General Description:

This bill modifies provisions relating to government records.

Highlighted Provisions:

This bill:

- ▶ modifies provisions relating to the protected status of records of closed meetings;
- ~~{~~ ▶ provides a standard for the disclosure of certain protected records;
- ~~}~~ ▶ modifies provisions relating to the posting of documents to the Utah Public Notice Website;
- ▶ modifies a provision relating to appeals of records requests; and
- ▶ makes related technical and conforming changes.

Money Appropriated in this Bill:

None

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

Other Special Clauses:

None

Utah Code Sections Affected:

AMENDS:

52-4-203, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2017, Chapters 12 and 13

52-4-206, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2010, Chapter 239

52-4-304, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2008, Chapter 382

63G-2-305, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2017, Chapters 374, 382, and 415

63G-2-403, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2015, ~~{Chapter}~~ Chapters 374, 382, and

335

~~{ **63G-2-406**, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2013, Chapter 445~~

Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:

Section 1. Section **52-4-203** is amended to read:

52-4-203. Written minutes of open meetings -- Public records -- Recording of meetings.

(1) Except as provided under Subsection (7), written minutes and a recording shall be kept of all open meetings.

(2) (a) Written minutes of an open meeting shall include:

(i) the date, time, and place of the meeting;

(ii) the names of members present and absent;

(iii) the substance of all matters proposed, discussed, or decided by the public body which may include a summary of comments made by members of the public body;

(iv) a record, by individual member, of each vote taken by the public body;

(v) the name of each person who:

(A) is not a member of the public body; and

(B) after being recognized by the presiding member of the public body, provided testimony or comments to the public body;

(vi) the substance, in brief, of the testimony or comments provided by the public under Subsection (2)(a)(v); and

(vii) any other information that is a record of the proceedings of the meeting that any

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

member requests be entered in the minutes or recording.

(b) A public body may satisfy the requirement under Subsection (2)(a)(iii) or (vi) that minutes include the substance of matters proposed, discussed, or decided or the substance of testimony or comments by maintaining a publicly available online version of the minutes that provides a link to the meeting recording at the place in the recording where the matter is proposed, discussed, or decided or the testimony or comments provided.

(3) A recording of an open meeting shall:

(a) be a complete and unedited record of all open portions of the meeting from the commencement of the meeting through adjournment of the meeting; and

(b) be properly labeled or identified with the date, time, and place of the meeting.

(4) (a) As used in this Subsection (4):

(i) "Approved minutes" means written minutes:

(A) of an open meeting; and

(B) that have been approved by the public body that held the open meeting.

(ii) "Electronic information" means information presented or provided in an electronic format.

(iii) "Pending minutes" means written minutes:

(A) of an open meeting; and

(B) that have been prepared in draft form and are subject to change before being approved by the public body that held the open meeting.

(iv) "Specified local public body" means a legislative body of a county, city, town, or metro township.

(v) "State public body" means a public body that is an administrative, advisory, executive, or legislative body of the state.

(vi) [~~"Website"~~] "State website" means the Utah Public Notice Website created under Section 63F-1-701.

(b) Pending minutes, approved minutes, and a recording of a public meeting are public records under Title 63G, Chapter 2, Government Records Access and Management Act.

(c) Pending minutes shall contain a clear indication that the public body has not yet approved the minutes or that the minutes are subject to change until the public body approves them.

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

(d) A state public body and a specified local public body shall require an individual who, at an open meeting of the public body, publicly presents or provides electronic information, relating to an item on the public body's meeting agenda, to provide the public body, at the time of the meeting, an electronic or hard copy of the electronic information for inclusion in the public record.

(e) A state public body shall:

(i) make pending minutes available to the public within 30 days after holding the open meeting that is the subject of the pending minutes;

(ii) within three business days after approving written minutes of an open meeting:

(A) post to the state website a copy of the approved minutes and any public materials distributed at the meeting;

(B) make the approved minutes and public materials available to the public at the public body's primary office; and

(C) if the public body provides online minutes under Subsection (2)(b), post approved minutes that comply with Subsection (2)(b) and the public materials on the public body's website; and

(iii) within three business days after holding an open meeting, post on the state website an audio recording of the open meeting, or a link to the recording.

(f) A specified local public body shall:

(i) make pending minutes available to the public within 30 days after holding the open meeting that is the subject of the pending minutes;

(ii) within three business days after approving written minutes of an open meeting, post and make available a copy of the approved minutes and any public materials distributed at the meeting, as provided in Subsection (4)(e)(ii); and

(iii) within three business days after holding an open meeting, make an audio recording of the open meeting available to the public for listening.

(g) A public body that is not a state public body or a specified local public body shall:

(i) make pending minutes available to the public within a reasonable time after holding the open meeting that is the subject of the pending minutes;

(ii) within three business days after approving written minutes, make the approved minutes available to the public; and

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

(iii) within three business days after holding an open meeting, make an audio recording of the open meeting available to the public for listening.

(h) A public body shall establish and implement procedures for the public body's approval of the written minutes of each meeting.

(i) Approved minutes of an open meeting are the official record of the meeting.

(5) All or any part of an open meeting may be independently recorded by any person in attendance if the recording does not interfere with the conduct of the meeting.

(6) The written minutes or recording of an open meeting that are required to be retained permanently shall be maintained in or converted to a format that meets long-term records storage requirements.

(7) Notwithstanding Subsection (1), a recording is not required to be kept of:

(a) an open meeting that is a site visit or a traveling tour, if no vote or action is taken by the public body; or

(b) an open meeting of a local district under Title 17B, Limited Purpose Local Government Entities - Local Districts, or special service district under Title 17D, Chapter 1, Special Service District Act, if the district's annual budgeted expenditures for all funds, excluding capital expenditures and debt service, are \$50,000 or less.

Section 2. Section **52-4-206** is amended to read:

52-4-206. Record of closed meetings.

(1) Except as provided under Subsection (6), if a public body closes a meeting under Subsection 52-4-205(1), the public body:

(a) shall make a recording of the closed portion of the meeting; and

(b) may keep detailed written minutes that disclose the content of the closed portion of the meeting.

(2) A recording of a closed meeting shall be complete and unedited from the commencement of the closed meeting through adjournment of the closed meeting.

(3) The recording and any minutes of a closed meeting shall include:

(a) the date, time, and place of the meeting;

(b) the names of members present and absent; and

(c) the names of all others present except where the disclosure would infringe on the confidentiality necessary to fulfill the original purpose of closing the meeting.

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

(4) Minutes or recordings of a closed meeting that are required to be retained permanently shall be maintained in or converted to a format that meets long-term records storage requirements.

~~{(5) [Both a] A recording [and], transcript, report, and~~ written minutes of ~~a~~ closed ~~[meetings] meeting~~ are protected records under Title 63G, Chapter 2, Government Records Access and Management Act, except that the records may be disclosed under a court order only as provided under Section 52-4-304.~~{~~

~~{ (5) Transcripts, minutes, recordings, and reports of a closed meeting are protected records as provided in Subsection 63G-2-305(32) and may be disclosed only as provided in Subsection 63G-2-406(3). }~~

~~{~~ (6) If a public body closes a meeting exclusively for the purposes described under Subsection 52-4-205(1)(a), (1)(f), or (2):

(a) the person presiding shall sign a sworn statement affirming that the sole purpose for closing the meeting was to discuss the purposes described under Subsection 52-4-205(1)(a),(1)(f), or (2); and

(b) the provisions of Subsection (1) of this section do not apply.

Section 3. Section **52-4-304** is amended to read:

52-4-304. Action challenging closed meeting.

(1) Notwithstanding the procedure established under Subsection 63G-2-202(7), in any action brought under the authority of this chapter to challenge the legality of a closed meeting held by a public body, the court shall:

(a) review the recording or written minutes of the closed meeting in camera; and

(b) decide the legality of the closed meeting.

(2) (a) If the judge determines that the public body did not violate Section 52-4-204, 52-4-205, or 52-4-206 regarding closed meetings, the judge shall dismiss the case without disclosing or revealing any information from the recording or minutes of the closed meeting~~{~~ except to the extent the judge orders disclosure of information under Subsection 63G-2-406(3)~~}~~.

(b) If the judge determines that the public body violated Section 52-4-204, 52-4-205, or 52-4-206 regarding closed meetings, the judge shall publicly disclose or reveal from the recording or minutes of the closed meeting all information about the portion of the meeting that

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

was illegally closed.

(3) Nothing in this section may be construed to affect the ability of a public body to reclassify a record, as defined in Section 63G-2-103, as provided in Section 63G-2-307.

Section 4. Section **63G-2-305** is amended to read:

63G-2-305. Protected records.

The following records are protected if properly classified by a governmental entity:

(1) trade secrets as defined in Section 13-24-2 if the person submitting the trade secret has provided the governmental entity with the information specified in Section 63G-2-309;

(2) commercial information or nonindividual financial information obtained from a person if:

(a) disclosure of the information could reasonably be expected to result in unfair competitive injury to the person submitting the information or would impair the ability of the governmental entity to obtain necessary information in the future;

(b) the person submitting the information has a greater interest in prohibiting access than the public in obtaining access; and

(c) the person submitting the information has provided the governmental entity with the information specified in Section 63G-2-309;

(3) commercial or financial information acquired or prepared by a governmental entity to the extent that disclosure would lead to financial speculations in currencies, securities, or commodities that will interfere with a planned transaction by the governmental entity or cause substantial financial injury to the governmental entity or state economy;

(4) records, the disclosure of which could cause commercial injury to, or confer a competitive advantage upon a potential or actual competitor of, a commercial project entity as defined in Subsection 11-13-103(4);

(5) test questions and answers to be used in future license, certification, registration, employment, or academic examinations;

(6) records, the disclosure of which would impair governmental procurement proceedings or give an unfair advantage to any person proposing to enter into a contract or agreement with a governmental entity, except, subject to Subsections (1) and (2), that this Subsection (6) does not restrict the right of a person to have access to, after the contract or grant has been awarded and signed by all parties, a bid, proposal, application, or other

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

information submitted to or by a governmental entity in response to:

- (a) an invitation for bids;
- (b) a request for proposals;
- (c) a request for quotes;
- (d) a grant; or
- (e) other similar document;

(7) information submitted to or by a governmental entity in response to a request for information, except, subject to Subsections (1) and (2), that this Subsection (7) does not restrict the right of a person to have access to the information, after:

(a) a contract directly relating to the subject of the request for information has been awarded and signed by all parties; or

(b) (i) a final determination is made not to enter into a contract that relates to the subject of the request for information; and

(ii) at least two years have passed after the day on which the request for information is issued;

(8) records that would identify real property or the appraisal or estimated value of real or personal property, including intellectual property, under consideration for public acquisition before any rights to the property are acquired unless:

(a) public interest in obtaining access to the information is greater than or equal to the governmental entity's need to acquire the property on the best terms possible;

(b) the information has already been disclosed to persons not employed by or under a duty of confidentiality to the entity;

(c) in the case of records that would identify property, potential sellers of the described property have already learned of the governmental entity's plans to acquire the property;

(d) in the case of records that would identify the appraisal or estimated value of property, the potential sellers have already learned of the governmental entity's estimated value of the property; or

(e) the property under consideration for public acquisition is a single family residence and the governmental entity seeking to acquire the property has initiated negotiations to acquire the property as required under Section 78B-6-505;

(9) records prepared in contemplation of sale, exchange, lease, rental, or other

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

compensated transaction of real or personal property including intellectual property, which, if disclosed prior to completion of the transaction, would reveal the appraisal or estimated value of the subject property, unless:

(a) the public interest in access is greater than or equal to the interests in restricting access, including the governmental entity's interest in maximizing the financial benefit of the transaction; or

(b) when prepared by or on behalf of a governmental entity, appraisals or estimates of the value of the subject property have already been disclosed to persons not employed by or under a duty of confidentiality to the entity;

(10) records created or maintained for civil, criminal, or administrative enforcement purposes or audit purposes, or for discipline, licensing, certification, or registration purposes, if release of the records:

(a) reasonably could be expected to interfere with investigations undertaken for enforcement, discipline, licensing, certification, or registration purposes;

(b) reasonably could be expected to interfere with audits, disciplinary, or enforcement proceedings;

(c) would create a danger of depriving a person of a right to a fair trial or impartial hearing;

(d) reasonably could be expected to disclose the identity of a source who is not generally known outside of government and, in the case of a record compiled in the course of an investigation, disclose information furnished by a source not generally known outside of government if disclosure would compromise the source; or

(e) reasonably could be expected to disclose investigative or audit techniques, procedures, policies, or orders not generally known outside of government if disclosure would interfere with enforcement or audit efforts;

(11) records the disclosure of which would jeopardize the life or safety of an individual;

(12) records the disclosure of which would jeopardize the security of governmental property, governmental programs, or governmental recordkeeping systems from damage, theft, or other appropriation or use contrary to law or public policy;

(13) records that, if disclosed, would jeopardize the security or safety of a correctional

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

facility, or records relating to incarceration, treatment, probation, or parole, that would interfere with the control and supervision of an offender's incarceration, treatment, probation, or parole;

(14) records that, if disclosed, would reveal recommendations made to the Board of Pardons and Parole by an employee of or contractor for the Department of Corrections, the Board of Pardons and Parole, or the Department of Human Services that are based on the employee's or contractor's supervision, diagnosis, or treatment of any person within the board's jurisdiction;

(15) records and audit workpapers that identify audit, collection, and operational procedures and methods used by the State Tax Commission, if disclosure would interfere with audits or collections;

(16) records of a governmental audit agency relating to an ongoing or planned audit until the final audit is released;

(17) records that are subject to the attorney client privilege;

(18) records prepared for or by an attorney, consultant, surety, indemnitor, insurer, employee, or agent of a governmental entity for, or in anticipation of, litigation or a judicial, quasi-judicial, or administrative proceeding;

(19) (a) (i) personal files of a state legislator, including personal correspondence to or from a member of the Legislature; and

(ii) notwithstanding Subsection (19)(a)(i), correspondence that gives notice of legislative action or policy may not be classified as protected under this section; and

(b) (i) an internal communication that is part of the deliberative process in connection with the preparation of legislation between:

(A) members of a legislative body;

(B) a member of a legislative body and a member of the legislative body's staff; or

(C) members of a legislative body's staff; and

(ii) notwithstanding Subsection (19)(b)(i), a communication that gives notice of legislative action or policy may not be classified as protected under this section;

(20) (a) records in the custody or control of the Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel, that, if disclosed, would reveal a particular legislator's contemplated legislation or contemplated course of action before the legislator has elected to support the legislation or course of action, or made the legislation or course of action public; and

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

(b) notwithstanding Subsection (20)(a), the form to request legislation submitted to the Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel is a public document unless a legislator asks that the records requesting the legislation be maintained as protected records until such time as the legislator elects to make the legislation or course of action public;

(21) research requests from legislators to the Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel or the Office of the Legislative Fiscal Analyst and research findings prepared in response to these requests;

(22) drafts, unless otherwise classified as public;

(23) records concerning a governmental entity's strategy about:

(a) collective bargaining; or

(b) imminent or pending litigation;

(24) records of investigations of loss occurrences and analyses of loss occurrences that may be covered by the Risk Management Fund, the Employers' Reinsurance Fund, the Uninsured Employers' Fund, or similar divisions in other governmental entities;

(25) records, other than personnel evaluations, that contain a personal recommendation concerning an individual if disclosure would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy, or disclosure is not in the public interest;

(26) records that reveal the location of historic, prehistoric, paleontological, or biological resources that if known would jeopardize the security of those resources or of valuable historic, scientific, educational, or cultural information;

(27) records of independent state agencies if the disclosure of the records would conflict with the fiduciary obligations of the agency;

(28) records of an institution within the state system of higher education defined in Section 53B-1-102 regarding tenure evaluations, appointments, applications for admissions, retention decisions, and promotions, which could be properly discussed in a meeting closed in accordance with Title 52, Chapter 4, Open and Public Meetings Act, provided that records of the final decisions about tenure, appointments, retention, promotions, or those students admitted, may not be classified as protected under this section;

(29) records of the governor's office, including budget recommendations, legislative proposals, and policy statements, that if disclosed would reveal the governor's contemplated policies or contemplated courses of action before the governor has implemented or rejected

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

those policies or courses of action or made them public;

(30) records of the Office of the Legislative Fiscal Analyst relating to budget analysis, revenue estimates, and fiscal notes of proposed legislation before issuance of the final recommendations in these areas;

(31) records provided by the United States or by a government entity outside the state that are given to the governmental entity with a requirement that they be managed as protected records if the providing entity certifies that the record would not be subject to public disclosure if retained by it;

(32) transcripts, minutes, recordings, or reports of the closed portion of a meeting of a public body ~~fff~~except as provided in Section 52-4-206~~fff~~;

(33) records that would reveal the contents of settlement negotiations but not including final settlements or empirical data to the extent that they are not otherwise exempt from disclosure;

(34) memoranda prepared by staff and used in the decision-making process by an administrative law judge, a member of the Board of Pardons and Parole, or a member of any other body charged by law with performing a quasi-judicial function;

(35) records that would reveal negotiations regarding assistance or incentives offered by or requested from a governmental entity for the purpose of encouraging a person to expand or locate a business in Utah, but only if disclosure would result in actual economic harm to the person or place the governmental entity at a competitive disadvantage, but this section may not be used to restrict access to a record evidencing a final contract;

(36) materials to which access must be limited for purposes of securing or maintaining the governmental entity's proprietary protection of intellectual property rights including patents, copyrights, and trade secrets;

(37) the name of a donor or a prospective donor to a governmental entity, including an institution within the state system of higher education defined in Section 53B-1-102, and other information concerning the donation that could reasonably be expected to reveal the identity of the donor, provided that:

(a) the donor requests anonymity in writing;

(b) any terms, conditions, restrictions, or privileges relating to the donation may not be classified protected by the governmental entity under this Subsection (37); and

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

(c) except for an institution within the state system of higher education defined in Section 53B-1-102, the governmental unit to which the donation is made is primarily engaged in educational, charitable, or artistic endeavors, and has no regulatory or legislative authority over the donor, a member of the donor's immediate family, or any entity owned or controlled by the donor or the donor's immediate family;

(38) accident reports, except as provided in Sections 41-6a-404, 41-12a-202, and 73-18-13;

(39) a notification of workers' compensation insurance coverage described in Section 34A-2-205;

(40) (a) the following records of an institution within the state system of higher education defined in Section 53B-1-102, which have been developed, discovered, disclosed to, or received by or on behalf of faculty, staff, employees, or students of the institution:

(i) unpublished lecture notes;

(ii) unpublished notes, data, and information:

(A) relating to research; and

(B) of:

(I) the institution within the state system of higher education defined in Section 53B-1-102; or

(II) a sponsor of sponsored research;

(iii) unpublished manuscripts;

(iv) creative works in process;

(v) scholarly correspondence; and

(vi) confidential information contained in research proposals;

(b) Subsection (40)(a) may not be construed to prohibit disclosure of public information required pursuant to Subsection 53B-16-302(2)(a) or (b); and

(c) Subsection (40)(a) may not be construed to affect the ownership of a record;

(41) (a) records in the custody or control of the Office of Legislative Auditor General that would reveal the name of a particular legislator who requests a legislative audit prior to the date that audit is completed and made public; and

(b) notwithstanding Subsection (41)(a), a request for a legislative audit submitted to the Office of the Legislative Auditor General is a public document unless the legislator asks that

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

the records in the custody or control of the Office of Legislative Auditor General that would reveal the name of a particular legislator who requests a legislative audit be maintained as protected records until the audit is completed and made public;

(42) records that provide detail as to the location of an explosive, including a map or other document that indicates the location of:

(a) a production facility; or

(b) a magazine;

(43) information:

(a) contained in the statewide database of the Division of Aging and Adult Services created by Section 62A-3-311.1; or

(b) received or maintained in relation to the Identity Theft Reporting Information System (IRIS) established under Section 67-5-22;

(44) information contained in the Management Information System and Licensing Information System described in Title 62A, Chapter 4a, Child and Family Services;

(45) information regarding National Guard operations or activities in support of the National Guard's federal mission;

(46) records provided by any pawn or secondhand business to a law enforcement agency or to the central database in compliance with Title 13, Chapter 32a, Pawnshop and Secondhand Merchandise Transaction Information Act;

(47) information regarding food security, risk, and vulnerability assessments performed by the Department of Agriculture and Food;

(48) except to the extent that the record is exempt from this chapter pursuant to Section 63G-2-106, records related to an emergency plan or program, a copy of which is provided to or prepared or maintained by the Division of Emergency Management, and the disclosure of which would jeopardize:

(a) the safety of the general public; or

(b) the security of:

(i) governmental property;

(ii) governmental programs; or

(iii) the property of a private person who provides the Division of Emergency Management information;

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

(49) records of the Department of Agriculture and Food that provides for the identification, tracing, or control of livestock diseases, including any program established under Title 4, Chapter 24, Utah Livestock Brand and Anti-Theft Act, or Title 4, Chapter 31, Control of Animal Disease;

(50) as provided in Section 26-39-501:

(a) information or records held by the Department of Health related to a complaint regarding a child care program or residential child care which the department is unable to substantiate; and

(b) information or records related to a complaint received by the Department of Health from an anonymous complainant regarding a child care program or residential child care;

(51) unless otherwise classified as public under Section 63G-2-301 and except as provided under Section 41-1a-116, an individual's home address, home telephone number, or personal mobile phone number, if:

(a) the individual is required to provide the information in order to comply with a law, ordinance, rule, or order of a government entity; and

(b) the subject of the record has a reasonable expectation that this information will be kept confidential due to:

(i) the nature of the law, ordinance, rule, or order; and

(ii) the individual complying with the law, ordinance, rule, or order;

(52) the name, home address, work addresses, and telephone numbers of an individual that is engaged in, or that provides goods or services for, medical or scientific research that is:

(a) conducted within the state system of higher education, as defined in Section 53B-1-102; and

(b) conducted using animals;

(53) an initial proposal under Title 63N, Chapter 13, Part 2, Government Procurement Private Proposal Program, to the extent not made public by rules made under that chapter;

(54) in accordance with Section 78A-12-203, any record of the Judicial Performance Evaluation Commission concerning an individual commissioner's vote on whether or not to recommend that the voters retain a judge including information disclosed under Subsection 78A-12-203(5)(e);

(55) information collected and a report prepared by the Judicial Performance

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

Evaluation Commission concerning a judge, unless Section 20A-7-702 or Title 78A, Chapter 12, Judicial Performance Evaluation Commission Act, requires disclosure of, or makes public, the information or report;

(56) records contained in the Management Information System created in Section 62A-4a-1003;

(57) records provided or received by the Public Lands Policy Coordinating Office in furtherance of any contract or other agreement made in accordance with Section 63J-4-603;

(58) information requested by and provided to the 911 Division under Section 63H-7a-302;

(59) in accordance with Section 73-10-33:

(a) a management plan for a water conveyance facility in the possession of the Division of Water Resources or the Board of Water Resources; or

(b) an outline of an emergency response plan in possession of the state or a county or municipality;

(60) the following records in the custody or control of the Office of Inspector General of Medicaid Services, created in Section 63A-13-201:

(a) records that would disclose information relating to allegations of personal misconduct, gross mismanagement, or illegal activity of a person if the information or allegation cannot be corroborated by the Office of Inspector General of Medicaid Services through other documents or evidence, and the records relating to the allegation are not relied upon by the Office of Inspector General of Medicaid Services in preparing a final investigation report or final audit report;

(b) records and audit workpapers to the extent they would disclose the identity of a person who, during the course of an investigation or audit, communicated the existence of any Medicaid fraud, waste, or abuse, or a violation or suspected violation of a law, rule, or regulation adopted under the laws of this state, a political subdivision of the state, or any recognized entity of the United States, if the information was disclosed on the condition that the identity of the person be protected;

(c) before the time that an investigation or audit is completed and the final investigation or final audit report is released, records or drafts circulated to a person who is not an employee or head of a governmental entity for the person's response or information;

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

(d) records that would disclose an outline or part of any investigation, audit survey plan, or audit program; or

(e) requests for an investigation or audit, if disclosure would risk circumvention of an investigation or audit;

(61) records that reveal methods used by the Office of Inspector General of Medicaid Services, the fraud unit, or the Department of Health, to discover Medicaid fraud, waste, or abuse;

(62) information provided to the Department of Health or the Division of Occupational and Professional Licensing under Subsection 58-68-304(3) or (4);

(63) a record described in Section 63G-12-210;

(64) captured plate data that is obtained through an automatic license plate reader system used by a governmental entity as authorized in Section 41-6a-2003;

(65) any record in the custody of the Utah Office for Victims of Crime relating to a victim, including:

(a) a victim's application or request for benefits;

(b) a victim's receipt or denial of benefits; and

(c) any administrative notes or records made or created for the purpose of, or used to, evaluate or communicate a victim's eligibility for or denial of benefits from the Crime Victim Reparations Fund;

(66) an audio or video recording created by a body-worn camera, as that term is defined in Section 77-7a-103, that records sound or images inside a hospital or health care facility as those terms are defined in Section 78B-3-403, inside a clinic of a health care provider, as that term is defined in Section 78B-3-403, or inside a human service program as that term is defined in Subsection 62A-2-101(19)(a)(vi), except for recordings that:

(a) depict the commission of an alleged crime;

(b) record any encounter between a law enforcement officer and a person that results in death or bodily injury, or includes an instance when an officer fires a weapon;

(c) record any encounter that is the subject of a complaint or a legal proceeding against a law enforcement officer or law enforcement agency;

(d) contain an officer involved critical incident as defined in Subsection 76-2-408(1)(d); or

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

(e) have been requested for reclassification as a public record by a subject or authorized agent of a subject featured in the recording; and

(67) a record pertaining to the search process for a president of an institution of higher education described in Section 53B-2-102, except for application materials for a publicly announced finalist.

Section 5. Section **63G-2-403** is amended to read:

63G-2-403. Appeals to the records committee.

(1) (a) A records committee appellant appeals to the records committee by filing a notice of appeal with the executive secretary of the records committee no later than 30 days after the date of issuance of the decision being appealed.

(b) Notwithstanding Subsection (1)(a), a requester may file a notice of appeal with the executive secretary of the records committee no later than 45 days after the day on which the record request is made if:

- (i) the circumstances described in Subsection 63G-2-401(1)(b) occur; and
- (ii) the chief administrative officer fails to make a decision under Section 63G-2-401.

(2) The notice of appeal shall:

(a) contain the name, mailing address, and daytime telephone number of the records committee appellant;

(b) be accompanied by a copy of the decision being appealed; and

(c) state the relief sought.

(3) The records committee appellant:

(a) shall, on the day on which the notice of appeal is filed with the records committee, serve a copy of the notice of appeal on:

(i) the governmental entity whose access denial is the subject of the appeal, if the records committee appellant is a requester or interested party; or

(ii) the requester or interested party who is a party to the local appeals board proceeding that resulted in the decision that the political subdivision is appealing to the records committee, if the records committee appellant is a political subdivision; and

(b) may file a short statement of facts, reasons, and legal authority in support of the appeal.

(4) (a) Except as provided in Subsections (4)(b) and (c), no later than seven business

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

days after receiving a notice of appeal, the executive secretary of the records committee shall:

(i) schedule a hearing for the records committee to discuss the appeal at the next regularly scheduled committee meeting falling at least 16 days after the date the notice of appeal is filed but no longer than 64 calendar days after the date the notice of appeal was filed except that the records committee may schedule an expedited hearing upon application of the records committee appellant and good cause shown;

(ii) send a copy of the notice of hearing to the records committee appellant; and

(iii) send a copy of the notice of appeal, supporting statement, and a notice of hearing

to:

(A) each member of the records committee;

(B) the records officer and the chief administrative officer of the governmental entity whose access denial is the subject of the appeal, if the records committee appellant is a requester or interested party;

(C) any person who made a business confidentiality claim under Section 63G-2-309 for a record that is the subject of the appeal; and

(D) all persons who participated in the proceedings before the governmental entity's chief administrative officer, if the appeal is of the chief administrative officer's decision affirming an access denial.

(b) (i) The executive secretary of the records committee may decline to schedule a hearing if the record series that is the subject of the appeal has been found by the committee in a previous hearing involving the same governmental entity to be appropriately classified as private, controlled, or protected.

(ii) (A) If the executive secretary of the records committee declines to schedule a hearing, the executive secretary of the records committee shall send a notice to the records committee appellant indicating that the request for hearing has been denied and the reason for the denial.

(B) The committee shall make rules to implement this section as provided by Title 63G, Chapter 3, Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act.

(c) The executive secretary of the records committee may schedule a hearing on an appeal to the records committee at a regularly scheduled records committee meeting that is later than the period described in Subsection (4)(a)(i) if that records committee meeting is the

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

first regularly scheduled records committee meeting at which there are fewer than 10 appeals scheduled to be heard.

(5) (a) No later than five business days before the hearing, a governmental entity shall submit to the executive secretary of the records committee a written statement of facts, reasons, and legal authority in support of the governmental entity's position.

(b) The governmental entity shall send a copy of the written statement by first class mail, postage prepaid, to the requester or interested party involved in the appeal. The executive secretary shall forward a copy of the written statement to each member of the records committee.

(6) (a) No later than 10 business days after the notice of appeal is sent by the executive secretary, a person whose legal interests may be substantially affected by the proceeding may file a request for intervention before the records committee.

(b) Any written statement of facts, reasons, and legal authority in support of the intervener's position shall be filed with the request for intervention.

(c) The person seeking intervention shall provide copies of the statement described in Subsection (6)(b) to all parties to the proceedings before the records committee.

(7) The records committee shall hold a hearing within the period of time described in Subsection (4).

(8) At the hearing, the records committee shall allow the parties to testify, present evidence, and comment on the issues. The records committee may allow other interested persons to comment on the issues.

(9) (a) (i) The records committee:

(A) may review the disputed records; and

(B) shall review the disputed records, if the committee is weighing the various interests under Subsection (11).

(ii) A review of the disputed records under Subsection (9)(a)(i) shall be in camera.

(b) Members of the records committee may not disclose any information or record reviewed by the committee in camera unless the disclosure is otherwise authorized by this chapter.

(10) (a) Discovery is prohibited, but the records committee may issue subpoenas or other orders to compel production of necessary evidence.

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

(b) When the subject of a records committee subpoena disobeys or fails to comply with the subpoena, the records committee may file a motion for an order to compel obedience to the subpoena with the district court.

(c) (i) The records committee's review shall be de novo, if the appeal is an appeal from a decision of a chief administrative officer:

(A) issued under Section 63G-2-401; or

(B) issued by a chief administrative officer of a political subdivision that has not established a local appeals board.

(ii) For an appeal from a decision of a local appeals board, the records committee shall review and consider the decision of the local appeals board.

(11) (a) No later than seven business days after the hearing, the records committee shall issue a signed order:

(i) granting the relief sought, in whole or in part; or

(ii) upholding the governmental entity's access denial, in whole or in part.

(b) Except as provided in Section 63G-2-406, the records committee may, upon consideration and weighing of the various interests and public policies pertinent to the classification and disclosure or nondisclosure, order the disclosure of information properly classified as private, controlled, or protected if the public interest favoring access is greater than or equal to the interest favoring restriction of access.

(c) In making a determination under Subsection (11)(b), the records committee shall consider and, where appropriate, limit the requester's or interested party's use and further disclosure of the record in order to protect:

(i) privacy interests in the case of a private or controlled record;

(ii) business confidentiality interests in the case of a record protected under Subsection 63G-2-305(1), (2), (40)(a)(ii), or (40)(a)(vi); and

(iii) privacy interests or the public interest in the case of other protected records.

(12) The order of the records committee shall include:

(a) a statement of reasons for the decision, including citations to this chapter, court rule or order, another state statute, federal statute, or federal regulation that governs disclosure of the record, if the citations do not disclose private, controlled, or protected information;

(b) a description of the record or portions of the record to which access was ordered or

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

denied, if the description does not disclose private, controlled, or protected information or information exempt from disclosure under Subsection 63G-2-201(3)(b);

(c) a statement that any party to the proceeding before the records committee may appeal the records committee's decision to district court; and

(d) a brief summary of the appeals process, the time limits for filing an appeal, and a notice that in order to protect its rights on appeal, the party may wish to seek advice from an attorney.

(13) If the records committee fails to issue a decision within 73 calendar days of the filing of the notice of appeal, that failure is the equivalent of an order denying the appeal. A records committee appellant shall notify the records committee in writing if the records committee appellant considers the appeal denied.

(14) A party to a proceeding before the records committee may seek judicial review in district court of a records committee order by filing a petition for review of the records committee order as provided in Section 63G-2-404.

(15) (a) Unless a notice of intent to appeal is filed under Subsection (15)(b), each party to the proceeding shall comply with the order of the records committee.

(b) If a party disagrees with the order of the records committee, that party may file a notice of intent to appeal the order of the records committee.

(c) If the records committee orders the governmental entity to produce a record and no appeal is filed, or if, as a result of the appeal, the governmental entity is required to produce a record, the governmental entity shall:

(i) produce the record; and

(ii) file a notice of compliance with the records committee.

(d) (i) If the governmental entity that is ordered to produce a record fails to file a notice of compliance or a notice of intent to appeal, the records committee may do either or both of the following:

(A) impose a civil penalty of up to \$500 for each day of continuing noncompliance; or

(B) send written notice of the governmental entity's noncompliance to[:] the governor.

~~[(F) the governor for executive branch entities;]~~

~~[(H) the Legislative Management Committee for legislative branch entities; and]~~

~~[(HH) the Judicial Council for judicial branch agencies entities.]~~

SB0137S01 compared with SB0137

(ii) In imposing a civil penalty, the records committee shall consider the gravity and circumstances of the violation, including whether the failure to comply was due to neglect or was willful or intentional.

~~{ Section 6. Section 63G-2-406 is amended to read:~~

~~—— 63G-2-406. Evidentiary standards for release of certain records:~~

~~—— (1) A record that is classified as protected under Subsection 63G-2-305(10), (17), (18), (23), (24), or (33) may be ordered to be disclosed under the provisions of Subsection 63G-2-401(6), 63G-2-403(11)(b), or 63G-2-404(7)(a) only if the person or party seeking disclosure of the record has established, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the public interest favoring access is equal to or greater than the interest favoring restriction of access:~~

~~—— (2) A record that is classified as protected under Subsection 63G-2-305(11) may be ordered to be disclosed under the provisions of Subsection 63G-2-401(6), 63G-2-403(11)(b), or 63G-2-404(7) only if the person or party seeking disclosure of the record has established, by clear and convincing evidence, that the public interest favoring access is equal to or greater than the interest favoring restriction of access:~~

~~—— (3) A record classified as protected under Subsection 63G-2-305(32) may not be disclosed unless the person seeking disclosure establishes clearly and convincingly that the public interest favoring disclosure substantially outweighs the interests favoring restriction of access.~~

Legislative Review Note

Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel