

# HB0064S01 compared with HB0064

~~text~~ shows text that was in HB0064 but was deleted in HB0064S01.

inserted text shows text that was not in HB0064 but was inserted into HB0064S01.

**DISCLAIMER:** This document is provided to assist you in your comparison of the two bills. Sometimes this automated comparison will NOT be completely accurate. Therefore, you need to read the actual bills. This automatically generated document could contain inaccuracies caused by: limitations of the compare program; bad input data; or other causes.

Representative Mark A. Wheatley proposes the following substitute bill:

## FACTUAL INNOCENCE PAYMENTS AMENDMENTS

2021 GENERAL SESSION

STATE OF UTAH

**Chief Sponsor: Mark A. Wheatley**

Senate Sponsor: \_\_\_\_\_

---

### LONG TITLE

#### General Description:

This bill amends provisions regarding payments for individuals who are found factually innocent by a court.

#### Highlighted Provisions:

This bill:

- ▶ allows the State Commission of Criminal and Juvenile Justice to pay an individual who is found factually innocent by a court in one lump payment; and
- ▶ makes technical and conforming changes.

#### Money Appropriated in this Bill:

None

#### Other Special Clauses:

None

## HB0064S01 compared with HB0064

### Utah Code Sections Affected:

#### AMENDS:

**78B-9-402**, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2013, Chapter 46

**78B-9-405**, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2012, Chapter 220

---

---

*Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:*

Section 1. Section **78B-9-402** is amended to read:

**78B-9-402. Petition for determination of factual innocence -- Sufficient allegations -- Notification of victim -- Payment to surviving spouse.**

(1) A person who has been convicted of a felony offense may petition the district court in the county in which the person was convicted for a hearing to establish that the person is factually innocent of the crime or crimes of which the person was convicted.

(2) (a) The petition shall contain an assertion of factual innocence under oath by the petitioner and shall aver, with supporting affidavits or other credible documents, that:

(i) newly discovered material evidence exists that, if credible, establishes that the petitioner is factually innocent;

(ii) the specific evidence identified by the petitioner in the petition establishes innocence;

(iii) the material evidence is not merely cumulative of evidence that was known;

(iv) the material evidence is not merely impeachment evidence; and

(v) viewed with all the other evidence, the newly discovered evidence demonstrates that the petitioner is factually innocent.

(b) The court shall review the petition in accordance with the procedures in Subsection (9)(b), and make a finding that the petition has satisfied the requirements of Subsection (2)(a). If the court finds the petition does not meet all the requirements of Subsection (2)(a), it shall dismiss the petition without prejudice and send notice of the dismissal to the petitioner and the attorney general.

(3) (a) The petition shall also contain an averment that:

(i) neither the petitioner nor the petitioner's counsel knew of the evidence at the time of trial or sentencing or in time to include the evidence in any previously filed post-trial motion or postconviction motion, and the evidence could not have been discovered by the petitioner or

## HB0064S01 compared with HB0064

the petitioner's counsel through the exercise of reasonable diligence; or

(ii) a court has found ineffective assistance of counsel for failing to exercise reasonable diligence in uncovering the evidence.

(b) Upon entry of a finding that the petition is sufficient under Subsection (2)(a), the court shall then review the petition to determine if Subsection (3)(a) has been satisfied. If the court finds that the requirements of Subsection (3)(a) have not been satisfied, it may dismiss the petition without prejudice and give notice to the petitioner and the attorney general of the dismissal, or the court may waive the requirements of Subsection (3)(a) if the court finds the petition should proceed to hearing based upon the strength of the petition, and that there is other evidence that could have been discovered through the exercise of reasonable diligence by the petitioner or the petitioner's counsel at trial, and the other evidence:

- (i) was not discovered by the petitioner or the petitioner's counsel;
- (ii) is material upon the issue of factual innocence; and
- (iii) has never been presented to a court.

(4) If the conviction for which the petitioner asserts factual innocence was based upon a plea of guilty, the petition shall contain the specific nature and content of the evidence that establishes factual innocence. The court shall review the evidence and may dismiss the petition at any time in the course of the proceedings, if the court finds that the evidence of factual innocence relies solely upon the recantation of testimony or prior statements made by a witness against the petitioner, and the recantation appears to the court to be equivocal or self-serving.

(5) A person who has already obtained postconviction relief that vacated or reversed the person's conviction or sentence may also file a petition under this part in the same manner and form as described above, if no retrial or appeal regarding this offense is pending.

(6) If some or all of the evidence alleged to be exonerating is biological evidence subject to DNA testing, the petitioner shall seek DNA testing pursuant to Section 78B-9-301.

(7) Except as provided in Subsection (9), the petition and all subsequent proceedings shall be in compliance with and governed by Rule 65C, Utah Rules of Civil Procedure, and shall include the underlying criminal case number.

(8) After a petition is filed under this section, prosecutors, law enforcement officers, and crime laboratory personnel shall cooperate in preserving evidence and in determining the sufficiency of the chain of custody of the evidence which is the subject of the petition.

## **HB0064S01 compared with HB0064**

(9) (a) A person who files a petition under this section shall serve notice of the petition and a copy of the petition upon the office of the prosecutor who obtained the conviction and upon the Utah attorney general.

(b) The assigned judge shall conduct an initial review of the petition. If it is apparent to the court that the petitioner is either merely relitigating facts, issues, or evidence presented in previous proceedings or presenting issues that appear frivolous or speculative on their face, the court shall dismiss the petition, state the basis for the dismissal, and serve notice of dismissal upon the petitioner and the attorney general. If, upon completion of the initial review, the court does not dismiss the petition, it shall order the attorney general to file a response to the petition. The attorney general shall, within 30 days after receipt of the court's order, or within any additional period of time the court allows, answer or otherwise respond to all proceedings initiated under this part.

(c) After the time for response by the attorney general under Subsection (9)(b) has passed, the court shall order a hearing if it finds the petition meets the requirements of Subsections (2) and (3) and finds there is a bona fide and compelling issue of factual innocence regarding the charges of which the petitioner was convicted. No bona fide and compelling issue of factual innocence exists if the petitioner is merely relitigating facts, issues, or evidence presented in a previous proceeding or if the petitioner is unable to identify with sufficient specificity the nature and reliability of the newly discovered evidence that establishes the petitioner's factual innocence.

(d) If the parties stipulate that the evidence establishes that the petitioner is factually innocent, the court may find the petitioner is factually innocent without holding a hearing. If the state will not stipulate that the evidence establishes that the petitioner is factually innocent, no determination of factual innocence may be made by the court without first holding a hearing under this part.

(10) The court may not grant a petition for a hearing under this part during the period in which criminal proceedings in the matter are pending before any trial or appellate court, unless stipulated to by the parties.

(11) Any victim of a crime that is the subject of a petition under this part, and who has elected to receive notice under Section 77-38-3, shall be notified by the state's attorney of any hearing regarding the petition.

## HB0064S01 compared with HB0064

(12) A petition to determine factual innocence under this part, or Part 3, Postconviction Testing of DNA, shall be filed separately from any petition for postconviction relief under Part 1, General Provisions. Separate petitions may be filed simultaneously in the same court.

(13) The procedures governing the filing and adjudication of a petition to determine factual innocence apply to all petitions currently filed or pending in the district court and any new petitions filed on or after June 1, 2012.

(14) (a) As used in this Subsection (14) and in Subsection (15):

(i) "Married" means the legal marital relationship established between a man and a woman and as recognized by the laws of this state; and

(ii) "Spouse" means a person married to the petitioner at the time the petitioner was found guilty of the offense regarding which a petition is filed and who has since then been continuously married to the petitioner until the petitioner's death.

(b) A claim for determination of factual innocence under this part is not extinguished upon the death of the petitioner.

(c) (i) If any payments are already being made to the petitioner under this part at the time of the death of the petitioner, or if the finding of factual innocence occurs after the death of the petitioner, the payments due under Section 78B-9-405 shall be paid [~~according to the schedule under~~] in accordance with Section 78B-9-405 to the petitioner's surviving spouse.

(ii) Payments cease upon the death of the spouse.

(15) The spouse under Subsection (14) forfeits all rights to receive any payment under this part if the spouse is charged with a homicide established by a preponderance of the evidence that meets the elements of any felony homicide offense in Title 76, Chapter 5, Offenses Against the Person, except automobile homicide, applying the same principles of culpability and defenses as in Title 76, Utah Criminal Code, including Title 76, Chapter 2, Principles of Criminal Responsibility.

Section 2. Section **78B-9-405** is amended to read:

**78B-9-405. Judgment and assistance payment.**

(1) As used in this section:

(a) "Felony" means a criminal offense classified as a felony under Title 76, Chapter 3, Punishments, or conduct that would constitute a felony if committed in Utah.

(b) "Petitioner" means a United States citizen or an individual who was otherwise

## HB0064S01 compared with HB0064

lawfully present in this country at the time of the incident that gave rise to the underlying conviction.

~~[(1)(a)]~~ (2) (a) If a court finds a petitioner factually innocent under Part 3, Postconviction Testing of DNA, or under this part, and if the petitioner has served a period of incarceration, the court shall order that ~~[, as provided in Subsection ~~{(1)}(2) ~~{(3)}~~~~~~, the petitioner shall the petitioner receive for each year or portion of a year the petitioner was incarcerated, up to a maximum of 15 years, the monetary equivalent of the average annual nonagricultural payroll wage in Utah, as determined by the data most recently published by the Department of Workforce Services at the time of the petitioner's release from prison.

~~[(b) As used in this Subsection (1), "petitioner" means a United States citizen or an individual who was otherwise lawfully present in this country at the time of the incident that gave rise to the underlying conviction.]~~

~~[(2) Payments pursuant to this section shall be made as follows:]~~

(b) The court's determination of the monetary equivalent of the average annual nonagricultural payroll wage shall be included in the order declaring that the petitioner is factually innocent.

~~(3) ~~{(a)}~~~~ If a court orders that a petitioner is to receive payment under Subsection ~~(2)~~:

~~{(a)}~~ ~~[The] ~~{(i)}~~~~ the Utah Office for Victims of Crime shall pay from the Crime Victim Reparations Fund to the petitioner within 45 days of the court order under Subsection ~~[(1)] (2)~~ an initial sum equal to either 20% of the total financial assistance payment as determined under Subsection ~~[(1)] (2)~~ or an amount equal to two years of incarceration, whichever is greater, but not to exceed the total amount owed[-];

~~{(b)}~~ ~~[The] ~~{(ii)}~~~~ the Legislature shall appropriate as nonlapsing funds from the General Fund, and no later than the next general session following the issuance of the court order under Subsection ~~[(1)] (2)~~:

~~{(i)}~~ ~~{(A)}~~ to the Crime Victim Reparations Fund, the amount that was paid out of the fund under Subsection ~~[(2)(a)] (3)(a) ~~{(i)}~~~~; and

~~{(ii)}~~ ~~{(B)}~~ to the State Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice, as a separate line item, the amount ordered by the court for payments under Subsection ~~[(1)] (2)~~, minus the amount reimbursed to the Crime Victim Reparations Fund under Subsection ~~[(2)(b)(i)]~~

(3)(~~{a}~~)(~~{b}~~)(~~{ii}~~)(~~{A}~~)(~~{i}~~); and

## HB0064S01 compared with HB0064

~~[(c) Payments to the petitioner under this section, other than the payment under Subsection (2)(a), shall be made by the Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice quarterly on or before the last day of the month next succeeding each calendar quarterly period.]~~

~~(~~(iii)~~c) the State Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice shall pay the amount ordered by the court under Subsection (2), minus the amount paid by the Utah Office for Victims of Crime under Subsection (3)(a), to the petitioner:~~

~~(~~(A)~~i) quarterly on or before the last day of the month next succeeding each calendar quarterly period; or~~

~~(~~(B)~~ii) in one lump sum payment ~~{within 90 days}~~ no later than the next succeeding July 31 after the day on which the court ordered the payment ~~{ under Subsection (3)(a)(i) is made}~~.~~

~~(~~(b)~~4) (~~(i)~~a) For a payment under Subsection (3)(~~(a)~~(~~(iii)~~c):~~

~~(~~(A)~~i) the petitioner shall choose ~~{ whether the payment is disbursed under Subsection (3)(a)(iii)(A) or (B)}~~, within 90 days after the day on which the payment under Subsection (3)(a)(~~(i)~~) is made, whether the payment is disbursed under Subsection (3)(c)(i) or (ii); and~~

~~(~~(B)~~ii) the State Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice shall disburse the payment in accordance with the petitioner's choice under Subsection (~~(3)4~~)(~~(b)~~a)(i)(~~(A)~~).~~

~~(~~(iii)~~b) If the petitioner fails to make a choice under Subsection (~~(3)4~~)(~~(b)~~a)(i)(~~(A)~~) within 90 days after the day on which the payment under Subsection (3)(a)(~~(i)~~) is made, the State Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice shall pay the amount under Subsection (3)(~~(a)~~(~~(iii)~~c) in accordance with Subsection (3)(~~(a)~~(~~(iii)~~A).~~

~~— ~~(d)~~ (~~4~~c)(i).~~

(c) (i) If a court ordered a petitioner to receive a payment under this section on or before May 5, 2021, the petitioner may request that the State Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice disburse the remaining balance of the payment owed to the petitioner under Subsection (3)(c) in one lump sum payment.

(ii) If a petitioner submits a request under Subsection (4)(c)(i), the State Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice shall disburse the remaining balance of the payment owed to the petitioner in one lump sum payment.

~~(~~(d)~~ (5) Payments under Subsection [~~(2)~~(c)] (3)(~~(a)~~c)(~~(iii)~~A)i) shall:~~

~~(~~(i)~~) (a) commence no later than one year after the effective date of the appropriation~~

## HB0064S01 compared with HB0064

for the payments;

~~[(ii)]~~ ~~(b)~~ be made to the petitioner for the balance of the amount ordered by the court after the initial payment under Subsection ~~[(2)(a)]~~ ~~(3)(a)~~ ~~[(ii)]~~; and

~~[(iii)]~~ ~~(c)~~ be allocated so that the entire amount due to the petitioner under this section has been paid no later than 10 years after the effective date of the appropriation made under Subsection ~~[(2)(b)]~~ ~~(3)~~ ~~(a)~~ ~~[(ii)]~~ ~~(b)~~.

~~[(3)]~~ ~~[(5)6]~~ (a) Payments ~~[pursuant to]~~ under this section shall be reduced to the extent that the period of incarceration for which the petitioner seeks payment was attributable to a separate and lawful conviction.

(b) ~~[(i)]~~ Payments ~~[pursuant to this section shall]~~ under this section shall:

(i) be tolled upon the commencement of any period of incarceration due to the petitioner's subsequent conviction of a felony ~~[and shall]~~; and

(ii) resume upon the conclusion of that period of incarceration.

~~[(ii) As used in this section, "felony" means a criminal offense classified as a felony under Title 76, Chapter 3, Punishments, or conduct that would constitute a felony if committed in Utah.]~~

(c) The reduction of payments ~~[pursuant to]~~ under Subsection ~~[(3)]~~ ~~[(5)6]~~(a) or the tolling of payments pursuant to Subsection ~~[(3)]~~ ~~[(5)6]~~(b) shall be determined by the same court that finds a petitioner to be factually innocent under Part 3, Postconviction Testing of DNA, or this part.

~~[(4)]~~ ~~[(6)7]~~ (a) ~~[A person]~~ An individual is ineligible for any payments under this part if the ~~[person]~~ individual was already serving a prison sentence in another jurisdiction at the time of the conviction of the crime for which that ~~[person]~~ individual has been found factually innocent ~~[pursuant to]~~ in accordance with Part 3, Postconviction Testing of DNA, or this part, and that ~~[person]~~ individual is to be returned to that other jurisdiction upon release for further incarceration on the prior conviction.

(b) Ineligibility for any payments ~~[pursuant to this Subsection (4)]~~ under this Subsection ~~[(6)7]~~ shall be determined by the same court that finds ~~[a person]~~ an individual to be factually innocent under Part 3, Postconviction Testing of DNA, or this part.

~~[(5)]~~ ~~[(7)8]~~ Payments ~~[pursuant to]~~ under this section:

(a) are not subject to any Utah state taxes; and

## HB0064S01 compared with HB0064

(b) may not be offset by any expenses incurred by the state or any political subdivision of the state, including expenses incurred to secure the petitioner's custody, or to feed, clothe, or provide medical services for the petitioner.

~~[(6)]~~ ~~(8)~~ (9) If a court finds a petitioner to be factually innocent under Part 3, Postconviction Testing of DNA, or this part, the court shall also:

(a) issue an order of expungement of the petitioner's criminal record for all acts in the charging document upon which the payment under this part is based; and

(b) provide a letter to the petitioner explaining that the petitioner's conviction has been vacated on the grounds of factual innocence and indicating that the petitioner did not commit the crime or crimes for which the petitioner was convicted and was later found to be factually innocent under Part 3, Postconviction Testing of DNA, or this part.

~~[(7)]~~ ~~(9)~~ (10) A petitioner found to be factually innocent under Part 3, Postconviction Testing of DNA, or this part shall have access to the same services and programs available to Utah citizens generally as though the conviction for which the petitioner was found to be factually innocent had never occurred.

~~[(8)]~~ ~~(10)~~ (11) (a) Payments ~~[pursuant to]~~ under this part constitute a full and conclusive resolution of the petitioner's claims on the specific issue of factual innocence.

(b) Pre-judgment interest may not be awarded in addition to the payments provided under this part.