

SJR008S01 compared with SJR008

~~text~~ shows text that was in SJR008 but was deleted in SJR008S01.

text shows text that was not in SJR008 but was inserted into SJR008S01.

DISCLAIMER: This document is provided to assist you in your comparison of the two bills. Sometimes this automated comparison will NOT be completely accurate. Therefore, you need to read the actual bills. This automatically generated document could contain inaccuracies caused by: limitations of the compare program; bad input data; or other causes.

Senator Todd D. Weiler proposes the following substitute bill:

JOINT RESOLUTION AMENDING RULES OF CRIMINAL PROCEDURE ON APPOINTMENT OF COUNSEL

2022 GENERAL SESSION

STATE OF UTAH

Chief Sponsor: Todd D. Weiler

House Sponsor: _____

LONG TITLE

General Description:

This joint resolution amends the Utah Rules of Criminal Procedure, Rule 8, regarding the appointment of counsel.

Highlighted Provisions:

This resolution:

- ▶ amends the Utah Rules of Criminal Procedure, Rule 8, regarding the appointment of counsel in a capital case; and
- ▶ makes technical and conforming changes.

Special Clauses:

This resolution provides a ~~special~~contingent effective date.

SJR008S01 compared with SJR008

Utah Rules of Criminal Procedure Affected:

AMENDS:

Rule 8, Utah ~~Code~~ Rules of Criminal Procedure

Be it resolved by the Legislature of the state of Utah, two-thirds of all members elected to each of the two houses voting in favor thereof:

As provided in Utah Constitution Article VIII, Section 4, the Legislature may amend rules of procedure and evidence adopted by the Utah Supreme Court upon a two-thirds vote of all members of both houses of the Legislature:

Section 1. **Rule 8**, Utah ~~Code~~ Rules of Criminal Procedure is amended to read:

Rule 8. Appointment of counsel.

(a) **Right to counsel.** A defendant charged with a public offense has the right to self-representation, and if indigent, has the right to court-appointed counsel if the defendant faces any possibility of the deprivation of liberty.

(b) ~~[Capital case qualifications]~~ **Qualifications for aggravated murder case.**

(b) (1) In all cases in which counsel is appointed to represent an indigent defendant who is charged with an offense for ~~[which the punishment may be death]~~ aggravated murder, the court ~~[shall]~~ must:

(b) (1) (A) appoint two or more attorneys to represent such defendant ~~[and shall]; and~~

(b) (1) (B) make a finding on the record based on the requirements set forth below that appointed counsel is competent in the trial of ~~[capital]~~ aggravated murder cases.

(b) (2) In making ~~[its]~~ the court's determination, the court ~~[shall]~~ must ensure that the experience of counsel who are under consideration for appointment have met the following minimum requirements:

~~[(b)-(1)]~~ (b) (2) (A) at least one of the appointed attorneys must have tried to verdict six felony cases within the past four years or twenty-five felony cases total;

(b) (2) (B) at least one of the appointed attorneys must have appeared as counsel or co-counsel in ~~[a capital or]~~ a felony homicide case which was tried to a jury and which went to final verdict;

~~[(b)-(3)]~~ (b) (2) (C) at least one of the appointed attorneys must have completed or taught within the past five years an approved continuing legal education course or courses at

SJR008S01 compared with SJR008

least eight hours of which deal, in substantial part, with the trial of ~~[death penalty]~~ homicide cases; and

~~[(b)-(4)]~~ (b) (2) (D) the experience of one of the appointed attorneys must total not less than five years in the active practice of law.

(c) ~~[Capital case]~~ Aggravated murder case appointment considerations. In making ~~[its]~~ the court's selection of attorneys for appointment in ~~[a capital]~~ an aggravated murder case, the court should also consider at least the following factors:

(c) (1) whether one or more of the attorneys under consideration have previously appeared as counsel or co-counsel in ~~[a capital]~~ an aggravated murder case;

(c) (2) the extent to which the attorneys under consideration have sufficient time and support and can dedicate those resources to the representation of the defendant in the ~~[capital]~~ aggravated murder case now pending before the court with undivided loyalty to the defendant;

(c) (3) the extent to which the attorneys under consideration have engaged in the active practice of criminal law in the past five years;

(c) (4) the diligence, competency, the total workload, and ability of the attorneys being considered; and

(c) (5) any other factor which may be relevant to a determination that counsel to be appointed will fairly, efficiently and effectively provide representation to the defendant.

(d) ~~[Capital case]~~ Aggravated murder appeals.

~~(d) (1)~~ In all cases where an indigent defendant ~~[is sentenced to death]~~ has been convicted and sentenced for aggravated murder, the court ~~[shall]~~ must:

~~(d) (1) (A)~~ appoint one or more attorneys to represent such defendant on appeal ~~[and shall]; and~~

~~(d) (1) (B)~~ make a finding that counsel is competent in the appeal of ~~[capital]~~ aggravated murder cases. ~~[To be found competent to represent on appeal persons sentenced to death, the combined experience of the appointed attorneys must meet the following requirements:]~~

~~(d) (2)~~ To be found competent to represent an indigent defendant convicted and sentenced for aggravated murder on appeal:

~~[(d)-(1)]~~ (d) (2) (A) at least one ~~[attorney]~~ of the appointed attorneys must have served as counsel in at least three felony appeals; and

SJR008S01 compared with SJR008

~~[(d)(2)]~~ (d)(2)(B) at least one ~~[attorney]~~ of the appointed attorneys must have attended and completed within the past five years an approved continuing legal education course which deals, in substantial part, with the trial or appeal of ~~[death penalty]~~ homicide cases.

(e) **Post-conviction cases.**

(e)(1) In all cases in which counsel is appointed to represent an indigent petitioner pursuant to Utah Code [~~§ 78B-9-202(2)(a)~~] section 78B-9-202, the court ~~[shall]~~ must:

(e)(1)(A) appoint one or more attorneys to represent such petitioner at post-conviction trial and on post-conviction appeal ~~[and shall]~~; and

(e)(1)(B) make a finding that counsel is qualified to represent persons sentenced to death in post-conviction cases.

(e)(2) To be found qualified, the combined experience of the appointed attorneys must meet the following requirements:

~~[(e)(1)]~~ (e)(2)(A) at least one of the appointed attorneys must have served as counsel in at least three felony or post-conviction appeals;

(e)(2)(B) at least one of the appointed attorneys must have appeared as counsel or co-counsel in a post-conviction case at the evidentiary hearing, on appeal, or otherwise demonstrated proficiency in the area of post-conviction litigation;

~~[(e)(3)]~~ (e)(2)(C) at least one of the appointed attorneys must have attended and completed or taught within the past five years an approved continuing legal education course which dealt, in substantial part, with the trial and appeal of death penalty cases or with the prosecution or defense of post-conviction proceedings in death penalty cases;

~~[(e)(4)]~~ (e)(2)(D) at least one of the appointed attorneys must have tried to judgment or verdict three civil jury or felony cases within the past four years or ten cases total; and

~~[(e)(5)]~~ (e)(2)(E) the experience of at least one of the appointed attorneys must total not less than five years in the active practice of law.

(f) **Appointing from appellate roster.** When appointing counsel for an indigent defendant on appeal from a court of record, the court must select an attorney from the appellate roster maintained by the Board of Appellate Judges under rule 11-401 of the Utah Rules of Judicial Administration, subject to any exemptions established by that rule.

(g) **Noncompliance.** Mere noncompliance with this rule or failure to follow the

SJR008S01 compared with SJR008

guidelines set forth in this rule [~~shall~~] may not of itself be grounds for establishing that appointed counsel ineffectively represented the defendant at trial or on appeal.

(h) (1) Cost and [~~attorneys'~~] attorney fees for appointed counsel [~~shall~~] must be paid as described in [~~Chapter 22 of Title 78B~~] Title 78B, Chapter 22, Indigent Defense Act, of the Utah Code.

(h) (2) Costs and [~~attorneys~~] attorney fees for post-conviction counsel [~~shall~~] must be paid pursuant to Utah Code [~~§ 78B-9-202(2)(a)~~] section 78B-9-202.

Section 2. ~~{Effective}~~ Contingent effective date.

This resolution takes effect upon approval by a constitutional two-thirds vote of all members elected to each house only if H.B. 147, Death Penalty Modifications (2022 General Session), passes the Legislature and becomes law on May 4, 2022.