

HB0509S01 compared with HB0509

~~{deleted text}~~ shows text that was in HB0509 but was deleted in HB0509S01.

inserted text shows text that was not in HB0509 but was inserted into HB0509S01.

DISCLAIMER: This document is provided to assist you in your comparison of the two bills. Sometimes this automated comparison will NOT be completely accurate. Therefore, you need to read the actual bills. This automatically generated document could contain inaccuracies caused by: limitations of the compare program; bad input data; or other causes.

Representative Andrew Stoddard proposes the following substitute bill:

CRIMINAL PROTECTIVE ORDER AMENDMENTS

2023 GENERAL SESSION

STATE OF UTAH

Chief Sponsor: Andrew Stoddard

Senate Sponsor: _____

LONG TITLE

General Description:

This bill modifies provisions related to criminal protective orders.

Highlighted Provisions:

This bill:

- ▶ modifies definitions;
- ▶ allows a victim to request a hearing regarding a continuous protective order for domestic violence;
- ▶ requires notice to be provided to a victim ~~{or perpetrator}~~ for a hearing regarding a continuous protective order; and
- ▶ includes criminal protective order hearings as "important criminal justice hearings."

Money Appropriated in this Bill:

None

HB0509S01 compared with HB0509

Other Special Clauses:

None

Utah Code Sections Affected:

AMENDS:

77-38-2, as last amended by Laws of Utah 1997, Chapter 103

77-38-3, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2022, Chapters 133, 430

77-38-4, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2011, Chapter 28

78B-7-804, as last amended by Laws of Utah 2021, Chapters 159, 260 and last amended by Coordination Clause, Laws of Utah 2021, Chapter 159

Be it enacted by the Legislature of the state of Utah:

Section 1. Section **77-38-2** is amended to read:

77-38-2. Definitions.

For the purposes of this chapter and the Utah Constitution:

- (1) "Abuse" means treating the crime victim in a manner so as to injure, damage, or disparage.
- (2) "Dignity" means treating the crime victim with worthiness, honor, and esteem.
- (3) "Fairness" means treating the crime victim reasonably, even-handedly, and impartially.
- (4) "Harassment" means treating the crime victim in a persistently annoying manner.
- (5) "Important criminal justice hearings" or "important juvenile justice hearings" means the following proceedings in felony criminal cases or cases involving a minor's conduct which would be a felony if committed by an adult:
 - (a) any preliminary hearing to determine probable cause;
 - (b) any court arraignment where practical;
 - (c) any court proceeding involving the disposition of charges against a defendant or minor or the delay of a previously scheduled trial date but not including any unanticipated proceeding to take an admission or a plea of guilty as charged to all charges previously filed or any plea taken at an initial appearance;
 - (d) any court proceeding to determine whether to release a defendant or minor and, if so, under what conditions release may occur, excluding any such release determination made at

HB0509S01 compared with HB0509

an initial appearance;

(e) any criminal or delinquency trial, excluding any actions at the trial that a court might take in camera, in chambers, or at a sidebar conference;

(f) any court proceeding to determine the disposition of a minor or sentence, fine, or restitution of a defendant or to modify any disposition of a minor or sentence, fine, or restitution of a defendant; ~~and~~

~~(g) a hearing regarding any criminal protective order described in Title 78B, Chapter 7, Part 8, Criminal Protective Orders; and~~

~~[(g)] (h) any public hearing concerning whether to grant a defendant or minor parole or other form of discretionary release from confinement~~ ~~{f}. {f}. and~~

~~— (h) a hearing regarding any criminal protective order described in Title 78B, Chapter 7, Part 8, Criminal Protective Orders.~~

(6) "Reliable information" means information worthy of confidence, including any information whose use at sentencing is permitted by the United States Constitution.

(7) "Representative of a victim" means a person who is designated by the victim or designated by the court and who represents the victim in the best interests of the victim.

(8) "Respect" means treating the crime victim with regard and value.

(9) (a) "Victim of a crime" means any natural person against whom the charged crime or conduct is alleged to have been perpetrated or attempted by the defendant or minor personally or as a party to the offense or conduct or, in the discretion of the court, against whom a related crime or act is alleged to have been perpetrated or attempted, unless the natural person is the accused or appears to be accountable or otherwise criminally responsible for or criminally involved in the crime or conduct or a crime or act arising from the same conduct, criminal episode, or plan as the crime is defined under the laws of this state.

(b) For purposes of the right to be present, "victim of a crime" does not mean any person who is in custody as a pretrial detainee, as a prisoner following conviction for an offense, or as a juvenile who has committed an act that would be an offense if committed by an adult, or who is in custody for mental or psychological treatment.

(c) For purposes of the right to be present and heard at a public hearing as provided in Subsection 77-38-2(5)(g) and the right to notice as provided in Subsection 77-38-3(7)(a), "victim of a crime" includes any victim originally named in the allegation of criminal conduct

HB0509S01 compared with HB0509

who is not a victim of the offense to which the defendant entered a negotiated plea of guilty.

Section 2. Section 77-38-3 is amended to read:

77-38-3. Notification to victims -- Initial notice, election to receive subsequent notices -- Form of notice -- Protected victim information -- Pretrial criminal no contact order.

(1) Within seven days after the day on which felony criminal charges are filed against a defendant, the prosecuting agency shall provide an initial notice to reasonably identifiable and locatable victims of the crime contained in the charges, except as otherwise provided in this chapter.

(2) The initial notice to the victim of a crime shall provide information about electing to receive notice of subsequent important criminal justice hearings listed in Subsections 77-38-2(5)(a) through ~~[(f)]~~ [(g)] and rights under this chapter.

(3) The prosecuting agency shall provide notice to a victim of a crime:

(a) for the important criminal justice hearings, provided in Subsections 77-38-2(5)(a) through ~~[(f)]~~ [(g)], which the victim has requested; and

(b) for a restitution request to be submitted in accordance with Section 77-38b-202.

(4) (a) The responsible prosecuting agency may provide initial and subsequent notices in any reasonable manner, including telephonically, electronically, orally, or by means of a letter or form prepared for this purpose.

(b) In the event of an unforeseen important criminal justice hearing, ~~[(listed)]~~ [(described)] in Subsections 77-38-2(5)(a) through ~~[(f)]~~ [(g)] for which a victim has requested notice, a good faith attempt to contact the victim by telephone shall be considered sufficient notice, provided that the prosecuting agency subsequently notifies the victim of the result of the proceeding.

(5) (a) The court shall take reasonable measures to ensure that its scheduling practices for the proceedings provided in Subsections 77-38-2(5)(a) through ~~[(f)]~~ [(g)] permit an opportunity for victims of crimes to be notified.

(b) The court shall consider whether any notification system that the court might use to provide notice of judicial proceedings to defendants could be used to provide notice of judicial proceedings to victims of crimes.

(6) A defendant or, if it is the moving party, the Division of Adult Probation and Parole, shall give notice to the responsible prosecuting agency of any motion for modification

HB0509S01 compared with HB0509

of any determination made at any of the important criminal justice hearings provided in Subsections 77-38-2(5)(a) through ~~[(f)]~~ (g) in advance of any requested court hearing or action so that the prosecuting agency may comply with the prosecuting agency's notification obligation.

(7) (a) Notice to a victim of a crime shall be provided by the Board of Pardons and Parole for the important criminal justice hearing under Subsection ~~[77-38-2(5)(g)]~~ 77-38-2(5)(h).

(b) The board may provide notice in any reasonable manner, including telephonically, electronically, orally, or by means of a letter or form prepared for this purpose.

(8) Prosecuting agencies and the Board of Pardons and Parole are required to give notice to a victim of a crime for the proceedings provided in Subsections 77-38-2(5)(a) through ~~[(f)]~~ (g) only where the victim has responded to the initial notice, requested notice of subsequent proceedings, and provided a current address and telephone number if applicable.

(9) To facilitate the payment of restitution and the notice of hearings regarding restitution, a victim who seeks restitution and notice of restitution hearings shall provide the court with the victim's current address and telephone number.

(10) (a) Law enforcement and criminal justice agencies shall refer any requests for notice or information about crime victim rights from victims to the responsible prosecuting agency.

(b) In a case in which the Board of Pardons and Parole is involved, the responsible prosecuting agency shall forward any request for notice the prosecuting agency has received from a victim to the Board of Pardons and Parole.

(11) In all cases where the number of victims exceeds 10, the responsible prosecuting agency may send any notices required under this chapter in the prosecuting agency's discretion to a representative sample of the victims.

(12) (a) A victim's address, telephone number, and victim impact statement maintained by a peace officer, prosecuting agency, Youth Parole Authority, Division of Juvenile Justice Services, Department of Corrections, Utah State Courts, and Board of Pardons and Parole, for purposes of providing notice under this section, are classified as protected under Subsection 63G-2-305(10).

(b) The victim's address, telephone number, and victim impact statement is available

HB0509S01 compared with HB0509

only to the following persons or entities in the performance of their duties:

- (i) a law enforcement agency, including the prosecuting agency;
- (ii) a victims' right committee as provided in Section 77-37-5;
- (iii) a governmentally sponsored victim or witness program;
- (iv) the Department of Corrections;
- (v) the Utah Office for Victims of Crime;
- (vi) the Commission on Criminal and Juvenile Justice;
- (vii) the Utah State Courts; and
- (viii) the Board of Pardons and Parole.

(13) The notice provisions as provided in this section do not apply to misdemeanors as provided in Section 77-38-5 and to important juvenile justice hearings as provided in Section 77-38-2.

(14) (a) When a defendant is charged with a felony crime under Sections 76-5-301 through 76-5-310.1 regarding kidnapping, human trafficking, and human smuggling; Sections 76-5-401 through 76-5-413.2 regarding sexual offenses; or Section 76-10-1306 regarding aggravated exploitation of prostitution, the court may, during any court hearing where the defendant is present, issue a pretrial criminal no contact order:

(i) prohibiting the defendant from harassing, telephoning, contacting, or otherwise communicating with the victim directly or through a third party;

(ii) ordering the defendant to stay away from the residence, school, place of employment of the victim, and the premises of any of these, or any specified place frequented by the victim or any designated family member of the victim directly or through a third party; and

(iii) ordering any other relief that the court considers necessary to protect and provide for the safety of the victim and any designated family or household member of the victim.

(b) Violation of a pretrial criminal no contact order issued pursuant to this section is a third degree felony.

(c) (i) The court shall provide to the victim a certified copy of any pretrial criminal no contact order that has been issued if the victim can be located with reasonable effort.

(ii) The court shall also transmit the pretrial criminal no contact order to the statewide domestic violence network in accordance with Section 78B-7-113.

HB0509S01 compared with HB0509

(15) (a) When a case involving a victim may resolve before trial with a plea deal, the prosecutor shall notify the victim of that possibility as soon as practicable.

(b) Upon the request of a victim described in Subsection (15)(a), the prosecutor shall explain the available details of an anticipated plea deal.

Section 3. Section 77-38-4 is amended to read:

77-38-4. Right to be present, to be heard, and to file an amicus brief on appeal -- Control of disruptive acts or irrelevant statements -- Statements from persons in custody.

(1) The victim of a crime, the representative of the victim, or both shall have the right:

(a) to be present at the important criminal or juvenile justice hearings provided in Subsection 77-38-2(5);

(b) to be heard at the important criminal or juvenile justice hearings provided in Subsections 77-38-2(5)(b), (c), (d), (f), ~~and (g)~~, (g), and (h);

(c) to submit a written statement in any action on appeal related to that crime; and

(d) upon request to the judge hearing the matter, to be present and heard at the initial appearance of the person suspected of committing the conduct or criminal offense against the victim on issues relating to whether to release a defendant or minor and, if so, under what conditions release may occur.

(2) This chapter shall not confer any right to the victim of a crime to be heard:

(a) at any criminal trial, including the sentencing phase of a capital trial under Section 76-3-207 or at any preliminary hearing, unless called as a witness; and

(b) at any delinquency trial or at any preliminary hearing in a minor's case, unless called as a witness.

(3) The right of a victim or representative of a victim to be present at trial is subject to Rule 615 of the Utah Rules of Evidence.

(4) Nothing in this chapter shall deprive the court of the right to prevent or punish disruptive conduct nor give the victim of a crime the right to engage in disruptive conduct.

(5) The court shall have the right to limit any victim's statement to matters that are relevant to the proceeding.

(6) In all cases where the number of victims exceeds five, the court may limit the in-court oral statements it receives from victims in its discretion to a few representative statements.

HB0509S01 compared with HB0509

(7) Except as otherwise provided in this section, a victim's right to be heard may be exercised at the victim's discretion in any appropriate fashion, including an oral, written, audiotaped, or videotaped statement or direct or indirect information that has been provided to be included in any presentence report.

(8) If the victim of a crime is a person who is in custody as a pretrial detainee, as a prisoner following conviction for an offense, or as a juvenile who has committed an act that would be an offense if committed by an adult, or who is in custody for mental or psychological treatment, the right to be heard under this chapter shall be exercised by submitting a written statement to the court.

(9) The court may exclude any oral statement from a victim on the grounds of the victim's incompetency as provided in Rule 601(a) of Utah Rules of Evidence.

(10) Except in juvenile court cases, the Constitution may not be construed as limiting the existing rights of the prosecution to introduce evidence in support of a capital sentence.

Section ~~2~~4. Section **78B-7-804** is amended to read:

78B-7-804. Sentencing and continuous protective orders for a domestic violence offense -- Modification -- Expiration.

(1) Before a perpetrator who has been convicted of or adjudicated for a domestic violence offense may be placed on probation, the court shall consider the safety and protection of the victim and any member of the victim's family or household.

(2) The court may condition probation or a plea in abeyance on the perpetrator's compliance with a sentencing protective order that includes:

(a) an order enjoining the perpetrator from threatening to commit or committing acts of domestic violence against the victim or other family or household member;

(b) an order prohibiting the perpetrator from harassing, telephoning, contacting, or otherwise communicating with the victim, directly or indirectly;

(c) an order requiring the perpetrator to stay away from the victim's residence, school, place of employment, and the premises of any of these, or a specified place frequented regularly by the victim or any designated family or household member;

(d) an order prohibiting the perpetrator from purchasing, using, or possessing a firearm or other specified weapon;

(e) an order directing the perpetrator to surrender any weapons the perpetrator owns or

HB0509S01 compared with HB0509

possesses; and

(f) an order imposing any other condition necessary to protect the victim and any other designated family or household member or to rehabilitate the perpetrator.

(3) (a) Because of the serious, unique, and highly traumatic nature of domestic violence crimes, the high recidivism rate of violent offenders, and the demonstrated increased risk of continued acts of violence subsequent to the release of a perpetrator who is convicted of or adjudicated for domestic violence, it is the finding of the Legislature that domestic violence crimes warrant the issuance of continuous protective orders under this Subsection (3) because of the need to provide ongoing protection for the victim and to be consistent with the purposes of protecting victims' rights under Title 77, Chapter 37, Victims' Rights, and Title 77, Chapter 38, Rights of Crime Victims Act, and Article I, Section 28 of the Utah Constitution.

(b) Except as provided in Subsection (6), if a perpetrator is convicted of a domestic violence offense resulting in a sentence of imprisonment, including jail, that is to be served after conviction, the court shall issue a continuous protective order at the time of the conviction or sentencing limiting the contact between the perpetrator and the victim unless the court determines by clear and convincing evidence that the victim does not have a reasonable fear of future harm or abuse.

(c) (i) The court shall notify the perpetrator ~~and the victim~~ of the right to request a hearing.

(ii) A victim has a right to request a hearing.

~~[(ii)]~~ (iii) If the perpetrator or the victim requests a hearing under this Subsection (3)(c), the court shall ~~+~~

~~— (A) provide notice to each party; and~~

~~— (B) }~~ hold the hearing at the time determined by the court.

~~(iii)~~ iv The continuous protective order shall be in effect while the hearing is being scheduled and while the hearing is pending.

(d) A continuous protective order is permanent in accordance with this Subsection (3) and may include:

(i) an order enjoining the perpetrator from threatening to commit or committing acts of domestic violence against the victim or other family or household member;

(ii) an order prohibiting the perpetrator from harassing, telephoning, contacting, or

HB0509S01 compared with HB0509

otherwise communicating with the victim, directly or indirectly;

(iii) an order prohibiting the perpetrator from going to the victim's residence, school, place of employment, and the premises of any of these, or a specified place frequented regularly by the victim or any designated family or other household member;

(iv) an order directing the perpetrator to pay restitution to the victim as may apply, and shall be enforced in accordance with Title 77, Chapter 38b, Crime Victims Restitution Act; and

(v) any other order the court considers necessary to fully protect the victim and members of the victim's family or other household member.

(4) A continuous protective order may be modified or dismissed only if the court determines by clear and convincing evidence that all requirements of Subsection (3) have been met and the victim does not have a reasonable fear of future harm or abuse.

(5) Except as provided in Subsection (6), in addition to the process of issuing a continuous protective order described in Subsection (3), a district court may issue a continuous protective order at any time if the victim files a petition with the court, and after notice and hearing the court finds that a continuous protective order is necessary to protect the victim.

(6) (a) Unless the juvenile court transfers jurisdiction of the offense to the district court under Section 80-6-504, a continuous protective order may not be issued under this section against a perpetrator who is a minor.

(b) Unless the court sets an earlier date for expiration, a sentencing protective order issued under this section against a perpetrator who is a minor expires on the earlier of:

(i) the day on which the juvenile court terminates jurisdiction; or

(ii) in accordance with Section 80-6-807, the day on which the Division of Juvenile Justice Services discharges the perpetrator.